

CANADA

PROVINCE OF NOVA SCOTIA

IN THE MATTER OF THE  
*FATALITY INVESTIGATIONS ACT*  
S.N.S. 2001, c. 31

**THE DESMOND FATALITY INQUIRY**

---

**TRANSCRIPT**

---

**HEARD BEFORE:** The Honourable Judge Warren K. Zimmer

**PLACE HEARD:** Port Hawkesbury, Nova Scotia

**DATE HEARD:** March 3, 2021

**COUNSEL:** Allen Murray, QC, Inquiry Counsel  
Shane Russell, Esq., Inquiry Counsel  
  
Lori Ward and Melissa Grant,  
Counsel for Attorney General of Canada

Glenn R. Anderson, QC, and Catherine Lunn  
Counsel for Attorney General of Nova Scotia

Thomas M. Macdonald, Esq., and  
Thomas Morehouse, Esq.  
Counsel for Richard Borden, Thelma Borden and  
Sheldon Borden  
Joint Counsel for Aaliyah Desmond

Tara Miller, QC,  
Counsel for Estate of Brenda Desmond  
(Chantel Desmond, Personal Representative)  
Joint Counsel for Aaliyah Desmond

Adam Rodgers, Esq.  
Counsel for Estate of Lionel Desmond  
(Cassandra Desmond, Personal Representative)

Roderick (Rory) Rogers, QC, Karen Bennett-Clayton  
and Daniel MacKenzie,  
Counsel for Nova Scotia Health Authority

Amy MacGregor  
Counsel for Dr. Faisal Rahman and Dr. Ian Slayter

INDEX

<u>March 3, 2021</u>	<u>Page</u>
<u>DR. ISABELLE GAGNON</u>	
Direct Examination by Mr. Russell .....	6
Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller .....	191
Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers .....	219
Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant .....	244
Examination by the Court .....	259

EXHIBIT LIST

<u>Exhibit</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Page</u>
P-000253	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. Isabelle Gagnon	7

1 March 3, 2021

2 COURT OPENED (09:32 HRS.)

3

4 THE COURT: Thank you. Good morning.

5 COUNSEL: Good morning, Your Honour.

6 THE COURT: Good morning, Dr. Gagnon.

7 DR. GAGNON: Good morning, Your Honour.

8 THE COURT: Perhaps we could swear Dr. Gagnon before we  
9 begin then, please.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 **DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, sworn, testified:**

2

3 **THE COURT:** Thank you, Dr. Gagnon, we appreciate you  
4 giving us your time for the day.

5 In the normal course of events we start at 9:30, we'll  
6 continue partway through the morning and it depends on the  
7 circumstances we take a short break sometime around 11:15 or  
8 maybe 11:30, and we break at 12:30 our time, be 11:30 your time  
9 I guess, for an hour for lunch and then we're back and try to  
10 have an afternoon break as well.

11 If you have difficulty hearing us or if you have difficulty  
12 with the video in any way just let us know, we have some limited  
13 ability to make some adjustments. And short of that, I think  
14 Mr. Russell may lead off the questions for you. Thank you.

15

16 **DIRECT EXAMINATION**

17

18 **MR. RUSSELL:** Good morning, Dr. Gagnon.

19 **A.** Good morning, Mr. Russell.

20 **Q.** Hello again. So I guess if at any point I break up or  
21 you can't hear me, just sort of let us know and we'll take a  
22 break and ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    I will.

2           **Q.**    ... make some re-adjustments. I guess we'll start.

3    Could you state your full name for the Court?

4           **A.**    Marie Louise Isabelle Gagnon.

5           **Q.**    And my understanding is you're a clinical  
6    psychologist?

7           **A.**    That's right.

8    **EXHIBIT P-000253 - CURRICULUM VITAE OF DR. ISABELLE GAGNON**

9           **Q.**    So we'll start by reviewing your qualifications, it's  
10   Exhibit 253. It'll just take a minute to come up. Could you  
11   see that on the screen or ...

12          **A.**    I can but a little bit bigger would be appreciated.  
13   Perfect.

14          **Q.**    So, Doctor, I guess I'll start very briefly. It's not  
15   my intention to review everything in this document. We'll start  
16   with your education. So when did you receive your Doctorate of  
17   Psychology and from where?

18          **A.**    In 2016, from the Universite du Quebec en Outaouais.

19          **Q.**    And my understanding is ... what was your thesis?

20          **A.**    So my thesis was assessing treatment for PTSD with  
21   comorbid substance use in a psychiatric setting. I was working  
22   with a supervisor in a multicultural trauma clinic.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    Could you tell us generally what that involved, PTSD  
2 and comorbid substance use disorder?

3           **A.**    Sure.  So the clients that we treated had a diagnosis  
4 both of PTSD and either one substance or multiple substances,  
5 such as alcohol, heroin, marijuana, any of those things.  And so  
6 we used an approach that worked to treat both of these  
7 difficulties at the same time which is often considered a good  
8 practice to use.

9           **Q.**    Okay.  So from graduation, if we turn to page 2, it  
10 looks to be in April 2016, so as soon as you graduated ...

11          **A.**    Yeah.

12          **Q.**    ... to December 2016, where did you work?

13          **A.**    So often for a Doctorate in Psychology, there's some  
14 delay from when you're done your schooling and paperwork comes  
15 in, so initially you can work as a doctoral candidate.  So,  
16 initially I worked at the Centre de Therapie pour Couples and  
17 Familles, where I had both couples and individual clients, and  
18 then after that I went to Ste. Anne's.

19          **Q.**    And approximately when did you go to Ste. Anne's?

20          **A.**    I started ... there was somebody in my position  
21 beforehand that I started going to see I think at first it was  
22 once a week, just to have that turnover of information.  I think



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 I started going ... I'd have to look at my documents, I think it  
2 was in February or March ...

3 Q. Of ...

4 A. ... to receive that information.

5 Q. Of 2016?

6 A. Of 2016, that's right.

7 Q. Okay. So what was your role when you were at Ste.  
8 Anne's in February or so of 2016 and what were some of your, I  
9 guess, duties as a clinical psychologist?

10 A. So at that point, having not received my doctorate  
11 yet, I was a doctoral candidate, just to be clear, so I was  
12 receiving a lot of information. I'd have again to review  
13 exactly when things shifted but I was receiving a lot of  
14 information from my predecessor, learning all the material for  
15 the different treatments that were offered, learning how the  
16 clinic worked, meeting all my colleagues and then, you know,  
17 starting to offer treatments at Ste. Anne's.

18 Q. So what sort of treatments did you ... I guess, at  
19 Ste. Anne's, what type of patients did you encounter and treat  
20 and diagnose?

21 A. Well, it is a clinic that's specifically mandated to  
22 offer treatment for operational stress injuries, so diagnosis-

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 wise a lot of post-traumatic stress disorder, some mood  
2 disorders, some anxiety disorders.

3 So there was an admissions committee that would look over  
4 files that were sent us to see if it was a good fit between  
5 people being referred to us and then the services we could  
6 offer. There are clinics in Canada that do residential  
7 treatment for substance use and PTSD, we did not. So the  
8 requirement was that somebody wasn't actively having a lot of  
9 difficulties with substance use while they were there. So that  
10 was one of the limits.

11 **Q.** Are you able to comment on what your caseload was like  
12 while you at Ste. Anne's in 2016?

13 **A.** It would depend on the clients that were coming in.  
14 We did a mix of individual therapy and group therapy, so I would  
15 typically ... and then some of my duties were also, for  
16 instance, to sit on the admissions committee, so I had both;  
17 kind of more administrative duties and clinical duties.

18 So I would usually have, again, if memory serves, something  
19 like three to four individual clients that I would follow in  
20 individual sessions, and then I believe I offered two different  
21 group therapies.

22 **Q.** And so you stayed at Ste. Anne's until December of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 2016?

2 **A.** That's right.

3 **Q.** If we look to page 1 it says January 17th to present  
4 ... January 2017 to present. So where are ...

5 **A.** Mm-hmm.

6 **Q.** ... you currently employed?

7 **A.** I'm currently working at the National Defence OSI  
8 clinic for active military members at Montfort.

9 **Q.** So that is, you indicated, with active military  
10 members?

11 **A.** That's right.

12 **Q.** And are your duties very similar to what they were at  
13 Ste. Anne's?

14 **A.** Somewhat similar. Obviously in the current context  
15 I'm not offering group therapy anymore, but we did put in place  
16 group therapy which I did offer. I think I do a lot more  
17 regular assessments and I have a bigger caseload of individual  
18 clients, but fairly similar.

19 **(09:40)**

20 **Q.** And, again, it's treating members of the military with  
21 operational stress injuries, is that fair to say?

22 **A.** That's right. At the clinic there's different

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 sections and I am in the section that does deal specifically  
2 with operational stress injuries.

3 **Q.** And in your time between Ste. Anne's, starting in  
4 2016, and your current employment, what sort of psychological  
5 disorders or symptoms did you diagnose and treat as a general  
6 rule?

7 **A.** A wide range. I can get into detail if you'd like,  
8 but, I mean, I think the expectation for clinical psychologists  
9 unless you're very narrowly into a field is to be able to treat  
10 most mood disorders, most anxiety disorders. In my case, with  
11 some of the training that I've had, post-traumatic stress  
12 disorder. Some individual had again, comorbid difficulties with  
13 personality disorders. In my time at my current work, people  
14 who have substance use disorder as well, so quite a wide  
15 variety.

16 **Q.** I see on your CV you have a number of specialized  
17 training in certain treatments and one is cognitive behavioural  
18 therapy.

19 **A.** Sure. So I'm a little picky when it comes to terms.  
20 I'm really careful when I use terms like "specialized". That  
21 would imply that I have somehow superior skill to anybody else  
22 that's trained to treat PTSD and I don't want to imply that.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           CBT is a very well-respected, well documented, you know,  
2 truth be validated approach, which I am trained in. And then if  
3 you look at the training ... this is a summary, I'll be happy to  
4 provide ... this is the bare bones of the training that is  
5 expected of psychologists, that's a mandated continued education  
6 that we have as psychologists, but a prolonged exposure, for  
7 instance, the subset of cognitive behavioural therapy for PTSD.

8           **Q.** So you have experience in training in cognitive  
9 behavioural therapy, prolonged exposure therapy as examples?

10          **A.** Yeah, as examples. Yes.

11          **Q.** I guess, Doctor, we could spend more time on your CV  
12 but I'm going to move ahead to questions in general.

13          **A.** Sure.

14          **Q.** So given your professional experience since 2016  
15 graduating, I just want you to maybe turn your mind to sort of  
16 any ... could you identify any barriers, challenges that come to  
17 mind when you're treating either active military members or  
18 military veterans as it relates to building a therapeutic  
19 alliance?

20          **A.** I have evolved most of my life in a military setting.  
21 My father was military. I have experience in the Reserves. My  
22 spouse has been deployed several times. So that hasn't been so

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 much a barrier for me but I know that one barrier that's been  
2 reported to me is when people struggle with lingo.

3 You know, if you are confiding in somebody in the things  
4 that have been very difficult during your career, that you've  
5 had very difficult experiences, but then you have to stop and  
6 break off and explain acronyms or kind of military terms, that  
7 can be a little bit off-putting. So that's something that I've  
8 heard from people that can be a little difficult.

9 Certainly I think I'm hearing from my active members right  
10 now that stigma I think is being gradually broken down, which  
11 I'm very happy to hear, but I think that especially probably in  
12 older members, this was something that was very difficult for  
13 them to overcome to access treatment. This perception that  
14 there was a negative connotation to having some mental health  
15 difficulties.

16 **Q.** Is there anything sort of unique or again, a barrier  
17 or a challenge, to trying to structure treatment goals as it  
18 applies to an active member of the military or a veteran?

19 **A.** I mean, radically different from a civilian  
20 population, I hesitate to say that. One thing I might mention  
21 is - again, this is not every military member - but often, you  
22 know, a military career for some people is seen almost as a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 calling as opposed to just a job and so I think that it can be a  
2 little scary to leave the CAF and to think, Okay, well I kind of  
3 have to find some new values, some new ways of being, some new  
4 employment and really I think there's a sense of loss here, so  
5 that can be a little destabilizing I think, but I think anybody  
6 feels those type of things in major life transitions.

7 **Q.** And again in a military client-based context, are  
8 there any sort of unique barriers or challenges when it comes to  
9 sort of the implementation of treatment? Just in general terms  
10 again but ...

11 **A.** You know when it comes to ... and perhaps this is  
12 something that we'll get into, but OSI is a very kind of  
13 umbrella term that does encompass a number of diagnoses. But if  
14 we are talking specifically, for instance, of PTSD there are  
15 some kind of gold standard treatments that are recommended,  
16 whether it's a civilian or a military population so there  
17 wouldn't be any major changes there.

18 Maybe the only thing I would note is, you know, if people  
19 have been in operational settings, they're offered training to  
20 be excessively alert and prudent and vigilant about their  
21 surroundings, to scan for signs of danger and to monitor what's  
22 going on around them.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           So I think maybe there's often that extra level of caution  
2 that needs to be broken down because it was very functional  
3 training that they received at the time, it's just not useful  
4 for them once they're back in a safer environment. So that  
5 could be a nuance that I would identify.

6           **Q.** You had referred to certain treatments as "gold  
7 standard treatments".

8           **A.** Mm-hmm.

9           **Q.** What are some examples of what you consider and have  
10 heard of as being gold standard treatments?

11          **A.** So they're often the treatments that are the most well  
12 studied and have good outcomes so I don't want to disparage any  
13 other treatments that are currently being studied and may, of  
14 course, reach those standards. But usually the standards that  
15 are that the treatments are considered when you're doing active  
16 trauma treatments and maybe I'll distinguish that one later, so  
17 EMDR, prolonged exposure, and then cognitive processing therapy  
18 are usually kind of considered those gold standards.

19          **Q.** Okay. And again in the context of military-based  
20 clients, barriers or challenges to the follow-up and sort of  
21 continuity of care, this sort of transition of hand-off from  
22 different groups of professionals, different clinics, this



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 ongoing treatment.

2       **A.** I think the challenges at Ste. Anne's were maybe a  
3 little bit more unique because we would get referrals from all  
4 over the country and so we talked to, you know, a really wide  
5 variety of treatment teams that were referring these members to  
6 us. So there were a lot of kind of developing new relationships  
7 for that back and forth of information.

8       Maybe I can just speak to where I'm working now, but in  
9 general I've had very little issues with that transition. You  
10 know, if I am treating a serving member who is in the process of  
11 releasing, you know, we get that date in advance, we'll set up  
12 care kind of on the other side. I'll do the transition of this  
13 member to somebody that is covered by VAC ahead of time, do kind  
14 of a little bit of parallel care and then when they transition  
15 it's not too much of an issue.

16       I think some of the issues come in when there's different  
17 locations, when people have like one last posting. Yeah, some  
18 of those things. I think that the challenges are a bit more  
19 kind of geographic maybe as opposed to ... Again, I can speak to  
20 where I am right now, I haven't had any major kind of  
21 challenges.

22       **Q.** Okay. And I know you're reluctant to say a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 psychologist that primarily operates in a military context is  
2 sort of a sub-specialist in psychology, but would you say that  
3 there are some advantages, I guess, to a clinical psychologist  
4 ... When a clinical psychologist treats a member of the military  
5 or former member of the military, is there an advantage to  
6 having the experience dealing with those based clients as  
7 opposed to not ever having experience treating clients with a  
8 military background?

9       **A.** Sure. I think that when you're treating any kind of  
10 ... I think I would look at this almost as a cultural knowledge.  
11 You know, if I'm treating ... if I start treating police  
12 officers at some point, I'm going to want to know, you know,  
13 lingo. I'm going to want to know, you know, what their specific  
14 issues are.

15 **(09:50)**

16       And so when I register with my College, I have to identify  
17 what my areas of competencies are, right, and I think that's a  
18 little bit what you're alluding to. So I'll say I'm working  
19 with adults or children. And I can't suddenly one day decide  
20 I'm going to start working with kids, that's a vastly different  
21 field. Not so, necessarily, with working with ... If I have  
22 competence in PTSD, it wouldn't be a radical shift then to treat

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 somebody that has PTSD that's in the military.

2 I think it would be my job as a psychologist to inform  
3 myself, do some reading about, you know, particular issues, and  
4 then perhaps even be kind of transparent with my client and say,  
5 Listen, I have the competences to treat, you know, what you're  
6 suffering as a disorder, but you're going to have to work with  
7 me and be a little bit patient while I learn the lingo.

8 I don't think that psychologists or social workers or  
9 anybody can be expected to know everything, and I think that  
10 any, you know, therapeutic relationship is based on this kind of  
11 give and take of tell me what's going on for you and I'll try to  
12 understand, so ...

13 Q. So I guess this sort of concept of ... what we  
14 understand is that it takes time and it can vary to build a  
15 therapeutic alliance and the importance of that.

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. Would it be easier for a clinical psychologist to  
18 build that rapport with a patient if they have some sort of  
19 understanding at the outset of the military culture where the  
20 client is coming from?

21 A. I would expect that to be part of the process. If you  
22 do not, I would expect the person treating this person to be

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 sensitive to those kind of concerns and to learn. Everybody has  
2 got to learn at some point. And I would say even if you have  
3 competences within kind of military there are different trades  
4 in the military, you know, different deployments and different  
5 challenges. And I'm ... every time I have somebody that's in a  
6 new trade or has had a different deployment I learn new things.  
7 So it's a never-ending kind of road to make sure that you have  
8 the required information. So I don't think it's a black or  
9 white issue.

10 Q. Okay. I'm going to turn to the structure of Ste.  
11 Anne's. We heard a bit ...

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. ... from Dr. Ouellette, quite a bit from Dr. Ouellette  
14 yesterday especially as it relates to the stabilization program  
15 and how clients move from stabilization to the residential phase  
16 of the program.

17 I'd like to start, I guess, by asking: You were the  
18 clinical coordinator for Lionel Desmond while he was at the  
19 residential phase of Ste. Anne's, correct?

20 A. Mm-hmm. I was the clinical coordinator for the clinic.

21 Q. For the clinic. Could you tell us what your role was  
22 as the clinical coordinator for the residential phase of the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 clinic?

2       **A.** So I was the clinical coordinator for just the clinic  
3 in general, both ...

4       **Q.** Okay, sorry.

5       **A.** ... stabilization and residential, there's no ... it's  
6 okay. So there's ... just there's no distinction. So it's a  
7 little bit of those extra administrative duties that I had  
8 mentioned: sitting on the ... well, I guess it's not totally  
9 administrative ... administrative and clinical duties. Like  
10 sitting on the admissions committee and giving my opinion about  
11 some challenges, some extra information that we would need.  
12 Reviewing some of the treatments that we were offering, so  
13 sitting on our kind of interdisciplinary meetings and trying to  
14 kind of manage those. Some of the notes that you've seen in Mr.  
15 Desmond's file with regards to if there were conflicts or  
16 specific challenges. Sometimes we would meet individual  
17 residents and then I would usually be on those meetings, so some  
18 of those types of duties.

19       **Q.** So is it fair to say, say in Lionel Desmond's case,  
20 you're a clinical coordinator, was part of your role to pull in  
21 social work, pull in occupational therapist, pull in psychiatry,  
22 structure those meetings and have sort of a collaborative care

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 model?

2       **A.** Yeah, that was a matter of course for every client,  
3 yes.

4       **Q.** Okay. And that's one of the roles, I guess, as a  
5 clinical coordinator is to sort of to steer a collaborative care  
6 model within that Ste. Anne's structure?

7       **A.** Certainly to facilitate it. It's definitely not an  
8 authoritative or power structure, but definitely to try to  
9 facilitate those things.

10       **Q.** All right. And so as a rule, how long is the ... I  
11 can appreciate it can probably vary, but how long is a  
12 residential phase when a client is at the Ste. Anne's program on  
13 the long end of things and on the short of things?

14       **A.** So - and I apologize in advance, it is four years ago  
15 so some ... I tried to refresh my memory by looking at my notes  
16 but some details will probably be a little vague for me - from  
17 memory, I believe that the residential phase was a little bit  
18 more stable in terms of duration, so it was around eight weeks.

19       **Q.** Okay. And during the residential phase, could you  
20 give us a sense of the client that is there, such as Lionel  
21 Desmond that's being treated for PTSD, major depressant dis- ...  
22 depression, as well as comorbid alcohol use in remission and of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 course mixed personality traits, what sort of resources from  
2 healthcare professionals does he have access to?

3 So what types of healthcare professionals would sort of  
4 operate in that circle of care for someone like Lionel Desmond  
5 while at the residential phase?

6 **A.** So the residential phase is a little bit more focussed  
7 on that, the group aspect. So again if memory serves, you know,  
8 I was offering some group treatment, so a psychologist. Some  
9 social workers were also offering some group treatments again if  
10 I'm not mistaken. I believe they still had access to a physical  
11 trainer. I believe an occupational therapist, a yoga teacher,  
12 nurses to manage kind of how they were doing. Again, if memory  
13 serves, medication taking at that point is autonomous, so the  
14 access to nurses is more to deal with issues. So pretty much  
15 the whole range of professionals.

16 Psychiatrists have usually taken a step back in the  
17 residential phase, but again, from what I remember if there is a  
18 specific need we can always call on them.

19 **Q.** Is there ... that certainly seems to be sort of a  
20 collaborative care being offered. Is that correct?

21 **A.** Yeah, that's right.

22 **Q.** What is the advantage to, say, a veteran at Ste.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Anne's getting that collaborate care model as opposed to, Look,  
2 I have one therapist and I see a psychiatrist every so often.

3       **A.** So there's multiple reasons why somebody's external  
4 treatment team might decide that somebody would benefit from  
5 this type of treatment. Often it is people being in situations  
6 where they become sometimes quite depressed, having trouble  
7 getting out, socializing, engaging in any kind of activity. So  
8 a lot of the focus at Ste. Anne's was on this stabilization  
9 piece to try to get people to build up their skills to go back  
10 into their previous treatment team and receive a little bit more  
11 kind of trauma-focussed care.

12       So I think that the upside of having collaborate care is  
13 when one of us would identify a specific issue, you know,  
14 depression and lack of activity, well then everybody could work  
15 some of those interventions from their aspects, their kind of  
16 professional lens to try to really build up skills and build up  
17 abilities in that specific area.

18       **Q.** Is it fair to say that ... Obviously you know Lionel  
19 Desmond's underlying psychological difficulties and struggles.  
20 Is it fair to say that one professional, say if it would be one  
21 social worker, couldn't really possibly treat everything that  
22 was going on with Lionel Desmond; that he might have needed more



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 than one healthcare professional to sort of interact and help  
2 his complex portrait, I guess?

3 **A.** Well, I mean, certainly if somebody is taking  
4 medication there's going to be ... there's going to need to be a  
5 doctor or a psychiatrist, so that would be something that I  
6 would expect if medication was still involved.

7 But otherwise, I think that it's good for people to have  
8 these temporary times where they have these collaborative care  
9 models and they have an abundance of services, but that's not  
10 something I would recommend long term. You know, it's there to  
11 try to give people resources, to activate them, to show them,  
12 Hey, you know, if you do engage in physical activity, if you do  
13 go to therapy, if you socialize with other people, if you  
14 develop these skills you can feel better and then to go back  
15 into a place where it is one or two providers.

16 **Q.** I guess ...

17 **A.** Certainly if I had ... right now I have clients who  
18 are highly symptomatic, but I would not see an added value in  
19 having five professionals in an outpatient setting dealing with  
20 one person. That person would probably feel very overwhelmed.

21 **(10:00)**

22 **Q.** But in many ways, would it depend on the sort of state

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 or status of the client and what they ...

2       **A.** Oh yeah. In mental health everything is very much,  
3 you know, what are the individual needs and what's possible at  
4 this point, what might be a benefit, so it is really case-by-  
5 case basis.

6       **Q.** What is the ultimate goal, you know, from your  
7 perspective as a past clinical coordinator at Ste. Anne's, what  
8 is the ultimate goal for a client such as Lionel Desmond who  
9 attends the Ste. Anne's program? What is sort of the end goal?  
10 What do you try to achieve?

11       **A.** I think I've actually shifted since I've left. There  
12 were talks while I was there to have a little bit more of that  
13 trauma-focussed intervention. But certainly while I was there I  
14 think the idea was to really try to give people more resources,  
15 more skills, more coping, you know, healthy coping strategies so  
16 that they could return to their care teams and then feel more  
17 equipped to do kind of the trauma-focussed piece.

18       So there would be some kind of trauma processing in the  
19 background, but that wouldn't be the focus of the team. It  
20 really would be to get people to be activated to try to reduce  
21 some of those depressive symptoms. It really would be to teach  
22 people to have a little bit more strategies to deal with

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 difficult emotions; to interact with other people with hopefully  
2 less conflict; to set goals in everyday life and then reap the  
3 benefits from meeting these goals and having that kind of  
4 momentum build in their lives; to discover new interests  
5 potentially and then see the benefits of putting these interests  
6 ... actively engaging in these interests; of socializing; of  
7 having other people's perspectives that have different views.

8       So working on some of those problematic cognitions where  
9 they're perceiving things in a way that might be a little bit  
10 skewed. So I think the benefit, especially of that group  
11 treatment was really to allow people to have peers giving them a  
12 different perspective.

13       **Q.** So from where I stand, that seems like a lot.

14       **A.** As goals?

15       **Q.** Yes.

16       **A.** Well, it depends what kind of difficulties people came  
17 in with, right? But in general it really is to build a little  
18 more strategies to deal with whatever difficulties people are  
19 coming in with.

20       **Q.** So we're going to turn to Lionel Desmond and I think  
21 maybe this is a good context. So in Lionel Desmond's case what  
22 was the goal at Ste. Anne's? What was the end goal? What were

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 you trying to achieve and what was the treatment team? What  
2 were they trying to achieve with Lionel Desmond?

3 **A.** So when external treatment teams send us people they  
4 do identify what they think are goals, very general broad goals,  
5 that they'd like us to look at. In Mr. Desmond's case I believe  
6 that some of those goals are, for instance, medication  
7 readjustments, I believe also some diagnostic clarifications,  
8 and I think it was just generally kind of coping with  
9 situations.

10 In his work with me, I think a little bit more specifically  
11 there were quite a few difficulties identified with ... one of  
12 the big issues was managing emotions in general, so his  
13 reactions when he would have distressing emotions and his  
14 difficulties having healthy strategies to manage these emotions.  
15 So in our work together that was, I would say, you know, a main  
16 focus.

17 **Q.** So I'm going to turn to your ... the frequency of  
18 contact you would have had with Lionel Desmond.

19 Do you recall how often you would have and how frequent you  
20 would have had contact with him, whether on an individual  
21 session or in a group session?

22 **A.** So I believe that in the stabilization phase, I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 usually saw people about on a weekly basis and then I think on  
2 the residential phase it usually decreases a little bit, and  
3 then I'll see people probably every two days, every three days,  
4 something like that.

5 Q. And I understand when Lionel ...

6 A. That was the average.

7 Q. And I understand when Lionel Desmond first entered the  
8 clinic he had a diagnosis already from the OSI clinic in New  
9 Brunswick. Do you recall what the diagnosis was?

10 A. I believe that's right. I don't think I was able to  
11 find it in my notes. I believe the diagnosis was PTSD, but then  
12 again that's from memory. That would have been kind of a  
13 summary sent us by the team.

14 Q. So and I know that Dr. Ouellette formulated his  
15 diagnosis and I understand that you did as well?

16 A. Well, if you read my assessment report, I definitely  
17 put it as a tentative picture of what was going on with him,  
18 because the truth was I felt that there was some information  
19 missing that I wanted to confirm or perhaps rule out in order to  
20 be able to make a little bit more of an informed assessment.

21 Q. And we're going to get into the details of why your  
22 diagnosis ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Sure.

2           **Q.**    ... was tentative, but generally could you tell us  
3 what that extra information was that you felt you needed before  
4 you could give a confident sort of diagnosis at the time?

5           **A.**    So I did think that Mr. Desmond had some difficulties  
6 integrating information, you know, focussing during sessions,  
7 initiating actions and then stopping actions especially when he  
8 was upset about something, kind of repeating the same sentences.  
9 So to me it led to some questions about whether cognitively  
10 there might be some challenges that might be attributable to  
11 PTSD in the sense that one of the diagnostic criteria is  
12 difficulties with concentration. That would be a more intense  
13 expression than usually ... I usually observe in people, that's  
14 a possibility. But I did want to rule out if it was something  
15 as he'd reported brain or head injuries, I did want to rule out  
16 if that might be something that was happening.

17          **Q.**    So moving forward, I sort of would like to start with  
18 the conclusion and then ...

19          **A.**    Sure.

20          **Q.**    ... go into individual sessions afterwards to fine  
21 tune the details. But if we could go to page 301 of Exhibit  
22 254. So between pages 301 to pages 304, there's a report that's

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 called "Psychological Evaluation Report". Do you recognize that  
2 report?

3 **A.** Yes, that's my report.

4 **Q.** And that's a report that you had completed, I  
5 understand, on ... if we look to the last page, page 304, it  
6 looks to be completed on December 27th, 2016?

7 **A.** That's right.

8 **Q.** So that was the completion date of the report?

9 **A.** Yeah, that's when I put my final signature on there on  
10 that date, yeah.

11 **Q.** And so we know Lionel Desmond was discharged from Ste.  
12 Anne's in August of 2016 ...

13 **A.** Mm-hmm.

14 **Q.** Are you able to sort of say why the delay in finishing  
15 the report?

16 **A.** Yeah. It did take me longer than it usually does, I  
17 think because I usually like to have a little bit more of a firm  
18 assessment. So I did spend quite a bit of time reviewing my  
19 notes, reviewing the tests, re-reading my conclusions, and  
20 trying to come up with something that would both be accurate and  
21 that I wasn't extending myself past what I was able to say with  
22 some certainty, but also that would be of some use if somebody

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 used, say, this report ... if that neuropsychological assessment  
2 that I was recommending was conducted that might be of some use  
3 to write the report.

4 So I did want it to be that ideal blend of useful but also  
5 as accurate as humanly possible. So I do remember spending  
6 quite a bit of time mulling over that report and reworking it.

7 Q. So our understanding is that this report was never  
8 forwarded on to Veterans Affairs ...

9 A. Mm-hmm.

10 Q. ... or the OSI clinic in New Brunswick. Is that your  
11 recollection as well?

12 A. I usually was not involved in the piece where  
13 documentation was sent out. I don't think it was a matter of  
14 habit to automatically send it out.

15 Q. So I guess ... so to your knowledge you complete a  
16 report like this and it's post-discharge and it's post ... there  
17 was a conference call where the internal Ste. Anne's team  
18 discusses matters of future treatment with the external  
19 treatment team.

20 A. That's right.

21 Q. So you prepare this report but as a general rule do  
22 you know if it gets sent to anyone or is there anyone at Ste.



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Anne's that was responsible for saying, We have your detailed  
2 report, it's great, we should forward this on to Veterans  
3 Affairs Canada?

4 **(10:10)**

5 **A.** So the usual practice, again from memory, is we would  
6 get a summary and not all the reports from a client's file from  
7 the external team and then we would send a summary out so ...

8 **Q.** Yes. And we do know that the discharge summary report  
9 was prepared and forwarded on in October. But so, typically as  
10 a rule, the detailed psychological report would not get sent to  
11 sort of Veterans Affairs?

12 **A.** I don't believe it was a matter of habit, no. I think  
13 that that would have to be specifically requested or ... So the  
14 expectation would be that we would transmit information that was  
15 key during that call and then in that summary report.

16 **Q.** Okay. So your understanding it's just the summary  
17 report is what gets sent?

18 **A.** That's right. That's my understanding.

19 **Q.** So I'm going to ask you why was it, I guess, from your  
20 perspective important to complete this psychological report as  
21 you did? What was the purpose behind creating such a detailed  
22 report?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    I'm not sure what you mean by that question.

2           **Q.**    I guess you took your time obviously to make sure you  
3 got it right ...

4           **A.**    Yeah.

5           **Q.**    ... and you provided some great detail and we'll go  
6 through it, and it's a detailed psychological report, evaluation  
7 report as it relates to Lionel Desmond. What is the purpose  
8 behind providing such a report as this?

9           **A.**    So, accuracy, that was something that was requested,  
10 right. That we try to clarify what was going on with the  
11 member, and I think that performing this report allowed me to  
12 re-identify those difficulties in terms of emotional regulation  
13 which was communicated to the external team.

14           Had there been the possibility of having a more definite  
15 diagnosis, that would have been, I think, helpful for the  
16 external team. And I think just identifying that there might be  
17 some cognitive difficulties and that should be something that  
18 would be ruled out, that would have been, I think, useful and  
19 clarifying. I think, you know, the more you're able to hone in  
20 on what the difficulties are the more you're able to orient  
21 care. So that would be the purpose.

22           **Q.**    And we do know that as part of the discharge summary

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 report, you had some recommendations and a short summary as part  
2 of that report ...

3 **A.** Yeah.

4 **Q.** ... that gets forwarded on. Could you see some value  
5 in your detailed report to maybe an external team?

6 You know, at some point, I mean, there's this concept of  
7 continuity of care where Lionel Desmond is going to leave Ste.  
8 Anne's and someone is probably going to treat him at some point.  
9 Do you see some value, in being a clinician yourself, in being  
10 able to access this detailed report?

11 **A.** Being able to access it certainly. So if ... you  
12 know, if I'm treating someone and I know there's something and I  
13 don't believe this summary is enough I would probably request  
14 the assessment. So, yeah, that might have been useful.

15 I also like to think that, you know, the extra effort we  
16 put to prepare this summary report was really so that people  
17 could, in a reasonable amount of time, take in that information  
18 and be able to action it.

19 I think that the ... you know, I made a report, the social  
20 worker made a report, the psychiatrist made a report, so it has  
21 been sometimes in my experience that if you bury people in  
22 paperwork that's not necessarily more helpful either. So I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 think that's where the idea of offering the summary is to really  
2 get to the essential. But I like to believe that the reports I  
3 spend a lot of time writing could be useful.

4 For instance, maybe that's something that would have been  
5 requested in the course of a neuropsychological assessment. I  
6 don't think they're essential, but yeah, I think it could have  
7 been useful.

8 **Q.** I guess in terms of on your end of things if, at the  
9 OSI New Brunswick, if the treating psychologist there, Dr.  
10 Murgatroyd, had prepared a psychological evaluation report in as  
11 much as detail as you did, would you have liked to have sort of  
12 looked at that and reviewed it before you approached Lionel  
13 Desmond at Ste. Anne's?

14 **A.** Yes and no. For instance, in my current work when  
15 somebody has had multiple assessments, sometimes I do like to go  
16 in with a fresh view, not coloured by previous assessments  
17 because I feel like that does put preconceptions in place, and  
18 so it might steer me in a direction and have me forego a path of  
19 inquiry that I might naturally go down had I not had that in the  
20 back of my mind.

21 I will, however, usually go back afterwards and read it to  
22 see, Oh, okay, that's something I hadn't observed. So I think

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 there's some value in both. I think having that information is  
2 good but I also think that making sure that you approach things  
3 from a new perspective is good, especially when somebody has had  
4 multiple assessments and there are some confusion or some  
5 deliberation maybe as to what's going on.

6 **Q.** So I guess moving it from the hypothetical, I guess,  
7 to more something concrete, I guess if a report such as this was  
8 prepared ...

9 **A.** Yes.

10 **Q.** ... and it was forwarded on to you, is it fair to say  
11 you would have had a look at it to see what value that it would  
12 have brought you in furthering the treatment of Lionel Desmond?

13 **A.** Yes, if I had documentation in front of me from a  
14 client I do review documentation that I have before treating  
15 people, sure.

16 **Q.** Okay. So if we look at page 301, and we'll go through  
17 it in fairly great detail, what was the purpose of the referral?  
18 I understand there were six sort of major purposes of this  
19 referral. I wonder if you could take us through what they were.

20 **A.** So these different referral reasons, there was a  
21 specific document that was sent out to external teams and they  
22 would basically tick off boxes to what they thought the client

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 might benefit, so these are meant to be very general.

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. So medication readjustment would be more, of course,  
4 the psychiatrist's work where he would review ... they would  
5 review the medication that was in place, assess if there were  
6 any better options, anything that could be taken out or added  
7 in.

8 Symptom stabilization would be to try to identify what  
9 symptoms are bothering the member and try to again provide the  
10 member with strategies to manage, minimize, tolerate some of  
11 these symptoms. And then the psychiatric evaluation would be  
12 again reviewing what might be going on diagnostically.

13 Psychosocial rehabilitation would be to try to have  
14 somebody really develop social skills, capacity for networking,  
15 capacity to manage what might be going on in terms of kind of  
16 psychological difficulties again. Emotional regulation would  
17 be, again, the capacity to regulate, manage, tolerate  
18 distressing emotions. Life skills would be, you know, everyday  
19 skills that we need in life and how to make goals, structure,  
20 plan effectively. And then healthy routine development would  
21 just be kind of self-care, sleep hygiene, having a structured  
22 day, those kind of considerations.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    So all of those six were identified as reasons or  
2 things to explore with treating Lionel Desmond, is that correct?

3           **A.**    That's correct.

4           **Q.**    I just want to review who would be involved in each  
5 one. So you indicated that medication readjustment would be a  
6 psychiatrist?

7           **A.**    And potentially the generalist doctor that would come  
8 in just to see if there were any kind of physical health  
9 concerns, that would be more their territory.

10          **Q.**    Okay. What mental health ...

11          **A.**    Which is ...

12          **Q.**    I'm sorry.

13          **A.**    I will say, however, everything was collaborative care  
14 in the sense that if a client were to report to me that they  
15 were having significant side effects and told me maybe they  
16 felt, I don't know, uncomfortable or shy, embarrassed sharing  
17 those details with Dr. Ouellette for instance, that might be  
18 something I would bring up in our team meeting.

19                So all of these are collaborative in the sense that if we  
20 were not actively working on them we were sensitive to those  
21 concerns.

22          **Q.**    Okay. Moving to the next one, symptom stabilization.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 What healthcare clinicians or professionals would have been  
2 involved in that process?

3 **A.** I would say all the healthcare professionals in a  
4 sense that, you know, any intervention that you have with, say,  
5 even our yoga teacher. Some of our clients found that doing  
6 yoga was extremely helpful for them to try to manage some of  
7 their symptoms. So, you know, was she targeting specifically  
8 symptoms? No. Was she giving them one more opportunity to  
9 discover something that might help them manage symptoms? Yes.

10 **Q.** Anyone else in symptom stabilization? Any other sort  
11 of professional that would help there?

12 **A.** So I think all of them that I have mentioned  
13 previously. So psychiatrist, psychologist, social worker,  
14 occupational therapist, nurses. I think that that's definitely  
15 one of the areas where everybody was pitching in actively.

16 **(10:20)**

17 **Q.** Okay. So in-depth psychiatrist evaluation, who would  
18 have been involved in that? Which mental health professional?

19 **A.** That would have been probably a little more  
20 psychiatrist and psychologist.

21 **Q.** Okay. Psychological rehabilitation, which  
22 professionals would have been ...



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    So for psychosocial rehabilitation that would have  
2    been a piece where the social worker would have been very much  
3    actively involved, as well as myself, occupational therapist  
4    probably as well.

5           **Q.**    Emotional regulation and life skills, who would have  
6    been involved in that?

7           **A.**    I'm tempted to say pretty much all the professionals  
8    in the sense that we're all trying to work to help people manage  
9    their emotions in sessions, right. I mean, by definition in  
10   therapy you don't usually talk about the things that are going  
11   well, so they can be distressing. So I think, you know, in any  
12   session we're actively trying to help people manage and regulate  
13   emotions.

14           Life skills, our occupational therapist was probably a  
15   little bit more hands-on involved in that. One of the groups  
16   was very much targeting setting goals, how to go about reaching  
17   those goals and kind of structuring your activities.

18           **Q.**    And finally, healthy routine development, who would  
19    have been involved in that?

20           **A.**    I think, in general, the program tried to show people  
21    that, you know, in a more structured environment this is how  
22    your day is broken down. Here are some of the benefits that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 you're now experiencing because you have a set hour to wake up  
2 in the morning because, you know, you have physical activity and  
3 social interaction built into your day.

4 So I think the program is structured in a way to try to  
5 help people develop a little bit more of a healthy routine and  
6 that was a point that everybody did highlight when possible.

7 **Q.** So what I take from this is that when Lionel Desmond  
8 attended Ste. Anne's there were six identifiable areas that  
9 required work and intervention. And when I count them up you  
10 indicated a psychiatrist, a general doctor, a yoga teacher, a  
11 psychologist, a social worker, occupational therapist and a  
12 nurse. So at a minimum there appears to be seven different  
13 professionals involved in this circle of care involving Lionel  
14 Desmond, is that right?

15 **A.** Yes, and I think I'm forgetting a few people, like an  
16 art teacher, a physical trainer, an addictions counsellor, yeah.  
17 So quite a few people, yes.

18 **Q.** So we're up to ten and in order to sort of achieve  
19 those goals, do you believe that it was important for those ten  
20 people to be involved?

21 **A.** Well, Ste. Anne's is considered kind of an intensive  
22 program so it ... you know you go there to try to have this, you

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 know, this time where things are very structured, where, you  
2 know, your whole day is devoted to this, so it's time outside of  
3 your normal routine that you go to do these things. So while  
4 you're there in a residential setting you take the opportunity  
5 to pile on these services.

6 So do I think that some of these goals could be reached  
7 with fewer people? I mean, probably, but there wouldn't be that  
8 intensive kind of focus.

9 Q. Okay. And what I want to review very quickly is when  
10 Lionel Desmond is ultimately discharged on August 15th, in your  
11 view did he still need some monitoring and follow-up as it  
12 relates to medication adjustment?

13 A. I really don't feel comfortable speaking to that  
14 because medication is not within my field of competences.

15 Q. What about symptom stabilization?

16 A. Yeah, I think that managing symptoms was still  
17 something that he struggled with and that he probably needed  
18 some support with.

19 Q. In-depth psychiatric evaluation, were there still  
20 areas to explore?

21 A. So I think that we had, you know, pushed forward on  
22 clarifying some things but I think there were still some

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 clarifications to do, yeah.

2 Q. Psychological rehabilitation, were there still aspects  
3 that required work?

4 A. You know, the issue is when people come to Ste. Anne's  
5 often they do find that being in a group setting when they are  
6 with peers is of some benefit to them. Certainly Mr. Desmond  
7 had indicated that this was the case.

8 So that's always hypothetical because we make  
9 recommendations to the client saying, You said that you enjoyed  
10 this, this and this part of the stay, what are you going to do  
11 when you return home to try to have that social support that's  
12 going to, you know, also provide some help with some of the  
13 difficulties psychologically that you're experiencing?

14 So it's hard to tell how people are going to do when they  
15 return back home if they're going to put some of these things in  
16 place. Are they going to make the move to connect with some old  
17 colleagues? Are they going to join a club? Are they going to,  
18 you know, reconnect well with their families?

19 So that's a little bit more of an interrogation mark  
20 because we don't know what actions clients are going to take  
21 when they return in their community to try to make sure that  
22 they engage socially.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    So psychosocial rehabilitation is dependent, but I  
2 guess, is it fair to say with Lionel Desmond it's something that  
3 ought to have been monitored when he leaves?

4           **A.**    Well, "monitored" is maybe a strong word.

5           **Q.**    Yeah, not monitored but ...

6           **A.**    Maybe if he requested support it would have been good  
7 for him to have that.

8           **Q.**    Okay. When he left, did he still require work on  
9 emotional regulation and life skills?

10          **A.**    Absolutely. So that was an area where he struggled a  
11 lot and I think that that was something that he still needed to  
12 work on, yeah.

13          **Q.**    And when he left did he still require some work on  
14 healthy routine development?

15          **A.**    That's a little bit of the same situation as the  
16 psychosocial rehabilitation in the sense that, you know, by  
17 definition we provide a little bit of that routine at Ste.  
18 Anne's and we do encourage people to maintain that routine when  
19 they get home which a lot of people seem to.

20          But, again, we do send people out with recommendations that  
21 they maintain that routine and the question is: Do they maintain  
22 that? Is it difficult? Do they need support in doing that? I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 think my expectation would have been that he probably needed  
2 some supporting maintaining that routine.

3 Q. And I guess consistent with that I'm going to move in  
4 to your observations of Lionel Desmond when it came to his  
5 attitudes maybe towards treatment or how he was able to keep on  
6 top of things. The second paragraph of your report on page 301  
7 under "Observations" you say: "Mr. Desmond fre-" ... as a  
8 summary, you say: "Mr. Desmond frequently arrives late or not  
9 at all to scheduled meetings, requiring professionals to find  
10 him and remind him of these meetings."

11 Was this a recurring theme that you ran into with Lionel  
12 Desmond?

13 A. Mm-hmm. So there were a few instances, yes, of him  
14 being late or absent.

15 Q. What do you think was going on there? What do you  
16 think was accounting for that?

17 A. Hard to say but he did have a strong tendency to  
18 avoid, understandably, you know, difficult materials. I think  
19 that there was probably some hesitation. A lot of these  
20 difficulties were also when he arrived on the unit and, you  
21 know, a lot of clients have reported to us how discombobulating  
22 it is to arrive on the unit with this, you know, whole schedule

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 as opposed to what they've been doing at home.

2 So in the first weeks it's not completely unheard of with  
3 people, for people to be a little confused with the schedule, so  
4 I think it was a mix of difficulties with kind of setting and  
5 respecting times and routine, and probably a healthy dose of  
6 avoidance as well. That's my best guess.

7 Q. And clinically, what is avoidance and why is that sort  
8 of a concern from a psychologist? Why is that a concern?

9 A. Mm-hmm.

10 Q. What is it and what ...

11 A. So as with the case with most of the things that we  
12 discuss in psychology avoidance is on a continuum. I think we  
13 all do a little bit of avoidance. This is why so many people  
14 complete their taxes last minute because we all have a tendency  
15 to try to push back or put back or not do things that cause us  
16 stress, distress, suffering, sadness.

17 And so deliberately or sometimes a little bit less  
18 consciously we will try to, you know, not necessarily go to the  
19 meeting with the psychologist where she's going to ask me  
20 questions about difficult things that happened in my past.  
21 Again, in milder forms in every day life, it doesn't cause that  
22 many difficulties.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           In terms of psychology and perhaps even more in terms of  
2 post-traumatic stress disorder that's problematic because that  
3 is one of the maintenance factors both in post-traumatic stress  
4 disorder and in anxiety, because the only way to reduce distress  
5 associated with certain things is to be exposed to them often on  
6 a repeated basis.

7           **(10:30)**

8           **Q.**    So was avoidance a recurring theme with Lionel Desmond  
9 from sort of the start of his involvement with you and weeks  
10 before or a week before he left the program?

11          **A.**    It was a recurring difficulty that he had, both in  
12 terms of avoiding events or people which would kind of create  
13 that difficulty or even in terms of him experiencing difficult  
14 or distressing emotions. You know, he would do a lot of things  
15 to distract himself to avoid feeling that way.

16          **Q.**    And I guess a lot of times we hear this, past  
17 behaviour is a prediction of future behaviour and I don't  
18 necessarily say I like that term, but with Lionel Desmond, was  
19 there some real sort of suggestion that if he's exhibiting  
20 avoidance of meeting with clinicians weeks before he leaves Ste.  
21 Anne's, is that a distinct possibility that when he gets back in  
22 his home community it may be much the same?



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Yeah, potentially. That's conjecture for my part, but  
2 I definitely would say it's not ... you know, it wouldn't be  
3 unlikely.

4           **Q.**    You wouldn't be surprised if that was the case when he  
5 left?

6           **A.**    No. No, I wouldn't be surprised that anybody with  
7 mental health difficulties would use avoidance as a strategy.

8           **Q.**    Okay. And you noted, you said the client ... and this  
9 is again globally; it's a summary of your sessions. On that  
10 second paragraph on page 301: "The client displays pressured as  
11 we all tangential speech patterns. He alternates rapidly  
12 between different emotional states during the interviews,  
13 laughing loudly one moment to displaying pronounced anger at the  
14 next."

15           So I guess my first question is about the tangential speech  
16 patterns. Tell us a little bit about that and the significance  
17 clinically.

18           **A.**    That can mean a few things. So tangential speech  
19 pattern would be, as an example, I ask you where you grew up,  
20 either because you don't want to discuss it or because you get  
21 easily distracted you start to say well, I grew up in, you know,  
22 Nova Scotia. And did you know that, you know, the provincial

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 bird of Nova Scotia is and then you go into these tangents that  
2 never circle back to the point of the question. So you leave  
3 into a direction that had nothing to do with the original  
4 question and so it's hard to gather information on the original  
5 question.

6 Q. So this is something ... did you frequently see this  
7 with Lionel Desmond recurring throughout your sessions with him?

8 A. Mm-hmm. Yeah, that's why I made it kind of a general  
9 observation because that did tend to come up again and again.

10 Q. What do you think was accounting for that?

11 A. Again, that can be a few things. I think that my main  
12 hypotheses were either difficulties with concentration. So, you  
13 know, any time that we talk about something we have associations  
14 in our mind and we tend to try to remain focussed by saying, Oh  
15 right, I'm thinking about this, but the point is the question I  
16 was just asked. And sometimes when we veer off course it's  
17 because you have trouble sorting through relevant information.

18 Or sometimes it's a function of avoidance where let me bury  
19 you in this irrelevant information so you don't ask me about  
20 where I grew up because that was difficult for me, for instance.

21 Q. Did he frequently have to be sort of redirected back  
22 on task, back on topic?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    That was something I did have to do frequently, yes.

2           **Q.**    Did you get a sense that that was sort of ... I don't  
3 want to say delay or getting in the way, but was it creating an  
4 added layer of difficulty when you're trying to get to the  
5 treatment?

6           **A.**    I think that it added difficulty in obtaining  
7 information in the sense that I would have to ask a question  
8 multiple times and, you know, re-focus Mr. Desmond in order to  
9 get a small piece of information, so that made it a more lengthy  
10 process.

11           I'm not sure I would say complicated treatment because if  
12 you were acting this way with me in treatment that means it's  
13 part of your difficulties. So it's not something for me to try  
14 to brush aside, it's something for me to try to help you manage.

15           **Q.**    Okay. And when you said these rapidly ... he would  
16 rapidly cycle between different emotional states, laughing  
17 loudly one moment and then anger the next. Was it very stark, I  
18 guess, the emotions that he was running through at any given  
19 session?

20           **A.**    Mm-hmm. So very intense differences yes, and it was  
21 usually related to the subject matter. So talking about the  
22 weather today perfectly fine, you know, cheerful, laughing,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 everything was fine and then, you know, when I tried to direct  
2 the session toward something like a conflict or difficult events  
3 from his past or some important decisions coming up in the  
4 future that's often where, you know, strong anxiety or anger or  
5 sadness would come up.

6 Q. How frequently would you observe these sort of very  
7 contrasting cycles of emotion with him?

8 A. Again, it would depend on the subjects that we  
9 addressed in session.

10 Q. Would it take much to sort of ... at one point in the  
11 same paragraph you said: "He would actually show overt signs of  
12 anger. For example, exhibit signs of anger such as clenched  
13 jaw, raised voice, finger pointing, unblinking eye contact and  
14 bared teeth."

15 A. Mm-hmm.

16 Q. Would that ... would you make those sort of  
17 observations frequently with him?

18 A. Again, it would really be situation dependent. So if  
19 we did address a situation where he had a conflict with somebody  
20 or a past event that was related to anger, then those emotions  
21 would come up, yes.

22 Q. And what do you think was accounting for that? Why

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 the sudden observable signs of anger?

2       **A.** I think that difficulties regulating anger would  
3 account for that. So, you know, when we would talk about a  
4 conflict ideally when we discuss conflict and you go back to  
5 these conflict we've thought about that conflict and maybe tried  
6 to see the other person's point of view or told yourself okay,  
7 well, that really made me angry in the moment, it's going to  
8 have no impact long term, it's not so bad, and you kind of, you  
9 know, internally use self-talk or, you know, deep breathing or  
10 some kind of, you know, tactic to try to gain some perspective  
11 and then anger is kind of reduced a little bit, and I think Mr.  
12 Desmond struggled a lot with that.

13       **Q.** In terms of ... there's a number of settings, and  
14 we'll go through them, where he had conflict with a number of  
15 individuals.

16       **A.** Mm-hmm.

17       **Q.** How did he sort of handle conflict? What was his,  
18 sort of, reaction to conflict? How was he doing with that?

19       **A.** Again, when we talk about conflict, a lot of managing  
20 conflict is trying to see the person's perspective, trying to  
21 see how your actions might have contributed to the situation. A  
22 lot of that what I'm describing falls under a bigger umbrella

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 skill called mentalization, which I think was very difficult for  
2 Mr. Desmond.

3 So, for instance, there might be a fairly neutral  
4 interaction that he would interpret as being directed towards  
5 him, being people, you know, laughing at him or being against  
6 him or trying to take advantage of him. And so challenging that  
7 perspective and trying to say, Well, what else might account for  
8 those behaviours or what else might be going on in somebody  
9 else's head, that was something that was difficult for him.

10 **Q.** So in terms of ... how was he in terms of throughout  
11 the program with being able to ground himself in a conflict  
12 scenario?

13 So with his emotional regulation, how was he and then how  
14 was he when he left the program? Did he ever get any success in  
15 reaching that?

16 **A.** So I think some limited progress. We tried a few  
17 different interventions to try to get him to develop skills.  
18 Because when he came in his only skill was avoidance. So what  
19 he would say is, you know, If I am angry with somebody or if I  
20 feel that this person is against me the only thing that I can do  
21 to try to avoid ... to not get into conflict, to not lose  
22 control and scream and throw things and ... which is what he

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 wanted to make sure didn't happen, would be to avoid that  
2 person, which, you know, only works to a certain extent,  
3 especially, for instance, if you're having conflict with  
4 somebody that's living on the unit. Avoidance is not the  
5 greatest strategy because that's going to have limited  
6 applications.

7 So we tried to identify different things that could happen  
8 that would help him kind of regulate anger and, therefore, make  
9 interactions with that person despite past conflicts a little  
10 bit easier. Some successes but I would say limited.

11 **(10:40)**

12 **Q.** So is it fair to say that when he left Ste. Anne's  
13 many interventions were tried. Was there still quite a bit of  
14 volatility to his emotional regulation and his anger?

15 **A.** That would be fair to say, yes.

16 **Q.** Was there still some volatility to his distrust of  
17 other people? This perception that other people maybe had it in  
18 for him?

19 **A.** I am not sure we'd call it volatility, I think I would  
20 say that that was kind of a skewed perception that he definitely  
21 still had, yes.

22 **Q.** And would you say he had limited success in dealing

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 with that by the time he left?

2       **A.** Yes. I would also say that these are usually skills  
3 that take quite a long time to develop. Changing the way that  
4 we habitually see things takes a lot of practice, a lot of  
5 effort, a lot of repetition to develop new ways of seeing things  
6 as a default.

7       **Q.** Okay. If we turn ... we're still at page 301 and  
8 turning in to page 302 a little bit, I understand that you did  
9 quite a bit of psychometric testing as it relates to Lionel  
10 Desmond. In particular, I have flagged four tests that you  
11 might have administered, the first being an Outcome  
12 Questionnaire 45.2. What is that?

13       **A.** So the OQ-45 is a test that is used often when we  
14 provide services in the sense that it allows us to monitor in a  
15 snapshot of time how somebody is doing with regards to general  
16 symptoms to social role and to interpersonal functioning. So  
17 it's got three subscales.

18       **Q.** And you noted the results of that, you said: "Lionel  
19 Desmond was in the clinically significant range with a  
20 moderately high level of distress." What does that mean in a  
21 practical sense for the rest of us here?

22       **A.** So what that would mean is there's a ... when you



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 create some of these tools and then you test them on a wide  
2 range of people you try to put a certain number, where past that  
3 number is people who you would say need support, are in  
4 significant distress, might benefit from treatment or therapy or  
5 interventions, and then below that number would be less  
6 significant. So that's the kind of clinical cutoff that we're  
7 talking about.

8 So a lot of tests that are elaborated come with these kind  
9 of lines that you can draw and above this ... somewhat  
10 artificial of course, but above this is where you would offer  
11 support and treatment therapy or interventions and then below  
12 would be kind of recovered when ... maybe ... what would be more  
13 considered the average population because everybody is expected  
14 to have some difficulties so ...

15 And then there's ranges that say ... again just for  
16 comparison sake, you know, is this distress extreme or minor or  
17 moderate, just to qualify in that clinical range where somebody  
18 is.

19 Q. And as sort of a subset, I guess, of this testing you  
20 said: "He was in the clinically ..." or the results were: "He  
21 was in the clinically significant range for three things:  
22 symptom distress, interpersonal relationship, and social role."

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 I wonder if you could tell us what each one of those are, I  
2 guess starting with symptom distress. What was it that put him  
3 in the clinically significant range? What would that involve?

4 **A.** So the subscale for his symptoms of distress would  
5 cover a broad range of symptoms. It's meant to capture just  
6 generally psychologically what might be happening, so it would  
7 include symptoms of difficulties with mood, with anxiety, with  
8 sleep, those kind of difficulties.

9 Then interpersonal relationships would cover kind of  
10 satisfaction in interpersonal relationships, conflict in  
11 interpersonal relationships.

12 And then social role would be ... it was sometimes a little  
13 bit less relevant because a lot of our clients just were not  
14 actively working but it would cover people's satisfaction with  
15 how they were doing at school or in a work setting.

16 **Q.** Okay. So these were, is it fair to say, identifiable  
17 areas that were, as a result of testing, suggesting that Lionel  
18 Desmond had struggles in these particular areas?

19 **A.** That's right.

20 **Q.** That was a terrible question but you answered it  
21 properly. Well ...

22 So next is the Post-Traumatic Checklist 5, the PCL-5. What

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 is that and what does it test for?

2       **A.** So that's a scale that was specifically developed to  
3 monitor and to assess symptoms of post-traumatic stress  
4 disorder. So, again, I'm not sure how much detail you want me  
5 to go. So it does cover the symptoms which are in the four main  
6 categories to have a diagnosis of PTSD, and it allows people to  
7 rate how much these different difficulties bother them.

8       **Q.** And as a result of this test you noted he was in the  
9 clinically significant range for those four scales I guess, or  
10 those four areas: avoidance subscales, intrusion, negative  
11 cognitions of mood, and hyperarousal. I guess if you can  
12 explain to us what the significance of those are.

13       **A.** So on this specific scale there's a one general and  
14 even that ... I won't get into it, but there's one general score  
15 that we try to use to see if somebody is in that clinical range  
16 where okay, I think this might be significant. This is not a  
17 diagnostic tool. It doesn't say if you're above that line you  
18 have a diagnosis of PTSD, but it certainly informs some of the  
19 questions you're going to be asking.

20       For the different categories like intrusion and avoidance  
21 and negative altercations in cognition and mood, there's no  
22 clinical cutoff.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 I highlighted that when Mr. Desmond identified which of  
2 these difficulties was more salient for him, he seemed to say  
3 that the avoidance items were some of the items that bothered  
4 him moderately and then quite a bit in the intrusion negative  
5 cognition and mood and hyperarousal scale. So I was just trying  
6 to highlight which of these he reported bothered him more.

7 Q. Okay. So I guess he was clinically significant on?

8 A. The whole test.

9 Q. The whole. Okay. What is the Millon Clinical  
10 Multiaxial Inventory III?

11 A. So the MCMI is a test that helps us determine which  
12 ... several things, but in general helps us determine which  
13 personality features might be maladaptive, might be causing some  
14 difficulties in people's functioning in everyday life. So it's  
15 this long form that you fill out and that helps us kind of  
16 narrow down some of those difficulties.

17 Q. And what was sort of the results of that testing?

18 A. So those results I integrated in the general  
19 assessment where I identified some of the personality facets  
20 that Mr. Desmond presented that were a little bit more  
21 problematic.

22 Q. So in terms of ... I'm wondering if you could put a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 summary in terms that, I guess, non-psychologists could  
2 understand that as a result of those four tests that you  
3 administered ...

4 **A.** So sorry, it's three.

5 **Q.** Oh three, sorry. As a result of those ...

6 **A.** No worries.

7 **Q.** ... three tests that you had administered, if you  
8 could put it in terms that non-psychologists could understand,  
9 what were you seeing about Lionel Desmond's clinical portrait?

10 **A.** So any time that you use some of these tests, and  
11 that's why there's that little paragraph that says, you know,  
12 yes, you use the tests that help your interpretation but that is  
13 informed by clinical observations. So I want to be clear that  
14 that's, you know, the combination that helps me make ... to draw  
15 conclusions for clinical portraits.

16 I'm trying to figure out how to make this a very short  
17 summary. So I think that when I do assessments, I do try to  
18 break down things either by spheres or sometimes by diagnoses.  
19 I think that, you know, in this report I tried a little bit more  
20 by spheres, in the sense that I said, Okay, well, there's  
21 difficulties in the interpersonal relationships with his spouse  
22 and his family in general, in a sense that they are the people

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 he interacts with most and there's some conflict, some lack of  
2 trust those relationships, but that's also reflected in general  
3 in his interactions with people around him.

4 **(10:50)**

5 This skew in his way of seeing things where fairly neutral  
6 interactions are interpreted as reasons not to trust to people  
7 or reasons to think that people are against him or want to take  
8 advantage of him, that was that significant kind of distrust  
9 lens that he was wearing in his interpersonal relationships and,  
10 of course, that would lead to quite a bit of conflict, some  
11 isolation.

12 And then I think that in the cognitive sphere I highlighted  
13 some of the things that we've discussed which is, you know,  
14 difficulties focusing on what we were discussing. Difficulties  
15 integrating new information. Difficulties planning, seeing  
16 ahead, understanding how other people perceived his actions, how  
17 his actions and his words and even his non-verbal could be  
18 interpreted by other people. So some of those kind of concerns  
19 were what led me to suggest that a neuropsychological assessment  
20 might be beneficial.

21 I think I also tried to speak to just his general structure  
22 as a person and some of the things he was dealing with, so those

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 are some of the personality features that I highlighted, like  
2 some impulsivity, difficulties with mentalization which we've  
3 discussed a little bit more before as well.

4 Am I being a little bit too clinical? I'm trying to give  
5 accurate information but be too obscure.

6 Q. No, I think that gives us a general sense.

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. And the purpose of the questioning just going forward  
9 I will start breaking down the parts, I guess, in your answer.  
10 So I guess if we move to conceptualization, you noted on page  
11 302: "The client initially identifies his marital relationship  
12 as the main source of distress."

13 A. Mm-hmm.

14 Q. So in terms of things that were causing him distress,  
15 was that at the top of the scale, his marital relationship?

16 A. You know, I think ... and potentially this will be  
17 more and more illustrated when we cover maybe individual  
18 sessions. But I think that Mr. Desmond was having a lot of  
19 distress and had a tendency to want to identify one thing that  
20 he could focus on today or during the session or during the week  
21 that if he could solve this one thing then he would feel better.

22 So that would mean that, you know, when he showed up at

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 first he would say: If I can just fix this relationship I want  
2 to ... you know, I want to live with my wife and my daughter  
3 again. I want this to go well. I want to be a husband, I want  
4 to be a father and then things will go well. And that was kind  
5 of his focus.

6 But then throughout his stay at Ste. Anne's that shifted on  
7 multiple occasions. At some point it was: I just need to find  
8 a new job and if I find a new job then, you know, that will  
9 solve all my other difficulties. Or I just need to sell my  
10 house and if I ... once I sell my house there will be so much  
11 less stress then I will feel better.

12 So I think that there was a shifting. A tendency to shift  
13 from external stressor to external stressor as the main source  
14 of distress, whereas in the report I reflect that I think it's  
15 more a question of a lot of difficulties managing emotions when  
16 faced with stressors.

17 **Q.** And did this continue, this theme continue throughout  
18 the entirety of his stay at Ste. Anne's?

19 **A.** Yes. So some days he would say, you know, It's my  
20 relationship, that's what's going on, I need to focus on this.  
21 And then two sessions later it would be, It's a job. I need  
22 help to find a job. If I find a job it'll be fine. So this



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 kind of very, very narrow focus on one thing.

2           Whereas I would try a drawback and say, you know, I think  
3 the issue is managing stress around finding a new job. It's  
4 extremely stressful to think about going back on the job market,  
5 I understand that, but if we help you manage some of these  
6 emotions we will facilitate whatever next stressor comes down  
7 the line.

8           **Q.** And I understand that it's ... you know, and it's  
9 probably impossible to separate his depression and his post-  
10 traumatic stress disorder mixed personality traits from general  
11 stressors, whether it's in a marital context, whether it's  
12 finding a job, selling a house, living with your wife and child,  
13 navigating those dynamics.

14           How prominent were each of those? Is it fair to say that  
15 his external life stressors were as prominent as his, I'm having  
16 flashbacks about being in the military? Were they as equally as  
17 prominent as military flashbacks of PTSD?

18           **A.** Just to clarify. You're asking me if you thought that  
19 his external stressors were as distressing to him as his kind of  
20 ... the trauma events?

21           **Q.** Yes, I guess so. Yes.

22           **A.** Okay. I don't think I can make a determination on

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 that. Certainly he seemed more focussed on external stressor,  
2 but again, that might just mean they were less intimidating to  
3 him to address in sessions than events from the past, which he  
4 often quite categorically refused to discuss. So that was very  
5 difficult for me to assess and that's a very subjective thing in  
6 any case, right. That can be fluctuating throughout the day, in  
7 the moment.

8 **Q.** I guess in terms of his ... the subject matter of his  
9 complaints sort of to you that he's struggling with. Were those  
10 external stressors, marital external stressors, as prominent as  
11 his complaints as it relates to PTSD and flashbacks?

12 **A.** They were brought up by him more often as sources of  
13 distress.

14 **Q.** Okay. And the fact that they were brought up by him  
15 more often than the classic PTSD and flashbacks, what is that  
16 telling you as his clinical psychologist?

17 **A.** I think that all these things are inter-related,  
18 right. You know, if you have a diagnosis of mental health that  
19 usually makes it a little harder for you to manage everyday  
20 stresses. And if you have everyday stresses, that makes it  
21 harder to manage symptoms of mental health, so I think it's all  
22 inter-related.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           And I think that the fact that he was focussing on these  
2 external stressors, you know, I think he was having a hard time  
3 and I think that he wanted to find something he could fix that  
4 was maybe a bit more tangible.

5           **Q.**    So if I was to say to you, the source of Lionel  
6 Desmond's struggles with his mental health and difficulty were  
7 attributable to his post-traumatic stress disorder, what would  
8 be your answer to that?

9           **A.**    I'm sorry, could you repeat that?

10          **Q.**    If I made a declaration to you and said the source of  
11 Lionel Desmond's struggles with his mental health were  
12 attributable to his post-traumatic stress disorder, that's  
13 what's causing Lionel Desmond's troubles, what is your response  
14 to that?

15          **A.**    I think that would be a very big over-simplification.  
16 I think that if that had been the case, that's what my report  
17 would have reflected. I would have said, you know, I see  
18 nothing else but symptoms of post-traumatic stress disorder  
19 which are making it hard for the member to manage everyday  
20 stressors. That's what I would have written in the report.

21           I definitely don't think it was as clear cut as that; I  
22 think there were multiple factors in play.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    Okay.  You noted in your report that he indicates  
2   having sleeping difficulties partly due to recurring nightmares.  
3   This is, sorry, on page 302.  "Mr. Desmond indicates having  
4   sleeping difficulties partly due to recurring nightmares of  
5   finding his wife cheating on him and attacking her and her  
6   lover."

7           I guess how frequent were his nightmares, I guess, if we  
8   break it down in general?  Nightmare for anything.

9           **A.**    So I usually try to give frequency of nightmares, so  
10  the fact that it's not in there tells me that I probably tried  
11  to ask the question and couldn't get a very definite answer.

12          **Q.**    And in terms of the prominence of his reported  
13  nightmares, how often did they take the form of I'm having a  
14  flashback of a military context versus I'm having a nightmare  
15  about my wife cheating and her infidelity and acting out  
16  aggressively on someone?

17          **A.**    So if you actually look at the next line.  So it says:  
18  "When questioned on symptoms related to trauma events, the  
19  client says he cannot think of the past and refuses to  
20  elaborate."  That's what that would mean.

21          That would mean that I tried to tease out what ... how  
22  many symptoms he was having that were related to deployment

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 events, to trauma events, and he refused to answer.

2 Q. So you couldn't really get a fair gauge as to were  
3 these connected to traumas in the military.

4 (11:00)

5 A. Unfortunately not. And this is not completely  
6 unusual. Some people who have trauma events in the past are  
7 very, very reluctant to discuss them, but it does make for a  
8 difficult assessment.

9 Q. And I understand from what we've learned so far,  
10 homicidal risk and suicidal risk is very much a clinical  
11 judgement based on a number of factors. My question is sort of  
12 this is you were treating Lionel Desmond. He tells you, I have  
13 a dream that I find my wife cheating and I attack her, I attack  
14 her lover. He's told Dr. Ouellette that he finds her cheating.  
15 He kills her in the dream.

16 A. Mm-hmm.

17 Q. Did you ever get any sense or try to flush out whether  
18 these self-reported dreams were him telling you that these are  
19 actually day-to-day thoughts, intrusive thoughts, that he may be  
20 having?

21 A. Mm-hmm. He definitely represented them to me as  
22 dreams. I think what you're suggesting, is it possible that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 people would present something as a dream as being a more  
2 palatable way of reporting kind of an intrusive thought. I  
3 think that whether it's a dream or an intrusive thought, the  
4 most important piece of that would be his reporting that this is  
5 something that he struggles with and he finds very difficult,  
6 right? That then changes it. That's the distinction between a  
7 fantasy, which is pleasurable and, you know, he actively kind of  
8 engages in as something that might be a good thing, and  
9 something that he finds distressing, that he wants to get rid  
10 of.

11 And so if it was ... and again, this is pure conjecture.  
12 If it was his way of saying that this was something happening  
13 during the day, the most important piece attached to that was  
14 him saying, you know, This is something that I don't want in my  
15 life anymore.

16 **Q.** Was he ever able to, in the period of time that you  
17 had treated him at Ste. Anne's, was he ever able to get rid of  
18 those intrusive nightmares that, in a daily context, he was  
19 focussed on and they were of concern to him? Was he ever able  
20 to get past those?

21 **A.** No. So he did not actively report those nightmares to  
22 me after having discussed them in that assessment. Certainly,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 his frustrations in his marital relationship remained to a  
2 certain extent, but I didn't monitor dreams from session to  
3 session.

4 Q. Okay. You noted at page 302 as well, you said, under  
5 "Current Symptoms": "The client mentions that yelling in the  
6 context of conflicts seems to trigger intrusive images of his  
7 deployment in Afghanistan." What do you mean by that?

8 A. So he had reported to me that any time, kind of,  
9 voices are raised and there's arguments and yelling, it tends to  
10 make him think back about deployment events. That's what I  
11 meant by that.

12 Q. So I guess there was some sort of connection, is it  
13 fair to say, that between him being involved in a verbal  
14 disagreement with someone, he could flash back to trauma he  
15 experienced in the military?

16 A. I'm not sure if it was traumatic events or not. So it  
17 might be, you know, orders being yelled at him or something like  
18 that, but certainly to kind of a more military setting.

19 Q. I'm just trying to find a passage here. The last  
20 paragraph on page 302, again with the cognitive functioning, you  
21 say: "Mr. Desmond seems to have difficulties assimilating  
22 information, often seeming to misunderstand questions or

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 assigned exercises."

2       **A.**    Mm-hmm.

3       **Q.**    What was happening there?

4       **A.**    Unfortunately, I can't recall specific examples that I  
5 could give you, but it would be generally indicating that when I  
6 would ask him a question, he would give me an answer which  
7 seemed unrelated. And I can't remember any specific examples  
8 for these assigned exercises.

9       **Q.**    Okay. I'm going to bounce back to the first paragraph  
10 under "Current Symptoms", probably midway through. You  
11 mentioned that: "In response to activation of traumatic  
12 memories or to physiological arousal, the client would now  
13 choose to leave the situation and to isolate himself. In the  
14 past, Mr. Desmond would have become aggressive, both verbally  
15 and physically." Is that something he disclosed to you?

16       **A.**    Yes. So specific timeline was first difficult to  
17 establish and be at this point is a little vague, but I believe  
18 it was several years before this assessment there had been a  
19 situation where I think he was at a family event and an adult  
20 man was speaking with a raised voice at a child and this made  
21 him very upset and I think he pushed against the wall, this  
22 person, and I think he said to me that was very distressing to



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 him. And so he said, In order to avoid anything like this ever  
2 happening again, now when I get angry, I just leave the  
3 situation and I go by myself that way I can make sure that I  
4 don't ... I'm not physically aggressive with people.

5 **Q.** Did he ever disclose to you any occasions where he got  
6 either verbally or physically aggressive towards his wife or  
7 daughter?

8 **A.** I think he discussed with me raised voices which I  
9 think would be ... you know, I would hesitate to qualify that as  
10 verbal abuse.

11 **Q.** Sure.

12 **A.** But no, he never discussed with me any kind of  
13 physical violence with his wife or his daughter.

14 **Q.** Okay. And again in that same paragraph, you talk  
15 about: "Finally, as for hypervigilance, Mr. Desmond displays  
16 interpersonal distrust with some interpretations of events which  
17 verge on persecutory delusions."

18 **A.** Mm-hmm.

19 **Q.** What do you mean by that?

20 **A.** So delusions would be this kind of lack of contact  
21 with reality. And this, I think, was more present in his  
22 relationship with his wife, when he was convinced that she was

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 cheating on him. And he would, at times, kind of bounce back  
2 and say, No, I have no proof of this. I really don't think it's  
3 happening, but there's this kind of thought in my mind that  
4 won't go away that it's happening.

5 So this kind of skew towards, I have no proof. It's very  
6 unlikely. Part of me really doesn't believe it but there's this  
7 attachment to this kind of abstract belief that's kind of very  
8 anchored. So this kind of skew that I was talking about where  
9 there would be kind of a very neutral event. Like, at some  
10 point, he said ... I think he saw two mental health  
11 professionals kind of laughing together and he interpreted that  
12 as, You're laughing at me and that's a very big jump. That's a  
13 little bit telling as well.

14 Q. Clinically, what are you making of that? How are you  
15 assessing this information and what is it you're to ... how are  
16 you going to approach this? You have Lionel Desmond who tells  
17 you recurringly that he has this sort of deep distrust about his  
18 wife and he has this deep distrust about how she's managing  
19 perhaps the finances and accepting of him. He then talks about  
20 her infidelity in dreams.

21 So my question is, there's a recurring theme around  
22 stressors to him in one form or another, and Shanna Desmond.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 And it seems to be always prominent. How are you interpreting  
2 that as his clinical psychologist and what is your approach to  
3 that?

4 **A.** So first, I'm not sure I would say that that's the  
5 main stressor. I think that any kind of external stressor was  
6 difficult for him to manage. And certainly this distrust that  
7 we're talking about seemed to be prevalent in all relationships.  
8 It's just that Mr. Desmond didn't have a ton of relationships,  
9 and for most people, our marital or close family relationships  
10 are our most significant ones and, therefore, there are the ones  
11 that can cause quite a bit of distress in us.

12 So rather than focusing more on one relationship, I was  
13 taking more of a broad view saying, When you have thoughts that  
14 are distrustful towards other people, how do you then challenge  
15 these thoughts to try just to have a little bit more flexibility  
16 and go, Is there any other way to interpret this? Any other  
17 hypotheses? And building in this flexibility is one of the  
18 things that does tend to help people manage anger.

19 **(11:10)**

20 **Q.** Was he able to demonstrate some success in doing that?

21 **A.** Not by himself. So if I were with him kind of  
22 coaching him, modeling this type of behaviour, if we were using

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 an example that was outside of his own situation. So let's say,  
2 you know, Person A and Person B have this discussion. Person A  
3 perceives this. Person B gets angry. What do you think might  
4 also be going on? Then he was able to, you know, be a little  
5 bit more flexible there.

6 But again, you know, when we see these type of really  
7 deeply anchored distrust, this is often, you know, something  
8 that's very longstanding and will require practice and practice  
9 and practice to develop this reflex to challenge our own  
10 automatic interpretations.

11 **Q.** You noted at the bottom of page 302 that there was  
12 marked cognitive rigidity in his clinical portrait. What was  
13 that, what was the significance of it, and what's an example?

14 **A.** So at the beginning of our discussion today, you asked  
15 if I was qualified to offer cognitive behavioural therapy. So  
16 one of the hallmarks of cognitive behavioural therapy is  
17 something that's called "cognitive restructuring" which is what  
18 we're discussing, right? This is your interpretation of an  
19 event. How do we build flexibility into that? How do we  
20 challenge that? Is that realistic? Is that helpful?

21 So when I was talking about Mr. Desmond being able to  
22 follow me in this exercise, usually, having seen that a few

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 times, people develop the capacity to do it at least a little  
2 bit by themselves. And that was very difficult for him. So  
3 that's the cognitive rigidity that I'm talking about, you know.  
4 His fixed ideas about, this is the interpretation that's right,  
5 this is what's going on, and then a lot of trouble moving and  
6 trying to consider other possibilities.

7 Q. And in his time at Ste. Anne's, was he ever able to  
8 have some success in reducing his cognitive rigidity?

9 A. Not by himself. So practicing in session was  
10 something that he was sometimes able to do, but he would've  
11 required more practice.

12 Q. Looking at page 303 and this idea of suicidal or  
13 homicidal ideation, you said: "Mr. Desmond does not report any  
14 suicidal or homicidal ideation. (It's at the very top.) In  
15 response to the client stating that if people disrespect him,  
16 that they will see the beast aspect of him, Mr. Desmond states  
17 that he would never hurt anyone." Or anybody, sorry.

18 A. Mm-hmm.

19 Q. So can you put that sort of in context about people  
20 disrespecting him and they will see the beast aspect of him and  
21 then saying, I would never hurt anyone? What are some examples  
22 of this discussion?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    So that's also something that I noted a lot. In my  
2 notes, in my report, Mr. Desmond would use a lot of very  
3 particular imagery. So sometimes he would also describe when he  
4 would get angry as a tornado. You know, Oh, the tornado is  
5 coming in, the wind is picking up. These type of things. So to  
6 me, you know, once he said, you know, They'll see the beast  
7 aspect of me, my questions, which I think are again a bit more  
8 detailed in more of my session notes, were, Well, what do you  
9 mean by that? And then we explored what that meant. And then,  
10 you know, he described to me his fear of yelling, of throwing  
11 things, of damaging his relationships because one of the reasons  
12 he wanted to work on this, of course, was he could see the  
13 damaging impact that this was having on his relationships where  
14 when he got angry.

15           So there was this kind of duality where he would say, you  
16 know, I can't tolerate people taking advantage of me or  
17 disrespecting me or being mean to me, trying to take advantage  
18 of me. All these different things. So I want to tell them how  
19 angry this makes me but having very little capacity to express  
20 anger in a healthy way. And so it was all or nothing. Either  
21 he would withdraw and isolate or he would yell and scream and  
22 then the point would be kind of lost.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           So that, again, in a lot of my notes, are some of the  
2 discussions that we had. How do we healthily express anger when  
3 we're upset at somebody when we think they're taking advantage  
4 of us. So the ... he stated he would never hurt anybody.  
5 That's when me, I was reviewing, Okay, well, are you worried  
6 that you could ... when you lose control, are you worried that  
7 you would hit somebody? Are you worried that you would ... the  
8 same incident that you described at that social gathering would  
9 happen again? He said, Well, that's definitely not my  
10 intention. That's why I isolate. That's because I don't want  
11 to do that. I wouldn't hurt people around me. So that  
12 intentionality was definitely something that he wasn't  
13 mentioning at that point.

14           **Q.** And is it fair to say that his coping strategies of  
15 either avoidance altogether and then perhaps ruminating about  
16 it, and yelling, would not have been productive coping  
17 strategies?

18           **A.** Certainly not the most helpful. And so that's why we  
19 were trying to develop more helpful ones.

20           **Q.** Did he have any success, again by the time he'd  
21 finished at Ste. Anne's, in implementing those coping  
22 strategies?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Again, very limited. You know, he identified a few  
2 things that he could do. For instance, one of the things he  
3 said was that, you know, if he did focus on having good self-  
4 care, like working out, he would have, like, a lower kind of  
5 baseline to start with, be a little bit more calm and,  
6 therefore, be in a better state to address some stressors. And  
7 I think the other thing that he mentioned was deep breathing.  
8 That was something that was helpful in helping him kind of calm  
9 down a little bit, to try to practice actually saying out loud,  
10 you know, Why am I bothered by this? Can you explain why you  
11 did this? And that second part was a lot more challenging.

12           **Q.**    I'm going to shift gears a little bit and ask you  
13 about under "Past History". And what I'm interested in is  
14 Lionel Desmond was a black man in a rural community in Nova  
15 Scotia. He comes from a very difficult socioeconomic  
16 background. How does that play, or how did it play, in his  
17 trauma portrait, I guess, and how could it play clinically in  
18 the treatment ...

19           **A.**    So if you do look at that ... sorry. If you do look  
20 at that passage, I also say that it was really difficult to get  
21 kind of precise, detailed, accurate information. Again, Mr.  
22 Desmond did use a lot of imagery which was sometimes a little



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 bit informative, but often a bit obscure as well. So when I  
2 asked more specific questions to really try to get at the heart  
3 of matters, what I did glean was that, certainly, he'd felt  
4 rejected and put aside by his peers in school, again because of  
5 his skin colour and his socioeconomic status. So to me, that  
6 means that this could be some of the foundations of that  
7 interpersonal distrust that we're seeing today, right? If you  
8 are feeling rejected, if you are feeling other input aside, that  
9 definitely doesn't build a great foundation to think that people  
10 are well-meaning towards you.

11 Q. In terms of ... there's this concept of seeing people  
12 through a culturally-competent lens. So basically, you're  
13 seeing Lionel Desmond as someone from that cultural background.

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. And is there room there for a recognition of that in  
16 the treatment and, if so, do you have any idea what that could  
17 be?

18 A. Again, perhaps more than I gave it, although it was  
19 fairly short-term, so it's hard to see where we would've built  
20 in the time. I think for more long-term, we could've tried to  
21 build some of that cognitive flexibility by seeing, you know,  
22 what the emotional impact of those childhood events might've

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 been.

2 I think that I like to take a global approach where we see  
3 kind of all the things that contributed to having this skew in  
4 our perception as adults. And so that would've been kind of  
5 taken into consideration where we're trying to build that  
6 flexibility. It's saying, There are reasons why you see things  
7 this way, right? I mean you've been through difficult events  
8 that have made you take this more protective, distrustful  
9 approach. Is it causing problems now more than it's helping  
10 you?

11 **Q.** Your Honour, I was going to move to sort of rounding  
12 out her global report. It's going to get into mixed personality  
13 traits and it's sort of the guarded diagnosis.

14 **THE COURT:** I think then what we might do, Dr. Gagnon,  
15 as indicated, we might take a morning break. And I get the  
16 signal from Mr. Russell that this is an appropriate time to do  
17 that. So we might break for we'll try and keep it to about 15  
18 minutes, maybe 20 minutes max, okay? We'll let everyone stretch  
19 their legs, so to speak.

20 All right, thank you. We'll adjourn for now then.

21 **COURT RECESSED (11:20 HRS)**

22 **COURT RESUMED (11:39 HRS)**

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **THE COURT:**       Mr. Russell?

2           **MR. RUSSELL:**    Thank you, Your Honour.  And so where we  
3 left off, I was going to turn to ... Dr. Gagnon, I was going to  
4 turn to page 303, which was "Clinical Conceptualization".

5           **A.**       Yes.

6           **Q.**       What is "clinical conceptualization", I guess?

7           **A.**       So it's trying to bring back all the elements that  
8 were earlier in the assessment to kind of an explanation of the  
9 functioning decline.

10          **Q.**       And, again, I'm wondering ... I'm going to read you a  
11 passage and I'm wondering if you can sort of break it down for  
12 us so that we can understand.  Right under "Clinical  
13 Conceptualization", you say: "To account for the client's  
14 clinical presentation, we pause at a complex interaction between  
15 a traumatic portrait, experiential avoidance, and personality  
16 traits and we underline the potential input from cognitive  
17 dysfunctions."

18          It appears to me that there's a lot in that paragraph, so  
19 I'm wondering if you could break it down for us and what does it  
20 mean.

21          **A.**       Sure.  So that is kind of the introduction line where  
22 I try to give a really brief summary.  So that first part,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 "traumatic portrait", right below that, again I kind of break  
2 things down in a little bit more detail. So I do say that I  
3 have an approximation of what traumatic symptoms the member  
4 might have. But that would be the influence of trauma events  
5 and how they cause dysfunction in his daily life. So again if I  
6 refer to my assessment, I would say some symptoms of intrusion,  
7 some symptoms of irritability and hypervigilance, negative  
8 affect, a lot of anger, interpersonal distrust. So that would  
9 be the piece where I detail a little bit what those traumas  
10 symptoms might be.

11 I do then go to say experiential avoidance in the sense  
12 that I did think that the level and the ... the level but also  
13 the wide-ranging impact of the avoidance the member was  
14 presenting was a little bit more intense than I usually observe  
15 in people who have a diagnosis of post-traumatic stress  
16 disorder. So I thought it might be a more longstanding habit of  
17 coping with things.

18 If you haven't been using avoidance for at least most of  
19 your life then, reasonably, I would expect people to have at  
20 least a few other coping skills that they could rely on. And I  
21 didn't observe much of that. So by "experiential avoidance",  
22 what I mean is not only avoiding external things which cause me

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 distress but also finding ways of distracting myself and not  
2 feeling emotions when they are distressing or not thinking about  
3 things when they are distressing, which of course bars us from  
4 dealing effectively with things when they come up.

5       And then "personality traits", which again I've described a  
6 little bit lower. Again, the magnitude and the fact that some  
7 of these personality traits were present in a lot of spheres,  
8 that they came up again and again, the very few details that I  
9 had from his childhood had me believe that they might, to some  
10 extent, be some personality features that the member had  
11 developed across his lifetime.

12       And then the last piece of that is that potential input  
13 from cognitive dysfunctions. That's some of the concentration,  
14 assimilation of the new information, kind of future planning  
15 that we had previously discussed.

16       Q.   And as we move along, I'm going to touch on those  
17 various aspects, but I thank you for the general overview in  
18 terms of what that meant and how you applied it. Then you later  
19 sort of ... you qualify things even further. In a line down,  
20 you say, "However, we consider ..." you say: "We can only  
21 provide an approximate picture of the client's traumatic profile  
22 due to the client's reticence to discuss past events. However,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 we consider that this very reticence speaks to the prominence of  
2 avoidance in the client's clinical portrait." What's going on  
3 there?

4 **A.** So, again, not unusual that people are reticent to  
5 discuss trauma events. You're talking about literally some of  
6 the most terrible things that happen in people's lives. But,  
7 you know, his ... usually, as the therapeutic alliance is  
8 established, people do become a little bit more open. And there  
9 was very little movement with that. And, you know, sometimes  
10 there was a flat-out refusal. So I did think that his avoidance  
11 for discussing these past events spoke to his general tendency  
12 of avoidance.

13 **Q.** So do I take from that ... you know, you're frequently  
14 having contact with him, but it was a constant sort of struggle,  
15 I guess, to peel back the layers to get him to discuss what it  
16 is that's underlying his condition.

17 **A.** Mm-hmm. So something that he would frequently say  
18 was, I can't think about the past. I've got to think about the  
19 future.

20 **Q.** And how was this sort of making things a little more  
21 challenging, I guess, when you're trying to come up with  
22 implementing treatment? So, basically, if he's resistant to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 talk about the symptoms or the causes, how is that influencing  
2 your ability to effectively implement a treatment?

3       **A.** I think a lot of providing effective care to people is  
4 respecting their wishes when they're telling you what they need.  
5 So if somebody tells me that they flat out refuse to tell me  
6 about the things that have happened, then I've got to trust that  
7 they know that it would be a very dysregulating experience for  
8 them. And so, to me, that just gives me clinical information  
9 that we're not there yet and that we need to keep working on  
10 emotional regulation skills, on tolerating distress, on  
11 tolerating difficult events.

12       And so, again, stop me if I get a little too technical.  
13 But when we think about kind of an overarching framework in  
14 terms of treating post-traumatic stress disorder, often there's  
15 this thought that we can break it down in three different  
16 categories, the first category being kind of a stabilization  
17 phase where you develop a lot of these skills so that you then  
18 have the internal and external resources to do the more trauma-  
19 focussed work. And some people never get there.

20       **Q.** Were you ever ... in Lionel Desmond's time at Ste.  
21 Anne's, were you ever able to get there to a satisfactory level  
22 and ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    No.

2           **Q.**    Oh, sorry.  Go ahead.

3           **A.**    I would say not so much.  We were still kind of  
4 working to develop those skills.  And some people spend, you  
5 know, quite a bit of time.  And some people will say, I don't  
6 want to do this reprocessing bit, which is people's choices and  
7 certainly I wouldn't want to strong arm anybody into doing that.

8           **Q.**    So that reticence and continued avoidance, that was  
9 present throughout his entirety of his stay at Ste. Anne's?

10          **A.**    With regards to discussing trauma events, yes.  And,  
11 sorry, just to qualify, I would get tidbits.  It wasn't a flat  
12 refusal to ever discuss anything, but the reticence in a general  
13 way, yes, that was present the whole way through.

14          **Q.**    Okay.  And you indicate that the profile ... if I  
15 could have one moment to find.  If we turn to page 304, there's  
16 a line and then there's sort of the first paragraph.  You  
17 describe the profile as sort of tentative.

18          **A.**    Uh-huh.

19          **Q.**    Why was it tentative?

20          **A.**    Again, because I wanted a little bit more information  
21 about potential input for cognitive dysfunction.  For instance,  
22 when I mention that he might be displaying some borderline



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 personality traits, one of the symptoms of borderline  
2 personality disorder one of the traits that might be present for  
3 somebody that does have that diagnosis, would be impulsivity.  
4 There's some overlap. If somebody has a brain injury, that  
5 might also be part of that portrait. So, therefore, you know, I  
6 saw some of these signs and I didn't want to misattribute what  
7 that may be coming from, hence the tentative ...

8 **Q.** And we understood from talking to Dr. Ouellette  
9 yesterday he said he didn't diagnose Lionel Desmond with  
10 personality disorder as opposed to personality traits. Would  
11 you share that view?

12 **A.** That's right. That's right because, again, when you  
13 do have some of those hesitations about where some of these  
14 characteristics might be coming from, having had difficulties  
15 going back to an early age when we are talking about personality  
16 ... a disorder, a diagnosis of personality disorder, you really  
17 want to make sure this has been present for quite some time,  
18 from a younger age, a really longstanding pattern that's present  
19 in, you know, most if not all spheres of life, and that could  
20 not be attributed to either substance use or a more kind of  
21 brain injury, physical causes, or things like that.

22 **(11:50)**

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           So you want to be careful when you give these diagnoses.  
2           And so when you do have some hesitations on some of these other  
3           places where ... it could be having somebody's input. That's a  
4           way of saying, I've observed these traits. I'm holding off on  
5           placing a diagnosis of personality disorder. So I would concur  
6           with that, yes.

7           **Q.**    And, in fact, you say on that first paragraph at page  
8           304: "Indeed, Mr. Desmond seems to display a profile in which  
9           borderline personality traits seems prominent." So I guess  
10          there's two aspects of that. What were the borderline  
11          personality traits that you observed that he had and what made  
12          them prominent?

13          **A.**    So if you look at all the session notes that I've  
14          produced in the course of Mr. Desmond's stay at Ste. Anne's,  
15          you'll notice a strong focus on emotional regulation. So one of  
16          the determining characteristics of people who do suffer from  
17          borderline personality disorder is intense fluctuations in  
18          emotions and difficulties regulating those emotions, one of  
19          these emotions being, of course, anger and often kind of  
20          inappropriate displays of anger. That would be, you know,  
21          yelling, screaming, or hitting, all these different  
22          inappropriate expressions of a very healthy emotion. So since I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 thought that was a big part of the treatment, focus and a big  
2 central aspect of the member's difficulty where he could really  
3 make gains if he developed more skills, that's why I thought it  
4 was a prominent part of his clinical profile.

5 **Q.** So we understood from Dr. Ouellette's evidence  
6 yesterday that ... and I'm just wondering if you share the view,  
7 that personality traits can exist independently of another ...  
8 from more of a diagnosis of PTSD and PTSD can perhaps sometimes  
9 aggravate those personality traits. Am I understanding that  
10 correctly?

11 **A.** Yeah. So any kind of psychological difficulties will  
12 often have interactions. So, for instance, one of the  
13 diagnostic features of borderline personality disorder would be  
14 fear of abandonment and kind of a lot of thoughts around, Are  
15 people going to leave me? Do people have negative kind of  
16 intentions around that? And so that could have that kind of  
17 connecting line with post-traumatic stress disorder where we do  
18 have kind of that interpersonal distrust or negative thoughts  
19 about other people.

20 **Q.** And did you see that fear of abandonment with Lionel  
21 Desmond?

22 **A.** Certainly a fear that his spouse would be ending the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 relationship. And then as treatment concluded, I also had some  
2 of those feelings, right, that he perceived some interventions  
3 that we were doing as "us" taking somebody else's side over his.

4 Q. Could you get a sense of when these ... and I mean I'm  
5 ... I understand that you had only seen him when he attended  
6 Ste. Anne's and you had limited access to his past. Could you  
7 get a sense from him how long these traits might have existed  
8 with him or were they something new?

9 A. That's part of the reason why I put in his report that  
10 it was a tentative diagnosis because I would want to go back and  
11 check again and again; you know, when was the first time that  
12 you felt this, can you think of examples in your youth or as a  
13 young adult where this was bothering you. You know, he gave me  
14 some clues from maybe when he was younger and he felt that kind  
15 of rejection from his peers. So that could be some of the  
16 origins there. But, again, that's why I put a lot of those  
17 very careful wording that I worked very hard to put in there to  
18 say, I think this might be going on and it would explain kind of  
19 the breadth of the expression of some of these personality  
20 traits. But I didn't want to, you know, put that in absolute  
21 terms.

22 Q. How did you go about, as a clinical psychologist ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 how did you go about treating those personality traits?

2 **A.** How would I go about in a general client, you mean?

3 **Q.** I guess how did you go about it as it relates to Mr.  
4 Desmond, in particular.

5 **A.** So when we do talk about personality traits, the  
6 expectation does come that work will be more long term and will  
7 require, you know, more repetition, more kind of repetitive work  
8 to change some of these features which, again, we suspect may be  
9 more longstanding. If your expectations of abandonment or  
10 mistreatment or rejection from other people stem from, you know,  
11 experiences that were from childhood, then you've had a long  
12 time to develop these kind of expectations from people. And so,  
13 reasonably, this would be something that's done a lot more long  
14 term. But some of what I was discussing, the emotional  
15 regulation being the key piece, regulating first, then creating  
16 some of that space to challenge some of our preconceptions about  
17 other people's motivations behind their actions, that would be  
18 the first steps in that direction.

19 **Q.** You noted that Lionel Desmond had an underdeveloped  
20 sense of self. What is a "sense of self" and why is it  
21 important for mental health or mental wellness?

22 **A.** So certainly our sense of self helps us, you know,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 feel like we're taking active decisions in our lives and what we  
2 want, what are our key values? It really helps us make  
3 decisions about where to go in the future. And so in my  
4 discussions with Mr. Desmond, one thing that struck me a lot is  
5 he would ... for his future plans, he would kind of use these  
6 labels but then struggle very much to define what that would  
7 look like.

8 He would say something like, I just want to be a happy  
9 family. And then I would say, Okay, what would that look like,  
10 you know? Not a cookie-cutter family, but for you, what would  
11 constitute a happy family? Right? I just want to be a husband,  
12 I just want to be a father. But then it was like he wanted to  
13 get to that label but had a little bit of trouble figuring out  
14 what that would look like.

15 And so he was in that transition phase of leaving an  
16 organization which does come with a set of values, with  
17 camaraderie, often with a sense of purpose. And so I think that  
18 he identified strongly with some of these things. And so I  
19 underlined this because I think it's important when you have  
20 this important transition. Where there is transitioning to not  
21 being a husband anymore, not being a CAF member anymore, not  
22 living in a certain country anymore, these big life changes,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 it's important to have a well-established sense of self where  
2 you can say, My life circumstances can change but I am still the  
3 me in this next situation and I can make good decisions to have  
4 the kind of future that's going to make me happy and feel  
5 purposeful and engaged.

6 **Q.** So you talk about the importance of having that sense  
7 of self in a veteran context when you make that transition from  
8 the military back to civilian life. And you said that Lionel  
9 Desmond very much struggled with that, he struggled with even  
10 being able to define whether or not what it means to be, I  
11 guess, a good father and a husband. Who was going to be able to  
12 help him with that and how would they go about doing it?

13 **A.** Certainly, I wouldn't want to suggest that I provide  
14 my clients with a sense of self. But, certainly, having him  
15 reflect on what he wanted from the future, what some of his core  
16 values might be, what type of hobbies or volunteering or paid  
17 work or engagement with the community that might make him feel  
18 like he was being coherent with who he wanted to be.

19 **Q.** And again that question of when Lionel Desmond walked  
20 out the door to the Ste. Anne's Clinic, what sort of quality or  
21 level of sense of self did he have?

22 **A.** Very, I would say, tenuous. And a lot of that will

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 have to be ... when people do have these big life changes, you  
2 know, trial and error. If I do join this community, is this a  
3 good fit for me? Do I feel like I belong here? Is this what's  
4 going to make me feel like I'm included and part of something?  
5 So some trial and error by the client is necessary. And then  
6 often support to encourage people to keep actively thinking  
7 about these things.

8 **Q.** You indicated that Lionel Desmond, as well, had  
9 dependent personality traits. What are "dependent personality  
10 traits" and what were the ones that Lionel Desmond had?

11 **A.** So I think that one, I put even some more limited  
12 observations. This was based on some observations that I made  
13 of Mr. Desmond where he ... I'm struggling to think of the exact  
14 situation, but I believe it was his case manager had either  
15 taken a little bit of time or said that she wasn't able to help  
16 him do something. And I do remember thinking, This seems like a  
17 little bit outside of the purview of a case manager. And he was  
18 very, very upset that this wasn't being done for him. I believe  
19 it was by his case manager. And so we had a discussion around  
20 that and I think what emerged was really the sense that he felt  
21 very abandoned when people wouldn't do these things for him and  
22 I think underprepared or underqualified to make some of these



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 decisions or take some of these actions by himself.

2 **(12:00)**

3 So when we talk about some dependent personality traits ...  
4 so again, I'm not diagnosing him with a definite personality  
5 disorder, but some traits might be expectations that other  
6 people take on some kind of everyday life responsibilities for  
7 us and some very significant frustration when that doesn't  
8 happen.

9 **Q.** Do you get a sense of how that would play out when he  
10 left Ste. Anne's and went into the community? What are some  
11 potential pitfalls for him having such dependent personality  
12 traits when he enters the community?

13 **A.** Mm-hmm. Again, limited observations, I just want to  
14 highlight that, but certainly probably continued frustrations if  
15 he felt his needs weren't being met.

16 **Q.** And how would you go about working on those?

17 **A.** So careful titration of trying to encourage people to  
18 see their abilities, building up competencies, and really making  
19 sure that people maintain that sense of autonomy and agency in  
20 making their own decision. I think that when there is that  
21 consideration that there might be some dependency, you really  
22 want to be careful not to have somebody become overreliant on

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 services or overreliant on people making life decisions for you.

2 And so for instance, you know, when Mr. Desmond was talking  
3 about moving back home, we were careful to try to make sure that  
4 he knew what some of those challenges and obstacles might be as  
5 to access to care, as to potential conflict with his in-laws or  
6 his spouse, and to make sure that he considered all options.  
7 But in order to respect people's right to autonomy and agency,  
8 we would certainly never say to somebody, This is what you  
9 should do, this is the right decision because, again, the risk  
10 for somebody that does have potentially some dependent traits  
11 would be that they kind of relinquish that autonomy.

12 **Q.** What sort of insight did he appear to have when it  
13 came to weighing options that he's been told about and  
14 considering options, and how did that interact with his  
15 rigidity?

16 **A.** So difficulties weighing options. I think that  
17 towards the end of the stay, there was a little bit more  
18 flexibility in the sense that I think there had been some  
19 conflict either with his family or his spouse and we could  
20 think, okay, well that might be difficult. So I think that  
21 opened up a little space for him to think, you know, Where could  
22 I stay? What might be possibilities if and when I return back

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 home. But it was difficult because when he did have an idea in  
2 mind of, you know, If I get there, then maybe things will be  
3 better, there was a lot of attachment to that idea.

4 Q. I'm going to ask you a little bit about ... and in  
5 your words, you put in here, "Possibility of brain trauma." So  
6 it's fair to say that you spent considerable time with Lionel  
7 Desmond in those months that he was at the clinic?

8 A. Yes, that's fair to say.

9 Q. And the second paragraph on page 304, you do say:  
10 "Given the interactions of these different factors and because  
11 of the potential input of brain trauma, we hesitate to provide a  
12 definitive diagnosis. (You go on to say) ... led us to  
13 determine the necessity of clarifying Mr. Desmond's  
14 neuropsychological state before elaborating (on) an evaluation  
15 of the client's clinical profile." And you say: "The reports  
16 of several incidents involving head and neck injuries further  
17 supports this course of action."

18 So with that, what was it about your ... first, what was it  
19 about your observations of Lionel Desmond that you thought might  
20 be consistent with brain trauma?

21 A. So this would be ... when I say assimilating  
22 information, this would be, you know, I would suggest a course

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 of action. We would practice something in session and you would  
2 come back the next session. And there would be very little ...  
3 again, assimilation would be, I've taken it and I've thought  
4 about it. I now know kind of in my context how I might use  
5 that. Not necessarily perfect from one session to the other,  
6 but there was very little. Less than I'm usually expecting to  
7 see.

8 Planning future events. Again, it was difficult for him  
9 when he was planning something, you know, saying, What might go  
10 wrong? What might be some of my obstacles? If that does go  
11 wrong, what could I then do to try to address a situation? Do I  
12 have a plan B? You know, is this going to be a good fit for me.  
13 Have I kind of practiced in my head what that might look like?  
14 So that kind of future planning, a little bit difficult.

15 Interrupting ongoing speech and actions. So that was when  
16 he would discuss something that was a little bit more  
17 emotionally activating, he would often kind of repeat the same  
18 sentences over and over and over, or kind of tell me the story,  
19 the same story, two times in a row. And I would point this out  
20 to him because we did have an agreement that I would interrupt  
21 him and try to kind of refocus some discussions. And he would  
22 look like he felt compelled to complete his story nevertheless.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 So that raised some questions.

2 And so those are some of the things that I observed that  
3 made me wonder is this within the trauma portrait or are we  
4 talking about some cognitive deficits more specifically?

5 **Q.** What about something as simple, and I'm sure I'll  
6 stumble across it this afternoon, but I remember, there was a  
7 passage somewhere in your report about him interchangeably using  
8 the wrong words.

9 **A.** Mm-hmm.

10 **Q.** So maybe if he was saying, I went for a ride in my ...  
11 and I'm guilty of saying this, I went for a ride in my guitar,  
12 instead of car. Were there examples where he struggled with  
13 language and getting passages mixed up or words and terms mixed  
14 up?

15 **A.** So words mixed up, so not car/guitar, that would be  
16 too far. But something like a rock bed for a rock. So you  
17 know, this is not the exact expression that he used, but it  
18 would be something along the lines of, instead of saying, She's  
19 my rock, he would say something like, She's my rock bed.

20 So I didn't note it as prominent in this section because it  
21 might just be a question of vocabulary or getting the expression  
22 wrong. It happened enough for me to note it somewhere else in

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 the report, to think, is this something a bit different? But  
2 not enough that I thought it was one of the key features.

3 Q. Okay. And so ultimately, your provisional diagnosis  
4 is what?

5 A. So provisional diagnostic impressions would be, (1)  
6 post-traumatic stress disorder, and (2) borderline personality  
7 trait.

8 Q. Okay. And you had come up with an intervention plan  
9 and we talked about a lot of things but what were the main three  
10 items on the intervention plan that was going to happen at Ste.  
11 Anne's?

12 A. So most of these, because I felt that some of the key  
13 struggles of Mr. Desmond were related to emotional regulation  
14 and, therefore, of problematic interactions of his environment -  
15 obviously, we're not interacting optimally if we are feeling  
16 very angry - my first priority was developing emotional  
17 regulation skills. So one, by modeling. So in session, I would  
18 model things that I might use if I was feeling upset. So, you  
19 know, I might do some deep breathing. I might, you know, take  
20 some time and reflect on why this is bothering me and so on and  
21 so forth. And then because he was having trouble assimilating  
22 some of these interventions, I used the device which is called a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 coping card which I sometimes use when individuals who do  
2 struggle to remember to use these tactics, which would be just a  
3 small piece of paper that somebody could carry with them that  
4 would give them kind of instructions on, Okay, regulate, breathe  
5 deeply now, recognize signs that you are becoming kind of  
6 emotionally dysregulated, and then try to take some time to  
7 formulate your thoughts, right? I think that was ... he would  
8 say he would have difficulties with communication, so that links  
9 with number two which would be more effective communication  
10 skills through role playing. So when he would be angry in  
11 session, we would have a long discussion about what was going  
12 on, what was his perception. If he were to try to discuss this  
13 with somebody else, what could he say to express why this was  
14 upsetting to him and how he felt this was perhaps taking  
15 advantage of him? And then when he would go into rumination, I  
16 would think, okay, well, you're repeating the same information.  
17 You're not discovering new information by discussing this with  
18 somebody. And so we would practice that. And then number three  
19 would be maintaining satisfying activities even when distress is  
20 experienced.

21 **(12:10)**

22 So one of the things that I observed during my session is

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 when an external stressor would happen, Mr. Desmond would kind  
2 of drop everything, all his self-care strategies, to kind of  
3 address his problem, which would leave him often feeling tired,  
4 sad, unsatisfied, and stressed. So I would say, Even if you  
5 spend all day completely focussed on solving this - for  
6 instance, I need a new job issue - you're not going to find a  
7 job in one day. So, you know, if you want to focus on this  
8 external stressor, that's fine, but then maintain your focus.  
9 Eat your meals. Work out. Communicate with loved ones. And  
10 then allocate two, three hours of your time where you are going  
11 to do something productive like, I'm going to work on my CV.  
12 I'm going to see if I have different skills. Where might I be  
13 employed?

14 So that kind of balance of having a structured kind of  
15 daily routine and maintaining those satisfying activities even  
16 when external stressors intrude. But this is a little bit part  
17 and parcel of emotional regulation.

18 **Q.** Did he have any success with that while at Ste.  
19 Anne's?

20 **A.** Some. I think that he really saw the benefits of,  
21 especially physical activity. You know, he really could see  
22 how, you know, yoga was helpful for him. When he was having a



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 stressful day, he did tend to go and, you know, play guitar.  
2 Some of these things. So I think that, there, he had some  
3 success and I believe he did express to me the idea that he  
4 would try to maintain things in place.

5 **Q.** Do you think that he benefitted from sort of a  
6 prearranged structure where, you know, he has yoga class, he has  
7 cycling, he has art therapy. Did he benefit from that sort of  
8 daily structure?

9 **A.** Yes. I think that most people who struggle with  
10 mental health ... actually, I think most people benefit from  
11 having kind of a structure and a routine they can follow. I  
12 think, in Mr. Desmond's case, having somebody organize that  
13 structure for him seemed to facilitate things, at least in the  
14 immediate.

15 **Q.** So I get from that it might've been a bit of a  
16 challenge for him to put all those parts together and maintain  
17 them, but if somebody was there to assist him, it would've been  
18 helpful.

19 **A.** Again, being very careful not to try to overstep our  
20 bounds as mental health providers where we're not telling people  
21 what they should be doing with their day, but just encouraging  
22 them to, you know, remember, What did you do with your day?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Let's keep an eye on this and monitor it together and see, you  
2 know, did you have different activities during your day? Did  
3 you solely focus on this problem that's giving you a lot of  
4 stress?

5 **Q.** So when he left Ste. Anne's, and you talked about he  
6 did very much appear to benefit from the structure, would he  
7 have benefitted from someone to assist him in continuing that  
8 sort of structure while in the community? Is that something you  
9 envisioned as a positive?

10 **A.** Well, who are you thinking about?

11 **Q.** I guess just in general. You saw him benefit from a  
12 structured organization and somebody helping him organize that  
13 in Ste. Anne's. Would there be a benefit to having that in a  
14 community setting after he left?

15 **A.** To a certain extent. So for instance, if I'm  
16 following somebody in psychotherapy, that might be, you know,  
17 one of the things that we touch on, but I think that there are  
18 multiple things that you can do that's just ... I want to avoid  
19 overfocussing on mental health as well because that wouldn't be  
20 ... I wouldn't necessarily want to assign somebody to structure  
21 somebody's day, but certainly, I, you know, would suggest ... I  
22 think one of my recommendations was for him to, you know, join

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 some kind of club where he could enjoy activities with people  
2 but maybe, you know, separate but together, right? Like  
3 cycling, right? Reducing the risk of a conflict, but having  
4 some of that socialization, right?

5 Having an external demand on your time like somebody  
6 expecting you to show up to a prearranged meeting, that's kind  
7 of imposing a little bit of external structure on your everyday.  
8 Sharing with your spouse your intention of working out every  
9 morning increases the chance that you're actually going to  
10 follow through.

11 So there are many ways of trying to impose a little bit  
12 more structure on our daily lives, which are helpful, but not  
13 necessarily limited to mental health professionals.

14 **Q.** Page 305 and 306 appears to be a ... it's called  
15 "Closing Note".

16 **A.** That's right.

17 **Q.** And at page 306, it's dated December 27, 2016. So  
18 this report is prepared by you, is that correct?

19 **A.** That's right.

20 **Q.** And it was prepared December 27, 2016?

21 **A.** So the closing note doesn't mean I saw the client.

22 The closing note is the last piece of information that I sign to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 say that I'm now closing this file.

2 Q. So the last work, I guess, or last document you  
3 would've produced as it relates to Lionel Desmond would've been  
4 on December 27th?

5 A. That's right. That's right.

6 Q. Is there a particular reason why - he left Ste. Anne's  
7 August 15th - that you're still working on a closing note months  
8 later at December 27th?

9 A. So that would be the same reason that I explained for  
10 the psychodiagnostic assessment. That's the piece that I worked  
11 on extensively, and as I mentioned, I wanted to get the  
12 formulation right. And then when I finished that assessment  
13 report, that's when I could produce that closing note. So my  
14 closing note was dependent on the report.

15 Q. And in this closing note, you ... under "Observed  
16 Changes" which are in the middle of the page, what were some of  
17 the positive observed changes you noted in Lionel Desmond during  
18 his course at Ste. Anne's?

19 A. So again, when in session, he was showing some anger  
20 and we encouraged him to try to look at other options, to try to  
21 share with us why some of these things were upsetting to him,  
22 then we could really observe him regulating emotions which was a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 positive thing to see. But as mentioned here, doing that by  
2 himself, without somebody to really encourage him to do that,  
3 still remained a challenge. And the coping card had limited  
4 effectiveness because I think that he began to see it ... when  
5 we would encourage him to use it, he began to see it almost in  
6 an accusatory way, you know? This is for you to manage, as  
7 opposed to, this situation is genuinely stressful, which the two  
8 are not mutually exclusive.

9       And then what else did I note? I think I mentioned that he  
10 was able to recognize that some of his interpersonal behaviours  
11 were being ... were damaging. That was something that he  
12 struggled with throughout treatment as well, seeing that having  
13 an angry, non-verbal behaviour could definitely be distressing  
14 to other people. That was something that he mentioned.

15       However, as I think I detailed a little bit more in my  
16 individual notes, towards the end of his stay at Ste. Anne's, I  
17 think, through a combination of factors, I think he began to  
18 lose that trust in the treatment team and use a bit more  
19 isolation. So, you know, very limited treatment gains.

20       Q.     And that's what I wanted to ask you about because you  
21 noted that towards the end, you said, "He expresses growing  
22 doubts about the intentions of the treatment team which led to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 increased distrust and isolation."

2       **A.** Mm-hmm.

3       **Q.** So it appears as though he's kind of turned against  
4 the treatment team, I guess, in many ways. Was that a concern  
5 to you and why?

6       **A.** Well, so this is one of the reasons or one of the  
7 factors that might support the presence of borderline  
8 personality traits. This is something called "splitting", which  
9 happens a lot with people who have issues with borderline  
10 personality traits. And it's really that flip of the switch  
11 between, I am getting along with somebody. I think you're  
12 great. Thank you for trying to help me, until something  
13 negative happens and there is not that nuanced view of people as  
14 being fallible and saying things that might be hurtful without  
15 having negative intentions sometimes. And so that complete  
16 switch to a very negative perception is really one of the  
17 typical observations that we tend to make with people who have  
18 borderline personality traits.

19       So it wasn't concerning to me in the sense that it wasn't  
20 completely unexplained and out of character with some of the  
21 other observations that I had made in the time that he was at  
22 Ste. Anne's. It was unfortunate in the sense that I felt that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 it might make him disregard some of the things that he had  
2 learned while at Ste. Anne's. Was that the case? I can't be  
3 sure because he was more and more guarded.

4 **Q.** So there's a natural, as you indicated, concern that  
5 he might disregard some of the things that you tried to help him  
6 with, but obviously, it was clear, would you say, that Lionel  
7 Desmond's continuity of care was going to continue after he left  
8 Ste. Anne's?

9 **A.** So the process, the usual process, that happened is an  
10 external team sends us a referral to say, We are having  
11 difficulties in this, this, and this field. Could you provide  
12 this intervention? We receive the member, we provide  
13 intervention, we provide feedback and recommendation to the  
14 original treatment team. I have very limited information, but  
15 from my understanding, this was partly disrupted by the member's  
16 move. The expectation was that we would follow this normal  
17 process but I'm not sure if that's what happened.

18 **(12:20)**

19 **Q.** And I want to ask you a little bit about, is it fair  
20 to say, when Lionel Desmond left Ste. Anne's, he had this  
21 perception of distrust about mental health clinicians in the  
22 Ste. Anne's context?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.** I'm not sure if it was absolute, but certainly we  
2 noticed some signs that that was present, yes.

3           **Q.** Is there a strong chance that when he would encounter  
4 a further mental health professional at the next phase in the  
5 community or in the ER setting or in his general practitioner's  
6 office in his community, that this sense of distrust may  
7 continue?

8           **A.** Not necessarily. Again, my observations for  
9 borderline personality traits were tentative, so I always want  
10 to stress that. However, if that same pattern of kind of  
11 idealization and then devaluation were followed, what does tend  
12 to happen in people who have those personality traits is that  
13 the next kind of provider would then be kind of overvalued and  
14 seen as very helpful and there would be kind of a strong kind of  
15 connection initially, but then potentially again followed by  
16 this pattern of devaluation. This flipping back and forth again  
17 is one of the key characteristics of people who have borderline  
18 personality traits.

19           **Q.** Is it possible that the opposite could occur where  
20 rather than overvalue the ER psychiatrist, he could perceive  
21 them as another healthcare professional that he shouldn't trust?

22           **A.** If you're asking me if this is possible, I can hardly



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 say this is impossible. Sure, this could be something that  
2 could occur. And this, you know, this splitting, this, you  
3 know, idolization devaluing, is a tendency. It's not set in  
4 stone.

5 Q. Okay. At this point, Your Honour, I was going to turn  
6 to highlights of the various sessions with the doctor. I can  
7 begin or we can break now and in the afternoon, we can deal with  
8 the individual sessions.

9 **THE COURT:** Perhaps we could break now. Doctor, we  
10 would normally break at 12:30, which I appreciate is 11:30 your  
11 time. We generally break for an hour for lunch, so I think that  
12 that's what we'll do this afternoon.

13 We would like to be able to re-establish the connection  
14 with you if we could, and maybe we'll break until it'll be 12:30  
15 your time, and maybe sometime about 12:20 or thereabouts, if you  
16 could be close to your computer, we'll try and re-establish the  
17 link.

18 A. That's perfectly fine. I don't mean to get into  
19 technical detail. If that's perfectly fine, I'll just mute my  
20 microphone and turn off my camera and that way, we won't lose  
21 the link at all.

22 Q. That would be just fine. Thank you very much.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    In that case, I'll be back at 12:20, Your Honour.

2           **Q.**    All right. Thank you very much, Doctor. So we'll  
3 adjourn till 1:20.

4   **COURT RECESSED (12:23 HRS)**

5   **COURT RESUMED (13:29 HRS)**

6           **THE COURT:**    Thank you.

7           **MR. RUSSELL:**    Thank you, Your Honour.

8           **THE COURT:**    Mr. Russell?

9           **A.**    I apologize, I'm not sure if anybody can hear me but I  
10 don't have audio.

11           **THE COURT:**    We can hear you just fine.

12           **A.**    Now it's fine.

13           **THE COURT:**    All right. Thank you. Mr. Russell?

14           **MR. RUSSELL:**    Good afternoon, Dr. Gagnon.

15           **A.**    Good afternoon.

16           **Q.**    So my plan, I guess, going forward this afternoon is  
17 to sort of hit some highlights of your various sessions with  
18 Lionel Desmond, so we'll be moving around a little bit in the  
19 record.

20           **A.**    Okay.

21           **Q.**    So page 275 of Exhibit 254. So I note that this was  
22 May 31st, 2016, and it's titled "Initial Assessment". In this

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 particular initial assessment, approximately four lines down you  
2 make a note. You said: "He also indicates being preoccupied  
3 with his conjugal and familial status. He details the  
4 difficulties in his marriage and the effect they have on his  
5 daughter."

6 So at the very outset of your first meeting with Lionel  
7 Desmond he's talking about the struggles he's having within his  
8 relationship?

9 **A.** That's right, yes.

10 **Q.** And do you recall what it was ... the effects it was  
11 having on his daughter? What he was referring to? What was  
12 affecting his daughter?

13 **A.** I think ... from memory, I think he was concerned that  
14 seeing arguments just wasn't contributing to having a good  
15 dynamic in the family, from memory.

16 **Q.** You also noted that: "He makes reference to Facebook  
17 messages that he had and texts that lead him to feel worse from  
18 his wife." Do you recall what that was about?

19 **A.** I don't recall what the content was, I do recall that  
20 that's one of the difficulties of communication that we  
21 identified. That there was a lot of room for interpretation  
22 with written communication and that he would tend to interpret

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 them in ways that made him feel like the relationship was in  
2 danger or that she was criticizing him. I have, again, some  
3 vague memories of the specific nature.

4 **Q.** Did you get a sense that those texting and the  
5 messages were happening while he was at the clinic in Ste.  
6 Anne's?

7 **A.** I don't recall.

8 **Q.** And I'm going to turn to you, you indicate as it  
9 relates to cannabis, again the middle of the page, you said:  
10 "He indicates taking cannabis makes him feel uncomfortable and  
11 that he feels pressure from the group providing this drug,  
12 marijuana, for trauma."

13 What did he feel uncomfortable about as it relates to  
14 cannabis?

15 **A.** So I, again, have some memories of this interaction.  
16 So from what I remember he had tried cannabis to see if it would  
17 alleviate some of his symptoms and he said it did not. And then  
18 he reported he had experienced some negative effects from  
19 cannabis use; I think I recall it was increased anxiety. And  
20 that he had reported that he had felt worse while using cannabis  
21 to the members of this group, Marijuana for Trauma, and again he  
22 reported to me that he had been told to be quiet about these

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 negative effects; that he shouldn't tell other people because it  
2 would give people a negative perception of cannabis.

3 Q. And he talked about feeling sort of pressure as a  
4 result of that?

5 A. Mm-hmm.

6 Q. And finally, what were your general observations of  
7 Lionel Desmond in terms of his affect, his outward signs, his  
8 speech during this first session?

9 A. So in my observations, as you can read, he did appear  
10 tired, which is not uncommon with people when they first arrive  
11 at the unit, it is a big change and there's a lot of adaptation  
12 to do to this new environment. So some tiredness, some  
13 tangential patterns of speech that I observed throughout my  
14 meetings with him, and then some mild agitation when he starts  
15 to go into deployment events, but if I'm not mistaken we quickly  
16 veered away from that. So those were my observations.

17 Q. So if we turn to page 277, this is your second session  
18 or scheduled session with Lionel Desmond a week later, June 7th.  
19 My understanding is Lionel Desmond does not show up for this  
20 appointment?

21 A. That's right.

22 Q. And was there an explanation or some sort of context

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 as to where he was and why he didn't appear?

2 **A.** So that was addressed the next session when he was  
3 late for the next session.

4 **Q.** So my understanding is he didn't attend the session.  
5 He actually left the unit without noting his departure?

6 **A.** Yes. So normally we would ask for people to let us  
7 know when they were leaving the unit. I believe mostly for the  
8 stabilization phase. So he had left the unit. I'm not even  
9 sure if I specified what he was up to. It might have been to  
10 something just as simple as taking a walk. There was nothing  
11 specifically worrying about this, just he wasn't following  
12 procedure.

13 **Q.** And at the next ... if we turn to page 278, and this  
14 is about a week later again, June 13, it's a 55-minute session.  
15 What do you note about his attendance at this session?

16 **A.** So the way we'd work at Ste. Anne's is there was a  
17 board with all the appointments. I believe I came to meet up  
18 with him at the board for his scheduled session and he wasn't  
19 there, so we spent some time trying to contact him. I think we  
20 asked other participants where he were and found out he was  
21 playing pool, so a nurse actually managed to track him down. So  
22 he arrived late, he apologized, and just stated that he was

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 confused.

2 But since this was the second in this type of pattern that  
3 I addressed it with him, and I asked him to consider if this  
4 might be attempts to not having discussions around subjects  
5 which were upsetting to him.

6 **Q.** So in looking back in the global context of all your  
7 appointments with Lionel Desmond would you say, you know, this  
8 is two out of three times now - one he missed, one they had to  
9 go get him to bring him there - was this sort of an example of  
10 the avoidance you were talking about?

11 **A.** Again, multiple potential explanations for this kind  
12 of pattern? What I would say is it was potentially a  
13 combination of avoidance and difficulties with organization.

14 **Q.** And I understand in this session it's brought up the  
15 context of sort of his obsessive cleaning of the house and the  
16 effect it might have been having on himself and his  
17 relationship. I wonder if you could tell us a little bit about  
18 that?

19 **A.** So when I did start to discuss the tendency that a lot  
20 of people have to distract ourselves from upsetting emotions or  
21 to want to avoid situations where we have to deal with difficult  
22 emotions, I asked him if this resonated with him at all. If he

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 could think of anything else he was doing to try to avoid  
2 emotions. And this is something that he himself identified that  
3 he would do and that he was aware that he was doing it to try to  
4 keep his mind busy.

5 **Q.** And you also note at this session, you say: "When  
6 discussing fictitious situations, the client consistently  
7 generates catastrophic thoughts."

8 What was happening here at this session and what were the  
9 catastrophic thoughts?

10 **A.** So just as a little bit of extra detail. When I say  
11 "catastrophic" that's a term that's used often in cognitive  
12 behavioural therapy, and I apologize, that's a difficult word  
13 for me to pronounce in English. Catastrophization is a tendency  
14 that people have when they think of an obstacle or a problem to  
15 go to the worst potential outcome or consequence of something  
16 that may initially be benign. So I can't recall the specific  
17 scenarios that we were discussing.

18 I note it down this way so that I would know that this is a  
19 potentially an emerging pattern in his way of thinking about  
20 situations. So it's a start with, say, my spouse has sent me an  
21 email ... and again, this is purely fictitious scenario. My  
22 wife sends me an email saying, you know, you left with this



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 piece of documentation that I needed to sell the house, and then  
2 he would immediately go to it's terrible, we'll never be able to  
3 sell this house, I'm going to be in trouble financially and so  
4 on and so forth to really, you know, terrible outcomes. So  
5 that's what I meant by that line.

6 **Q.** So was it sort of a frequent theme that he would, in  
7 face of a stressor, resort to the thoughts of the worst possible  
8 outcome?

9 **A.** Certainly if not the worst possible outcome then  
10 thinking that a benign or a small situation could get worse.  
11 That would be his kind of assumption. And the same thing goes  
12 with interaction with people. So as part of a larger pattern,  
13 his interactions with people if they were neutral or even  
14 slightly conflictual, he would assume that meant they were  
15 against him in a very general way.

16 **(13:40)**

17 **Q.** Was he ever able to sort of get that under control to  
18 some extent, that sort of worst-case scenario thinking?

19 **A.** I think the best that I could say that I observed was  
20 beginning to understand that this was a pattern, which is an  
21 important step in the process, but only some small steps in that  
22 direction.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    There's a line here as well in the middle of the page,  
2 it says: "The client states he would like to be able to better  
3 express his needs in his romantic relationship and to reduce the  
4 frequency of aggressive thoughts." Were they connected, his  
5 relationship and aggressive thoughts?

6           **A.**    If I try to remember what this is related to I believe  
7 that it was related to his tendency to leave interactions when  
8 they got conflictual, because he was scared he would break  
9 things, throw things and yell and damage his relationship and,  
10 therefore, never really got to actually have a conversation  
11 about the things that were legitimately bothering him.

12          **Q.**    And what was the reason why he never got to have those  
13 conversations as to what was actually bothering him?

14          **A.**    Because he would leave the situation to avoid some of  
15 those aggressive behaviours that he described in the past.

16          **Q.**    Did he say what those aggressive thoughts were? Did  
17 he give you an insight as to what it was?

18          **A.**    He might have at the moment but since I didn't note it  
19 down I can't be sure today.

20          **Q.**    Okay. If we turn to page 279, this is the fourth  
21 session, June 20th, and it's still titled "Initial Assessment".  
22 Is there a reason why it's still called ... you're at the fourth

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 session, is there a reason why it's still called "Initial  
2 Assessment"?

3 **A.** That would just be in the context of having trouble  
4 gathering information; still having a developing idea of what  
5 was troubling the client. So four sessions is not something I  
6 would consider unreasonable if it's hard to get a read on what's  
7 going on with the client, just to keep gathering information.

8 **Q.** So I understand from a clinical standpoint, with  
9 Lionel Desmond it's taking a few recurring sessions to get this  
10 even off the ground so you can begin to understand what his  
11 portrait is?

12 **A.** That would be accurate, yes.

13 **Q.** And do you need to get this information before you  
14 really get to the root of how to treat the problems?

15 **A.** Part of the work at Ste. Anne's is really focussed on  
16 stabilization so there's no reason that these two processes  
17 can't happen in parallel, both beginning to try to put in place  
18 some basic structure to routine, some self-care, all of these  
19 things are pretty much recommended for all our incoming  
20 participants. So parallel processes of beginning care and  
21 continued assessment are not unreasonable.

22 **Q.** So we're almost a month in to his time at Ste. Anne's

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 and you note that he feels trapped. "Mr. Desmond indicates he's  
2 aware of his racing thoughts and that he feels trapped in a  
3 cycle of thoughts when an external event preoccupies him."

4 What is going on there?

5 **A.** So this is what we had previously discussed when we  
6 were looking at the assessment that I conducted, this tendency  
7 when an external stressor would occur to focus all his time and  
8 attention and to have all these kind of fictitious scenarios  
9 when things go terribly wrong when these external stressors  
10 happen. So this is what he was describing to me at that time.

11 **Q.** During the session, Lionel Desmond discloses to you,  
12 he describes himself as "a loose cannon", that's his term. In  
13 what context was that provided?

14 **A.** I can't recall today.

15 **Q.** Does that sort of comment prompt you to explore sort  
16 of risk for violence or ...

17 **A.** Mm-hmm. So that's right, I think it was in a  
18 constellation of things. A few comments he had made about  
19 aggressive thoughts. His difficulties expressing his needs when  
20 anger is present. So this would be things that in a fairly  
21 standard manner would have me, you know, checking what the  
22 potential for violence is.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**   And I understand that he then, upon prompting, said he  
2 had no violent intentions towards any particular individual at  
3 the time?

4           **A.**   Mm-hmm. So intent would be one of the things that we  
5 check, which he did not report to me. But then also other  
6 factors where it's not necessarily planned and intended but  
7 through more impulsive risk could also be present and so that's  
8 the rest of the questions that I asked.

9           **Q.**   And you talk about sort of you observed a history of  
10 impulsive actions where Lionel Desmond acts impulsively. What  
11 are some examples of that impulsive conduct?

12          **A.**   So driving under the influence. I think there was  
13 some general spending. What else did he report to me for  
14 impulsivity? I think that one of the things that also spoke to  
15 me was I believe that when he entered the program he had not  
16 spoken to us about moving or selling his home but now it was a  
17 priority.

18          So these kind of rapidly shifting goals where, you know, he  
19 had decided this was now the right move and he had to act on it  
20 right away, so that kind of impulsive decision-taking I think  
21 that's one of the things that was contributing to my mentioning  
22 impulsivity.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.** Did he continue to sort of show signs of impulsivity  
2 up to the moment he left Ste. Anne's?

3           **A.** If by "impulsivity" we mean having difficulties  
4 stopping himself when he was, you know, angry, so displaying  
5 frustration. So in groups he would make comments without  
6 necessarily taking the time to think is this relevant, is this  
7 going to be hurtful to somebody else, so that kind of moderate  
8 signs of impulsivity.

9           **Q.** What do you think was getting sort of in the way of  
10 him being able to sort of take a step back when faced with a  
11 frustrating scenario, take a step back and say, I'm going to  
12 gather myself, collect myself, I won't be so reactionary or  
13 impulsive?

14           **A.** Mm-hmm. Again, I think that's multiple factors really  
15 having an influence on this ability to take a step back. Always  
16 harping on the same subject, but definitely emotional regulation  
17 is one of these skills which allow us to engage our pre-frontal  
18 cortex to have that capacity to think about potential  
19 consequences, to think about what might be the optimal scenario,  
20 what actions I should take now to have the best outcome, and  
21 it's really difficult to do that when we're in this very highly  
22 emotionally activated state. So that could be one factor.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           And then as I also mentioned, during the assessment I did  
2           want to check if there was a more, you know, physical  
3           potentially contribution to having some of those difficulties.

4           **Q.**    You touched on this earlier, but you noted in your  
5           report that he expressed to you during this session that he felt  
6           abandoned by his Veterans Affairs case manager. Right at the  
7           bottom of the page under "Interventions".

8           **A.**    Yes. So I can't remember what the incident was that  
9           prompted the member to feel abandoned by his case worker, that  
10          was the feelings that he reported to me. Oh, never mind ...

11          **Q.**    You talk ... sorry.

12          **A.**    ... it's written there. "Reasons for reported delays  
13          in call back." So he felt that his case manager had taken too  
14          long to get back to him.

15          **Q.**    Did he ever express to you any other points in time  
16          where he felt frustrated with Veterans Affairs for whatever  
17          reason, do you recall?

18          **A.**    He might but I can't think about specific examples  
19          today.

20          **Q.**    And how did he seem to be reacting to this, you said  
21          ... I guess you noted as "feeling abandoned", you didn't note it  
22          as he was frustrated or disappointed that he didn't get a call-

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 back. Is it fair to say "feeling abandoned" seemed to be more  
2 of significance?

3 **(13:50)**

4 **A.** Certainly it seemed like a pretty strong reaction.

5 **Q.** So you make observations at this session in relation  
6 to his upcoming family visit and medication. What were sort of  
7 the observations you made regarding those two aspects?

8 **A.** So changing his medication was something that he  
9 thought was difficult. I think he had some misgivings about  
10 potential side effects. And then I think that just he was very  
11 anxious for his interactions with his family members to be  
12 positive, and I think that was the source of a little bit of his  
13 worry.

14 **Q.** And since I see it here, earlier on we talked about  
15 that sort of word substitution ...

16 **A.** Mm-hmm.

17 **Q.** ... and you were trying to think of the exact examples  
18 and I believe you said "rock" and "rock bed". What were the  
19 other examples that you noted?

20 **A.** So on there I noted "allocation" for "altercation",  
21 "focal" for "focus". So they're not big variations, so they  
22 could be accounted for just by mistakes in vocabulary. But just



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 in this session I noted three which seemed significant enough  
2 for me to wonder if this might be some difficulty ... more  
3 cognitive difficulty.

4 Q. If we could turn to page 281, this is the fifth  
5 session, June 28th. There's an indication here we're a month  
6 into the program and ... so I guess to begin, is this the first  
7 session after Lionel Desmond has a visit from Shanna and his  
8 daughter?

9 A. I believe so.

10 Q. And how did that visit go? Did he report back to you  
11 as to how he felt about that visit, how things were going?

12 A. So he did say that he was happy to see his family but  
13 I think also ... I'm not sure what interaction with his family  
14 caused this to be a concern for him, but I think that he felt  
15 that there might be some pressure for him to find a job, to kind  
16 of go back to being in the workforce and so that had become a  
17 real focus for him.

18 Q. Was this the first time that it came up that he's now  
19 talking about he is ... now feels pressure to find a new job?

20 A. I believe that was the first time it came up in our  
21 sessions, yes.

22 Q. So did it appear to you as though he was able to focus

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 on some of the positive aspects of the relationship with Shanna  
2 and Aaliyah who visited him that weekend or was he now turned to  
3 the, again, worst-case scenario thinking and talking about all  
4 the stressors of getting that relationship back together?

5 **A.** I think that there was a little bit of enjoyment but  
6 that that quickly transitioned to him being focussed on this  
7 external stressor and this perceived demand on his time that he  
8 deal with this new job that he wanted to find.

9 **Q.** In terms of his ... it's at this session that he talks  
10 a little bit about his early childhood experiences.

11 **A.** Mm-hmm.

12 **Q.** What sort of information were you provided? We don't  
13 have a whole lot of information about him as a child but what  
14 sort of information are you provided with at this session?

15 **A.** So, again, he described to me feeling rejected by his  
16 peers. I put a little bit more detail in his report as to the  
17 reasons why he might have felt rejected. He also said that he  
18 felt he had to become self-reliant fairly quickly because he was  
19 in a single-parent family and, therefore, presumably a lot of  
20 demands on that single parent.

21 And then he did also say that he hadn't learned as a child  
22 to necessarily express his needs and to be a little bit more

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 affirmative about the things he needed and wanted because he was  
2 a quiet child and, yeah, so as a childhood that's what he had  
3 reported to me.

4 **Q.** Under "Interventions" the last sort of three words you  
5 have it noted as "an emotionally-charged session."

6 **A.** Mm-hmm.

7 **Q.** What was it about this session that was "emotionally  
8 charged"?

9 **A.** As you can tell by the session, there was quite a bit  
10 covered in there and there was a lot of jumping around from  
11 pretty actually emotionally-charged subjects. So his family's  
12 visit and that pressure he felt to find a job, his childhood and  
13 some of the rejection he felt there, and then some descriptions  
14 of his experiences in the military and how he felt that he felt  
15 like an outsider from his unit. So a lot of strong emotions,  
16 experienced by the member during the session. So that's what I  
17 meant by "emotionally charged".

18 **Q.** How was he reacting to actually you sort of opening  
19 those wounds, I guess, and examining those sensitive areas?

20 **A.** So in my observations I also noted that there was a  
21 lot of use of imagery and so that was something that came around  
22 a lot and sometimes they were used to try to explain things and

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 it was difficult to get a little bit more precise.

2 You know, he might say something like. I'm a leaf in a  
3 stream and I've got to ride the waves when I was trying to get a  
4 sense of how he was feeling about things. So he definitely  
5 didn't shut those doors, because I would have respected that,  
6 but it certainly seemed to be difficult for him to talk about  
7 these things.

8 Q. And I note that this is the fifth session and you  
9 still have it noted as "Initial Assessment".

10 A. Mm-hmm, that's right.

11 Q. And is that for the same purpose of you're still at  
12 the stage of really trying to gather up ...

13 A. Mm-hmm. Mm-hmm.

14 Q. ... examine that iceberg which is Lionel Desmond, I  
15 guess?

16 A. Mm-hmm. Mm-hmm. Which, I think, was probably very  
17 helpful because I think it was this session where he gave me a  
18 little bit more information about his childhood, yeah.

19 Q. And was he such that it would require multiple  
20 sessions to really get to that information, you couldn't gather  
21 this after one or two meetings? Is that fair?

22 A. Mm-hmm. I think that yeah, for multiple reasons, one

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 of them being some of his reticence and just generally having a  
2 better therapeutic relationship would probably allow to open  
3 those doors a little bit easier and with potentially a little  
4 bit less distress for the member.

5 **Q.** If we could turn to page 282. This document is titled  
6 "Psychological Consultation". What was this? Who did you  
7 consult with and what was the purpose behind having this  
8 consultation which appears to be June 22nd?

9 **A.** So I believe that this meeting happened because Mr.  
10 Desmond had a meeting with Dr. Ouellette in which he was really  
11 reticent about changing medication and got very angry when the  
12 subject was brought up. And so we decided it might be best to  
13 all sit down together and try to, you know, figure out what the  
14 client wanted, what services we could offer that might match  
15 those needs, and also to check ... to keep again periodically  
16 checking in for any risks for violence.

17 **Q.** So I guess at this stage you said he becomes, I  
18 believe, angry at the idea of changing medications, and I know  
19 we heard from Dr. Ouellette. Did that seem disproportionate to  
20 what it was you were trying to accomplish?

21 Basically, you're suggesting him to maybe change  
22 medications or change doses and then his reaction to it is so

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 strong. Did that seem out of context to you?

2 **A.** I think a lot of people feel strongly about  
3 medication. I don't necessarily think his emotions were  
4 necessarily very much more intense than other people who feel  
5 strongly about medication and those are perfectly valid  
6 concerns.

7 I think this stemmed a lot from his difficulties in having  
8 a productive conversation about some of his concerns. I think  
9 that when he felt that his concerns ... he didn't agree with the  
10 medication change, I think that this is the only way he felt  
11 able to express those concerns, which was how to get really  
12 angry.

13 So I think the expression, the outward expression of  
14 emotion was more intense than we're used in seeing, but not  
15 necessarily his misgivings about taking medication.

16 **Q.** But his outward expressions seemed to be, is it fair  
17 to say, exaggerated?

18 **A.** I'm not sure. I feel like "exaggerate" maybe has some  
19 negative connotations, but quite strong.

20 **Q.** Okay. And I'm just going to read you a few lines,  
21 it's about the fifth line down on page 282: "When asked about  
22 his feelings of anger, Mr. Desmond recognizes that he has felt

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 out of control. He described incidents in which he was yelling  
2 at his wife and felt out of control." How does his wife come  
3 into the context of his anger and yelling when the discussion is  
4 really about medication at this consultation?

5 **(14:00)**

6 **A.** This discussion led to a more general discussion about  
7 anger and how sometimes he feels that he wants to express  
8 something but instead it comes out as shouting or yelling or  
9 just not really getting his point across, and so that lack of  
10 control on what he's actually ... the messages he's putting out  
11 there.

12 And so similar situations came up where he felt that he was  
13 not communicating effectively his actual concerns, but instead  
14 just having these outbursts of anger.

15 **Q.** Did he disclose to you that he felt out of control at  
16 times in the context of disagreements with his wife?

17 **A.** Yes, in a general sense he (audio/video freeze) ...

18 **Q.** Are you still there? I just want to double-check.

19 **A.** Oh ... yes. Can you hear me?

20 **THE COURT:** What happened, Doctor, was that the video  
21 feed froze for a minute and ...

22 **A.** Oh.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **THE COURT:**       ... so whatever your answer was to Mr.  
2 Russell's last question, we didn't hear it.

3           **A.**     Oh, okay. It seemed from my end everything was  
4 normal.

5           **THE COURT:**       No.

6           **A.**     So what I did answer was I think that in a general  
7 sense the member reported that when he was angry he would lose  
8 control of kind of the message or the goal he was trying to  
9 reach and instead would resort to kind of these outbursts of  
10 anger, which he very much recognized were unproductive.

11           **MR. RUSSELL:**   Did he describe what those outbursts of  
12 anger ... what were they?

13           **A.**     I think it was very generally described as yelling.  
14 Yeah.

15           **Q.**     And did this prompt ... after that, you said: "When  
16 questioned about the possibility of attacking someone, the  
17 client denies any worry on the matter." So did you come right  
18 out and say do you plan on attacking someone or did he bring  
19 that up?

20           **A.**     So I think that ... again, this is now dating back  
21 several years but if I am basing this on my usual way of  
22 proceeding, when somebody says something to me like "losing



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 control" that's a very general term, so then I'll usually yes,  
2 very openly say, Well, when you say losing control, what are  
3 your concerns? What will you fear you might do when you lose  
4 control? Is it yelling, is it pushing, is it punching, is it  
5 ... Are you worried that when you lose control you'll hurt  
6 somebody physically? And so that would be something standard  
7 that I would check so I'm assuming that this is what happened in  
8 this case as well.

9 Q. Did he express sort of concerns about potential side  
10 effects of medication?

11 A. I believe that that's something that he expressed,  
12 yes.

13 Q. I'm going to ask you ...

14 A. So yeah, that's what I wrote down. Yes.

15 Q. I'm going to ask you a question, I guess I'll put the  
16 examples to you first ...

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. ... and then I'll ask the question. At page 258,  
19 it'll take me a minute to go through all of the examples, but I  
20 think it's important. This is a report from Kama Hamilton where  
21 she's describing a point of conflict between Lionel Desmond and  
22 a nurse that was at Ste. Anne's.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

2           **Q.**    And at the bottom, Lionel Desmond is describing the  
3 confrontation.  And she writes:

4                   He expressed extreme anger in regards to the  
5 nurse having called security to be present  
6 when he was finally given his medication.

7                   He states that he is aware that the  
8 individual is afraid of him but states that  
9 'I'm not putting that scare into him, he's  
10 putting it in himself'.

11           Then at the next page she says:

12                   Mr. Desmond alludes to the possibility that  
13 he will (and it's in quotes) 'snap if he has  
14 to deal with that nurse again' and then (and  
15 in quotes) 'He'll know what I'm like when  
16 I'm angry; he doesn't want to see me when  
17 I'm angry, really angry'.

18           And then he refers ... when he's asked he says he would  
19 break things.  So that's one example.

20           I'm going to give you a second example before I ask the  
21 question, 279, and I believe this is your report.  And this is  
22 back when he had referred to himself as a loose cannon in the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 context of arguments with other individuals. He also said he  
2 had racing thoughts.

3 If we turn to page 302. I promise there is a question but  
4 I just want to lay the foundation for the question. That's  
5 where we refer to the passage where you said he had the  
6 recurring nightmares of his wife cheating on him and that he  
7 would attack her and her lover, he reveals that.

8 Page 303, at the very top, he refers to ... and we reviewed  
9 this earlier: "When people disrespect him they will see the  
10 beast aspect of him."

11 Those are five sort of examples of where Lionel Desmond  
12 expresses an outward suggestion of hostility or aggression to  
13 someone.

14 **A.** Mm-hmm.

15 **Q.** Would you say that he had sort of a history of  
16 implying that he's going to do harm to someone but then backing  
17 it up, backing off of that play? Was there a history of that  
18 with him?

19 **A.** I'm not sure if I understand the question. Could you  
20 rephrase that?

21 **Q.** I can rephrase it. Was there a pattern of Lionel  
22 Desmond alluding to the fact that I'm going to harm someone, but

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 then when he's questioned further he says, No, I'm not really  
2 going to do it? He backs away from the initial imply.

3 **A.** So just for my own understanding, I might be wrong,  
4 but I feel like maybe what you're suggesting is kind of making  
5 threats but then walking them back to avoid consequences. Would  
6 that be what you're alluding to?

7 **Q.** I wish I had asked the question that way.

8 **A.** Okay. Is this a possibility? Yes.

9 Was that what I suspected? If I thought ... if I had a  
10 little bit more certainty that that was what was happening, I  
11 probably would have written it down that way.

12 I think it was my understanding was more a combination of  
13 things, like having difficulty understanding what he was saying  
14 what kind of impact that would have on other people. I think  
15 that was one thing. And also his non-verbal. So we would find  
16 ourselves asking questions like can you understand why somebody  
17 might find that threatening.

18 Because there's a little bit of a disconnect ... the  
19 question that you were asking, it almost sounded like a lot of  
20 this was planned when, in fact, when we were asking a lot of  
21 these questions he was very activated and kind of saying things  
22 impulsively.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           So to think that he would kind of stop in mid kind of angry  
2 tirade to them think, Oh, maybe somebody is going to think badly  
3 of this and then kind of walk back, I'm not sure if that was the  
4 first hypothesis that came to mind. Which is not to say, of  
5 course, that, you know, people aren't aware there are  
6 significant risks of outright saying that they're intent to harm  
7 other people, so I'm not sitting here and saying that's  
8 impossible, but that certainly wasn't my main hypothesis.

9           **Q.** And I recognize that, you know, those are from  
10 different sessions on different dates, there's a lot happening  
11 with Lionel Desmond. And I know it seems like a recurring ... a  
12 recurring theme, I guess, with mental health providers that  
13 we're seeing is that Lionel Desmond will make a comment, they'll  
14 ask him is he suicidal or if he's going to harm someone and his  
15 answer is no.

16           **A.** Mm-hmm.

17           **Q.** Do you ever sort of consider the whole as opposed to  
18 the immediate answer of no in the here and now when you're  
19 evaluating risk?

20           **A.** Yes. I will, however, note that I consider the whole  
21 in the sense that if you had three suicide attempts and today  
22 you're looking very distressed, you've got a bunch of stressors,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 you're intoxicated and you tell me no, I'm going to have some  
2 doubts.

3 **(14:10)**

4           However, if you are having some suicidal thoughts today and  
5 you had some suicidal thoughts two weeks ago and two months ago,  
6 to me that's not necessarily an indication that increases the  
7 risk.

8           People have these thoughts of harming themselves and  
9 harming other people that come and go, and they're not  
10 necessarily cumulative actions which in my mind kind of increase  
11 that risk a little bit more cumulatively. If you say, No, I  
12 don't intend on harming somebody and you're constantly pushing  
13 people and there's this kind of an escalation in violence then I  
14 would start to doubt more and more and more. Does that make  
15 sense in explanation?

16           **Q.** That's fair.

17           **A.** Okay.

18           **Q.** Looking back at the whole picture of all of those  
19 different occurrences and the fact that he had interpersonal  
20 conflicts with nursing staff, other residents, other clients  
21 that were in group settings, do you openly accept Lionel Desmond  
22 when he tells you, No, I would never hurt anyone or harm anyone?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 I know that's a tough question.

2 **A.** Mm-hmm. That's an especially tough question knowing  
3 what we know now ...

4 **Q.** Yes.

5 **A.** ... right. Having the information we know now, I'm  
6 tempted to say, Well, of course these were signs of potential  
7 violence. But, in actuality, I think that when I was in the  
8 situation, I saw it in a very positive light that he was  
9 absolutely furious at this mental health nurse and despite  
10 losing control in a verbal way managed to maintain control in a  
11 physical way.

12 And so to me having witnessed him, you know, very  
13 dysregulated and ... but definitely attempting his best to reign  
14 that in was kind of a promising sign that there was some control  
15 there.

16 **Q.** Is there ... I don't exactly know what this could be,  
17 but is there an advantage to ... because we appreciate that the  
18 mental health clinicians that are interacting with Lionel  
19 Desmond are very involved in trying to understand him,  
20 understand his conditions, put proper treatments in place.

21 Is there value in having sort of an independent eye who may  
22 be a clinician within a structure to go through these reports

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 and say, Look, I've documented five examples where he walks back  
2 his comments, to sort of understand whether there's an  
3 undercurrent of potential domestic violence risk?

4 Is there a value in that from a clinical perspective? I'm  
5 asking it because I don't know.

6 **A.** I'm not sure I know the answer to that question  
7 either. I'm not sure what the balance between that added work  
8 and the benefit might be.

9 You know, I'm thinking if I were handed somebody else's  
10 file to review it in some way and say are there concerns that I  
11 have missed, might I come up with points of interest or would I  
12 just end up engaging in, you know, asking for explanations and  
13 being given a lot more context because, you know, clinical notes  
14 are a snapshot in time. So I'm not sure I know the answer to  
15 that question.

16 **THE COURT:** Mr. Russell?

17 **A.** Is "maybe" an acceptable answer?

18 **MR. RUSSELL:** Okay. I believe Judge Zimmer may have ...

19 **THE COURT:** Dr. Gagnon ...

20 **MR. RUSSELL:** Or His Honour, sorry.

21 **THE COURT:** Sorry. A moment ago, when Mr. Russell was  
22 going through those various events and you made the comment



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 that, you know, thoughts can come and go but they're not  
2 necessarily cumulative ...

3 **A.** Mm-hmm.

4 **THE COURT:** ... and then you made a comment about we now  
5 know that what Cpl. Desmond did on January the 3rd.

6 **A.** Mm-hmm.

7 **THE COURT:** So when you look at all of these little bits  
8 and pieces that you saw then, would you look at them differently  
9 now knowing that that was the event ... that he came to that  
10 point in time when he, you know, basically killed his family and  
11 then committed suicide?

12 So do you look at these events now and you put them in a  
13 different light and say, Well, when we look at these I guess  
14 that maybe in isolation they didn't look a particular way, but  
15 knowing what happened we now look at them and can now fit them  
16 together into a puzzle that creates a picture that in hindsight  
17 - and I appreciate we are simply dealing with what this  
18 hindsight perspective is - that there was something more  
19 predictable in those circumstances than what was originally  
20 maybe appreciated?

21 **A.** I think when ... any new information is going to  
22 change my perspective, I think that's a given.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **THE COURT:**       Yes.

2           **A.**     You know, I think that when I learned of what had  
3 happened those were some of my first thoughts: Did I miss  
4 something? Should I go back, you know, knowing now what has  
5 happened does it change my view of these different incidents  
6 with anger?

7           So in a way ... in that way yes, but also in a way I don't  
8 think it changes the fact that inappropriate expression of anger  
9 and angry outbursts are a diagnostic criteria that does tend to  
10 pop up a lot for people who have post-traumatic stress disorder.

11          And when I currently treat people who have outbursts who  
12 will, I don't know, yell at someone, who will have, you know,  
13 yelling matches with their spouses, today this does not make me  
14 have overwhelming worries about safety. I still assess safety  
15 the same way.

16          So this has not changed my perspective in the sense that  
17 having yelling arguments to me is not a fantastic predictor of a  
18 lot more increased risks to safety. So there's a little bit of  
19 both, I think.

20          Do I think maybe there was something he wasn't telling us?  
21 Maybe.

22          **THE COURT:**       Yeah. All right. Thank you, Doctor. Mr.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Russell?

2 **A.** Does it answer your question, Your Honour?

3 **THE COURT:** Oh, it does.

4 **A.** Okay.

5 **THE COURT:** I understand your point. Thank you.

6 **MR. RUSSELL:** So, Dr. Gagnon, we'll move to page 284.

7 **A.** Okay.

8 **Q.** There is a special sort of meeting that is held  
9 between you, Kama Hamilton, Ms. Marie-Eve Royer and ... I might  
10 pronounce her name improperly, Julie ...

11 **A.** Is it Beauchesne?

12 **Q.** ... Beauchesne? Yeah. What was the purpose of this  
13 meeting?

14 **A.** So I also want to point out because I do feel like we  
15 are focussing on these, as I completely understand why, but  
16 these type of meetings would happen, they were not unusual ...

17 **Q.** Oh, okay.

18 **A.** ... because we have multiple people from, you know,  
19 different environments coming together and having to live  
20 together on this unit 24/7, that does tend to cause some  
21 friction.

22 And so we would have these meetings with participants when

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 we noticed signs of frictions, either between participants or  
2 more frequently a little bit with the staff, to just address  
3 what was happening, what might be ways to resolve these types of  
4 difficulties.

5 And, in fact, I think that that was one of the clinical  
6 benefits of having this group environment where, you know,  
7 normal, habitual difficulties that these people are experiencing  
8 in the outside world get replicated in this group setting and we  
9 can practice in real time how to do some conflict resolution.

10 Q. So the meeting, what was the purpose behind it? What  
11 was the focus I guess of the meeting?

12 A. Trying to follow through some conflict resolution.

13 Q. So what was the source of the conflict that Lionel  
14 Desmond was experiencing while on the unit?

15 A. I can't even say that I remember. I seem to remember  
16 something maybe about dishes.

17 Q. It indicates: "The objectives of this meeting ...",  
18 it's the third line down. "The objectives of this meeting are  
19 to help the client maintain respectful interactions with the  
20 other participant and to develop tolerance for situations which  
21 generate anger." So there was some sort of encounter with  
22 another resident, am I getting that correctly?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Yeah, that would probably be a reasonable assumption.

2           **Q.**    And your intention was sort of to bring this up with  
3 ... raise this with Mr. Desmond, I guess?

4           **(14:20)**

5           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

6           **Q.**    And what was the hope? You would raise it with him,  
7 what were you hoping to get out of that?

8           **A.**    So to again try to make some of that difference  
9 between this is a situation which is causing some anger in you.  
10 It's not necessarily the other person deliberately trying to  
11 make you angry.

12           So these are situations where we have to make compromises  
13 where people might be, you know, creating frustrations in you  
14 quite unintentionally, and to develop this habit of giving the  
15 other people on the unit the benefit of the doubt to say we have  
16 some different opinions, they're not necessarily deliberately  
17 trying to make you angry, how do you tolerate some of these  
18 situations, and maintain a respectful interaction even though  
19 you might disagree on some things. So building some of those  
20 conflict resolution skills.

21           **Q.**    And did Lionel Desmond seem to get or grasp that  
22 concept?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    I have to say that not very much. I think there was  
2 very much an idea that I am angry because somebody else is  
3 making me angry.

4           **Q.**    And did that sort of ... that foundation seem to stay  
5 in place throughout his stay at Ste. Anne's?

6           **A.**    Again, some very limited beginning of flexibility  
7 there. So understanding, right. Take a step back if the  
8 situation exactly as it seems. Trying to understand other  
9 people's perspectives, but just some beginning in that  
10 direction.

11          **Q.**    How did Lionel Desmond to you seem to take the news  
12 that you and the other clinicians were wishing to speak to him  
13 about this? How did he react to you approaching him?

14          **A.**    I'm trying to remember and I can't really remember any  
15 specific reaction.

16          **Q.**    This may prompt you, it's in the middle of that  
17 paragraph. You note: "Mr. Desmond is agitated through the  
18 first part of the session and he places responsibility of his  
19 frustration on the other participant." So you noted that he was  
20 agitated at the very discussion of the conflict?

21          **A.**    Yeah, I'm not sure if this was ... I think maybe I  
22 misunderstood your question. I'm not sure if this was related

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 to us approaching him to have this discussion ...

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. ... or just him getting kind of worked up discussing  
4 this frustrating situation.

5 Q. But you can't re- ...

6 A. I suspect more the latter.

7 Q. If ... what was more the latter?

8 A. There was a pattern of the latter. There was a  
9 pattern of the latter in session where he would discuss  
10 something outside of session that was bothering him and him  
11 getting very much worked up just thinking again about how  
12 frustrating he had found this event.

13 Q. Okay. If we can move to page 285, this is a July 6th  
14 session. There's some discussion in this session about the  
15 transition to civilian life from military life and you indicated  
16 earlier that there were some struggles with Lionel Desmond  
17 getting that concept of his identity from the military to  
18 civilian life.

19 Did he talk about how that reflected in his home with his  
20 wife and daughter?

21 A. I can't remember any details. So in here I did write  
22 that, you know, he would just sometimes take home stress from

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 the day at home. I think that that's not so unusual. But apart  
2 from what I've written here, I can't recall any other examples  
3 he might have given me.

4 Q. Was there any discussion about anger directed at his  
5 family when he returned home from work?

6 A. I wrote "anger expressed towards his family", but no  
7 more detail than that.

8 Q. Okay. If we could turn to page 286. You discussed  
9 this concept of ... earlier on, of a coping card used as a tool  
10 for Lionel Desmond to sort of regulate his emotions in times of  
11 sort of stress. What is a coping card? What is that concept?

12 A. So it is a tool which I sometimes use with people who  
13 have trouble applying skills. So in between sessions they'll  
14 have trouble taking the skills which we've worked on in therapy,  
15 in those sessions, and then importing them into every day  
16 difficulties. So it would be a small piece of paper with simple  
17 reminders of actions that he could take to help him regulate  
18 emotions and have more productive interactions with other  
19 people.

20 In this case what I seem to describe is a very simple  
21 breathing exercise which we would have practiced in session and  
22 then with that slightly reduced kind of activation, taking a



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 step back and thinking about okay, what is making me angry right  
2 now; what is my need in this situation and building a sentence  
3 which would express that, as opposed to what he stated he  
4 struggled with which was just getting angry and yelling.

5 Q. Did he appear to be able to use these tools, breathing  
6 and the coping card, with success?

7 A. So towards the end - and I'm sure that this something  
8 that we might touch on as we hit those pages - he did say to me  
9 that he had really gotten used to the habit of kind of slow,  
10 diaphragmatic breathing as a means to calm down and so he had  
11 kind of discarded the coping card because he didn't really see  
12 any added value. I, of course, would have specified that I  
13 thought the second part of the exercise was also pretty useful.  
14 So partly but not wholly.

15 Q. If we turn to page 288, this is the seventh session,  
16 July 14th. I understand at this session ... I'll read to you,  
17 you note: "The client indicates he feels he has a low level of  
18 control on his internal state in a situation he finds upsetting  
19 and he states that this is the way things are because of his  
20 PTSD."

21 A. Mm-hmm.

22 Q. So again, was he still consistently reporting that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 he's struggling with trying to control his emotions and regulate  
2 his emotions?

3 **A.** Yeah, that was very much an ongoing theme throughout  
4 his entire stay. And I think that in this line I tried to  
5 highlight how I was reflecting to him that through developing  
6 these skills he would learn to have more control over his  
7 emotions, his way of seeing things, and ultimately his  
8 reactions, and that his answer to me was to kind of give a  
9 reason why he didn't have that control.

10 So, to me, it really highlighted this continued difficulty  
11 with perceiving that he did have tools and strategies that would  
12 be effective in helping him manage how he felt.

13 **Q.** And the way it seems to be worded, it seems that he  
14 says to you this is the way things are because of his PTSD. So  
15 does he seem to be attributing this struggle with regulating  
16 emotions and his difficulties to I have PTSD, therefore, this is  
17 why I have these problems? Was that the level of his  
18 understanding into his conditions?

19 **A.** I think the last part of that line that this is the  
20 way things are because of his PTSD and then that following line:  
21 "He states that he finds the environment in the unit helpful  
22 because the other participants understand how he feels and ask

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 him permission before making comments." That was my way of  
2 illustrating that as I'm trying to get the client to move into a  
3 state of realizing that we do not have control over external  
4 events and, therefore, we have to make the effort to adapt and  
5 understand and process and regulate, he's kind of pushing back  
6 and giving me the complete opposite narrative, which is this  
7 environment is good, because people, you know, are very careful  
8 around me and that's helpful to me. And, you know, these are my  
9 reactions because of PTSD and that's why I can't control these  
10 things.

11 So I was trying to illustrate the fact that this was very  
12 much still a struggle for him to perceive that he had some  
13 control over things.

14 **Q.** And so did you see that there was a real value in  
15 Lionel Desmond being around people that he felt shared similar  
16 experiences and similar struggles? Other veterans.

17 **A.** Yes to that question. There is value with sharing  
18 experiences with peers and feeling understood.

19 No, in a way because I definitely don't want my clients to  
20 build the expectation that they'll feel better when others walk  
21 on eggshells around them. That's creating a very much  
22 unrealistic expectation and will probably increase anger when

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 you're confronted with people who rightly have no idea what  
2 you're going through and don't know what your triggers or your  
3 areas of sensitivities are.

4 **(14:30)**

5 And that's a huge part of what creates anger in a lot of  
6 people I treat, which is how dare you say something that's so  
7 insulting to me without realizing that a lot of people say  
8 things with no idea how it's going to have an influence on you.  
9 So to me, that was something, an aspect that was a bit less  
10 helpful because the more that you change an environment to  
11 accommodate these things, the less it reflects the natural  
12 environment, which is very stressful, that people are going to  
13 be ... have to evolve in.

14 **Q.** Do you think Lionel Desmond grasped the concept that,  
15 Other people might be walking on eggshells around me because of  
16 my reactionary ways of coping?

17 **A.** I think he saw it. I think he saw it and I think  
18 people did it also in a very benevolent way and I think he  
19 perceived that as very benevolent. I'm just not sure if, long-  
20 term, that was the most helpful thing.

21 **Q.** And did you see examples of where maybe staff or other  
22 clients at Ste. Anne's were sort of on eggshells around Lionel

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Desmond?

2       **A.** Maybe "on eggshells" is pushing it a little bit, but I  
3 did notice ... so if you notice in my group sessions, he would  
4 often kind of go on tangents. And I think that for other  
5 clients, they might've been called to order a little bit more by  
6 the group, but I think that in Mr. Desmond's case, it was met,  
7 especially as sessions went on, in different ways, but often in  
8 people kind of giving him a little space but then continuing  
9 onto the subject.

10       So I think that people realized that he interacted in a  
11 certain way and they tried to give him space being that way,  
12 which I think was very kind of the people around him. I just  
13 wanted to make sure it didn't create that unrealistic  
14 expectation, especially when it comes to strangers.

15       **Q.** Okay. If we could turn to page 289, this is session  
16 eight and it appears to be July 19th. You indicated that you  
17 begin the session by asking the client if he has any challenging  
18 events over the past week and if he has been using his coping  
19 card. He talks about using the breathing exercises and you  
20 report that he found helpful. And then he goes on to ... you go  
21 on to note:

22               He identifies his relationship with his wife

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           as his current concern. He explains that he  
2           has been telling her that he is committed to  
3           the relationship but that he has not  
4           received any information from her regarding  
5           his commitment. The client says he intends  
6           to confront his wife and that if she does  
7           not profess his (sic) love for him, it will  
8           mean that she has been taking advantage of  
9           him for financial reasons.

10           I'm going to ask you a little bit about that. Did it  
11          appear as though he was equating two things that really  
12          naturally don't line up? I'm going to confront my wife. If she  
13          doesn't profess her love for me, it confirms my belief that  
14          she's been taking advantage of me financially.

15           **A.** I think this goes back to the splitting concept that  
16          we were discussing where sometimes people see other people in  
17          very much a dichotomic way. Either you love me and you're going  
18          to be with me forever or you've never loved me and all along,  
19          this was a lie. So very much this inability to have a nuanced  
20          perspective of people where sometimes people fall out of love,  
21          sometimes people divorce. It doesn't mean the entire  
22          relationship was a lie.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           So I think that, to him, he was saying, you know, I want to  
2 be a husband, I want to be with my family. I need this  
3 reassurance now, and if I don't then, you know, she was taking  
4 advantage of me and she never loved me and she was with me for  
5 money.

6           **Q.** This ... you referred to it a couple of times as the  
7 splitting concept.

8           **A.** Mm-hmm.

9           **Q.** Is that a clinical term or ...

10          **A.** Yeah.

11          **Q.** What is ...

12          **A.** It's a concept in psychology. So it's very much kind  
13 of splitting things in right or wrong, black or white. And so  
14 we often kind of look at people and they'll be all one way, and  
15 it's a way of kind of justifying the way that we feel about  
16 people. And so there's no nuanced grey areas, right? If we  
17 have a treatment team, when we do some splitting, there'll be  
18 the good guy and the bad guy, right? And there's no kind of  
19 understanding that people have. Things that we like about them,  
20 things that we don't like about them. And one mistake or one  
21 behaviour that we don't like doesn't mean that they're all  
22 negative.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.** Did he seem very sincere at this concept that he was  
2 going to confront his wife about whether or not she will ...

3           **A.** Very much so.

4           **Q.** Yes?

5           **A.** Yes.

6           **Q.** That's something he really wanted assurances from his  
7 wife, Do you love me?

8           **A.** Yes.

9           **Q.** Now did it appear as though he had some concerns or  
10 beliefs that he couldn't have been ... I guess, did it appear as  
11 though he was prepared for maybe an answer that he didn't want?

12           **A.** Yes. Actually, this is one of the interactions that I  
13 remember a little bit better because this was one of the  
14 interactions that I found, to me, suggested that there was a  
15 lower risk of violence because when I asked him, What would you  
16 do if your wife told you that, no, she doesn't love you and she  
17 doesn't want to be with you anymore, he said to me that he would  
18 get ... I think he said, I would get revenge, or, I would make  
19 her pay, which obviously raised a little ... a few flags for me.  
20 So I told him, Okay, well, run me through a scenario of how you  
21 would make that happen. And he described this kind of elaborate  
22 fantasy of getting a lawyer and making sure that he would get



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 back every penny. And it was this kind of very big thing where,  
2 you know, she's not going to take advantage of me. I'm going to  
3 get that money back. It was a lot of emotional activation.

4 So, you know, when you're suggesting, do people sometimes  
5 kind of rehearse walking back threats and really in their mind  
6 they plan more violent actions, in this scenario, this seemed  
7 very authentic where he was thinking, this is what I'm going to  
8 do to punish my wife if she doesn't want to be with me anymore.  
9 You know, I'm going to take legal action. I'm going to make  
10 sure she knows that she can't, you know, take my money and get  
11 off scot-free.

12 So this is one of the sessions that I remember a little bit  
13 better. And so this kind of fantasy, to me, seemed very much  
14 like something that he was invested in, and as much as I would  
15 not wish that kind of, you know, painful process to anybody,  
16 that would've been, of course, perfectly within his rights and  
17 so a lot less worrying on the front of violence.

18 Q. So his thought process was he confronts her to find  
19 out if they're going to reconcile or whether she loves him, and  
20 if the answer is no, he's told you he's going to get revenge,  
21 make her pay. And then he describes ... he starts to clarify a  
22 bit more and says it's in a legal context?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

2           **Q.**    I'm going to punish her financially?  Is that what I'm  
3 getting?

4           **A.**    I'm going to get every penny back.  So his thought was  
5 that she'd used him for money to get her schooling, and now that  
6 she had her schooling, she didn't need him anymore.  So his  
7 thought was, I'm going to get every penny back.  And that was  
8 his kind of revenge scenario.

9           **Q.**    But from what I understand, what came first is, I'm  
10 going to get revenge and I'm going to make her pay.  Would that  
11 sort of have prompted you to say ... you indicated that that was  
12 a red flag, I believe you described.  Would that have prompt-  
13 ...

14          **A.**    So just to be clear, something along those lines, but  
15 yeah.  So some kind of frustration, right?  She won't get away  
16 with taking advantage of me.  So I wanted to clarify what that  
17 might entail, and that's when we got into this scenario of kind  
18 of getting his money back.

19          **Q.**    So I guess, and so I'm clear, if he didn't get the  
20 answer he wanted, there was a sense that he was going to  
21 retaliate in some way that was going to inflict some sort of  
22 harm, whether it was financial or something.  Is that the sense

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 I'm getting?

2 **A.** So the harm that he described to me was purely  
3 financial.

4 **Q.** Okay. Were there any other sort of circumstances  
5 where he expressed to you that he would take some sort of action  
6 against her that was going to almost be in a retaliation for the  
7 beliefs that he held?

8 **A.** The only retaliation that he ever described to me was  
9 that kind of financial restitution that he thought he wanted.

10 **Q.** Okay. And observations during this session. What  
11 sort of observations did you make of him when he's having that  
12 discussion with you about identifying his wife as the current  
13 concern?

14 **(14:40)**

15 **A.** So, you know, when he was describing this scenario,  
16 the possibility that his spouse ... or his belief or maybe his  
17 fear is the right word ... that his spouse has used him for  
18 financial reasons to get her schooling, and now that her  
19 schooling was done, she didn't need him anymore. So a lot of  
20 frustration, a lot of anger, you know, non-verbal expressions of  
21 anger, poor eye contacts, and swearing. So that's kind of the  
22 behaviour that he was exhibiting which highlighted his anger to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 me.

2       **Q.** Did he use the analogy during this session that ...  
3 you say, "We explored cues which indicate he is feeling  
4 overwhelmed by intense affects. The client identifies tenseness  
5 in his body and uses the image of clouds rolling in." Did he  
6 use that to describe it?

7       **A.** Yeah. So this was ... you know, we try to use both  
8 kind of internal cues and imagery to say, These are the warning  
9 signs that you're getting very upset. How do you put in place  
10 things to help you regulate and help you maintain a state of a  
11 little bit more calmness?

12       So that was part of the imagery, right? There was the  
13 tornadoes, clouds were rolling in, tornadoes coming, there's a  
14 storm coming. Those were the kind of images, like, Okay, I'm  
15 getting really upset and I'm getting really drawn into this  
16 catastrophization and how do I manage now?

17       **Q.** If we could turn to page 290, this is a session from  
18 July 20th. There's a comment that Lionel Desmond makes to you  
19 in relation to the military, at the last of the first paragraph,  
20 the last two lines. "He indicates that being able to count on a  
21 close friend is an ability he would like to maintain in a  
22 civilian setting."

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

2           **Q.**    What sort of context did that come about?

3           **A.**    I think that it was in the context of that earlier  
4 phrase where he was saying that, you know, his communication  
5 skills and his ... maybe the bluntness that's a little bit more  
6 prized in a military setting was having negative repercussions  
7 for him in a civilian setting, and that he wanted to be able to  
8 form friendships in the future. I believe that was what that  
9 referred to.

10          **Q.**    We heard some evidence earlier on at the very first  
11 week about ... I don't want to say mentorship but where a  
12 military veteran can confide in someone that has a shared  
13 experience as them.

14          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

15          **Q.**    Someone they could confide in. Sort of a peer mentor  
16 or peer support. Do you see the value in that, having a sort of  
17 peer mentorship for someone such as Lionel Desmond? Someone  
18 that he can trust, someone he can confide in, someone he can  
19 call in the moment of perhaps having a difficult time?

20          **A.**    Boy, I hate that all my answers are yes or no, but yes  
21 and no. I think that there is a lot of value in feeling like  
22 you have a sense of community, being surrounded by peers,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 feeling like you have people that you can connect to. I think  
2 that what you might be referring to with that peer support is  
3 the ... I believe it's called the OSIS program.

4 Q. Okay, yes, I'm familiar with it

5 A. So a lot of benefits reported. I think one of the  
6 issues that I've sometimes come across is sometimes, it's a lot  
7 to manage for somebody acting as a peer, and so that can take a  
8 toll also. I'm looking at it from the point of view of taking  
9 care of the peers as well. So that's one of the things that I  
10 mentioned can be a little difficult. But in a general sense,  
11 maintaining contact with peers, you know, and having people  
12 around you that understand you and that can provide that  
13 support, that's generally a helpful thing.

14 Q. At this session, there's some indication that ... you  
15 note at the fourth line from the bottom: "Mr. Desmond seems to  
16 have limited insight into the potential distress that could be  
17 caused by his disparaging comment about Reserve members." What  
18 was that all about? What was happening there?

19 A. So I'm not sure if he was aware of this, but one of  
20 the participants in the group was ... I'm not sure if it's  
21 current or ex-Reservist. And Mr. Desmond kind of went on at  
22 length about kind of the downsides of working with Reservists.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 And so I observed that there was a very real disconnect between  
2 him, you know, trying to get along with his peers and basically  
3 verbalizing that he'd found it helpful to have people that, you  
4 know, knew his experiences, and at the same time, saying  
5 something that could be very difficult to hear by another member  
6 of the group. And I did not, certainly did not, observe any  
7 moment of, Oops, I've just said that, you know, these people are  
8 hard to work with. How might somebody feel about that? And  
9 there were no repercussions from the group, again because I  
10 think that there was a lot of benevolence towards Mr. Desmond  
11 and understanding that he certainly wasn't looking to insult  
12 anybody on purpose.

13 **Q.** If we turn to page 291, this is July 21st, so we're  
14 now approximately two months into his time at Ste. Anne's and  
15 about three weeks before he leaves. From what I understand,  
16 this is a group intervention session about managing emotions.

17 **A.** That's right.

18 **Q.** What observations did you make of Lionel Desmond at  
19 this session?

20 **A.** So I think that this was one session where his  
21 tendency to speak impulsively and to interrupt other people was  
22 a little bit more present. So I would have to kind of refocus

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 him and make sure he left space for other people. Some of those  
2 things, I had noted.

3 **Q.** The fact that you note that he shows impulsivity,  
4 interrupting the clinician and other participants, is it  
5 becoming sort of concerning to you that he's nearing the sort of  
6 end of the program - he's two months in - and there's still a  
7 hard time getting traction in having effective treatment with  
8 Lionel Desmond?

9 **A.** What it is doing is indicating to me that this is  
10 going to be targets for future treatment and this is going to  
11 need continued attention.

12 **Q.** So something that even would postdate Ste. Anne's.  
13 It's something that's going to have to continue.

14 **A.** Mm-hmm.

15 **Q.** Do you think ... are you able to comment on what you  
16 think might be accounting for that continued sort of him  
17 interrupting the therapist, interrupting the other individuals  
18 in the group setting? What do you think is accounting for that?

19 **A.** I think that a lot of the things that I described in  
20 that report. And the reason I think I tried to frame something  
21 that made sense in that report is really those difficulties with  
22 impulsivity and mentalization, understanding, you know, if I



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 interrupt people, it might be upsetting to them. How do I  
2 manage my actions, not interrupt people?

3 So, again, we're on that cusp of could this be something  
4 more organic in the area of maybe kind of a head injury or is  
5 this something, a personality trait, more like impulsivity and  
6 difficulties understanding the impact of my actions on other  
7 people's actions?

8 Q. If we could move to page 292, this is a session from  
9 August 3rd titled "Thinking flexibly", I guess. So at this  
10 session - this is another group intervention session - what  
11 observations do you make of Lionel Desmond during this session?

12 A. Some of those same observations. So, you know, making  
13 jokes, talking and laughing loudly, making comments. So a  
14 little bit of that impulsivity again.

15 Q. Are you getting any sense of whether Lionel Desmond is  
16 getting anything out of these group sessions as you're nearing  
17 the tail end before he leaves?

18 A. I find that there's always benefit in repetition.  
19 There's a lot of echoes between the work individual sessions and  
20 the work in group sessions. I think there's also benefits in  
21 seeing other people do the work if, you know, you're too close  
22 to the source and you're having trouble doing it for yourself.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 So some benefits in the larger scheme of things, yes. Some  
2 immediate gains, not very much.

3 **Q.** If we could move to 293, on the same date, August 3rd,  
4 there's a 60-minute sort of session and it appears to involve  
5 you and other staff at Ste. Anne's. Is this another scenario  
6 where you were actually confronting Lionel Desmond about his  
7 conduct at the group sessions?

8 **A.** Not in the group sessions. I believe this is an  
9 incident which occurred outside of group sessions. So this  
10 would've been an interaction, an altercation, between Mr.  
11 Desmond and a mental health nurse. And I believe this is the  
12 incident where he raised his voice, he acted kind of in a kind  
13 of posturally-aggressive way. So these was to kind of put the  
14 framework of saying that, you know, aggressive behaviour is not  
15 tolerated and that what we do expect of him is to practice those  
16 anger management skills which we've been developing.

17 **(14:50)**

18 **Q.** How did Lionel Desmond take sort of being confronted  
19 on you wanting to discuss that potential conflict and how to  
20 deal with the conflict? How did he react to that?

21 **A.** So I think that initially, there was very much the  
22 perspective that this was an "us versus him" kind of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 intervention to kind of call him out and almost an imputed way  
2 to point out what he had done wrong. And I think that we tried  
3 to explain that, in kind of zooming out, this is just a good  
4 opportunity to practice these skills in real time. You know,  
5 these conflicts that you keep experiencing, this is a perfect  
6 place to practice how to deal with them more effectively.

7 So I think that had a little bit more traction, but I think  
8 there was very much a little bit of, You're taking his side  
9 versus mine.

10 Q. So when you say "had a little more traction" was he  
11 expressing a little bit of insight into how to appropriately  
12 deal with this?

13 A. I think that initially, what we could see was kind of  
14 interruptions. And then towards the end, the way I'm writing  
15 it, it sounds like he was able to listen when I said, you know,  
16 We need you to be able to express your frustrations. This is  
17 not to shut you down and not listen to some of the concerns you  
18 have. We just need to do it in a productive way. This is the  
19 perfect time to practice some of these, you know, more effective  
20 communication skills that we've been talking about. So I think  
21 he was more receptive to that towards the end.

22 Q. And I note in the middle of the page, you said: "He

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 shows signs of being agitated and states that he felt he had to  
2 walk away from the situation before becoming violent." Is that  
3 something he disclosed to you during this meeting, that he had  
4 to walk away from that situation with the nurse before he could  
5 ...

6 **A.** So that's what I wrote down that he would've reported  
7 to me, yes.

8 **Q.** I guess you can be violent to objects. Did he ...

9 **A.** Mm-hmm.

10 **Q.** Did he discuss what sort of violence was he going to  
11 participate in with the nurse if he didn't walk away?

12 **A.** I don't recall.

13 **Q.** Was it concerning that ... I guess it's a good thing  
14 in many ways that he said he recognized he had to walk away.

15 **A.** Mm-hmm.

16 **Q.** But is it fair to say it was concerning that he's  
17 reporting that, I had to walk away because I would've been  
18 violent?

19 **A.** I mean walking away instead of ... again, he did not  
20 report to me that he was going to punch the mental health nurse  
21 but, hypothetically, walking away instead of punching someone is  
22 very functional, especially for people who struggle with a lot

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 of anger. And I think what I said next was, That's good, but we  
2 want you to have other options. You know, if you have calmed  
3 down afterwards, why don't we then all sit down and have a  
4 discussion around why that was frustrating for you instead of  
5 just having this now, stuck in this place where you're both  
6 holding this situation, this altercation, in stasis and there's  
7 no good that's come of it.

8 So, you know, part of it was, Sure, I mean withdrawing from  
9 a situation if you feel that you're going to lose control  
10 violently in any form, shape, way, or form, is a good thing. We  
11 just want you to have other options at your disposal as well.

12 Q. Okay. 294. Two days later, on August 5th, I  
13 understand that yourself and Ms. Hamilton are trying to reach  
14 Shanna Desmond.

15 A. I believe that's right.

16 Q. What was the purpose of trying to reach out to Shanna  
17 Desmond two days later on August 5th?

18 A. I believe that the purpose of the call was Mr. Desmond  
19 stating that he wanted to discuss some of his needs in a more  
20 kind of proactive way, as we had been discussing throughout his  
21 stay at Ste. Anne's. Having a discussion around what might be  
22 put in place to improve the chances of this going well. And he

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 felt like in order for this to go as well as possible, he had  
2 asked us to sit with him and help him try to make that  
3 conversation as productive as possible.

4 Q. You indicate that you had some discussion, or turned  
5 your mind to, affect regulation in advance of this phone call?

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. What was that? What was the purpose behind affect  
8 regulation and Lionel Desmond before he called Shanna Desmond?

9 A. Well, I think actually it would've been in the context  
10 of the phone call. So, for instance, if a sensitive subject  
11 would've begun to be discussed and he could've become very  
12 activated and dysregulated and then started to either want to  
13 leave or to resort to kind of yelling, we could've helped him  
14 then kind of use the tactics that we'd identified together to be  
15 able to make that conversation productive.

16 Q. So did you sort of review this with him before he  
17 called his wife, that we're there to support you if things  
18 aren't going as well as you would like? What was ... or no.

19 A. Actually, that was from him. He said, I want to have  
20 this discussion. Can you help me make this discussion go well.

21 Q. Okay. So he reached out to you to sort of help him  
22 navigate the conversation with his wife.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **A.**    I believe ... that's my understanding, that's my  
2 memory, and from what I'm reading, that makes sense here.

3           **Q.**    Okay.  But I understand, in terms of your involvement,  
4 you weren't able to speak to her on this date.

5           **A.**    No.

6           **Q.**    If we could turn to page 295.  It's now August 5th,  
7 and from what I understand with this report, is it fair to say  
8 Lionel Desmond is still hung up on, or thinking about, or  
9 stressed about the conflict he had with the nurse?

10          **A.**    That's right, yes.

11          **Q.**    Was there a particular reason why it appeared as  
12 though he couldn't let that encounter go, that it was still so  
13 prominent?

14          **A.**    I'm mostly speculating here, but continued interaction  
15 with this nurse, probably.  You know, the fact that, you know,  
16 they would've had to continue to interact, and I'm not sure Mr.  
17 Desmond was able to kind of verbalize what was bothering him.  
18 And then I think, again, this idea of this flip to a negative  
19 side where having now "taken this nurse's side", we were kind of  
20 against him.

21          **Q.**    So he felt as though, even though you were trying to  
22 engage in helping him navigate the conflict that he now then

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 perceived you as turned against him?

2       **A.** Mm-hmm. So I mean this was a conversation ... this  
3 was, I thought, a very productive session in the sense that when  
4 he came in, you know, non-verbally, he appeared very angry. And  
5 when I asked him if he was angry initially, he said that wasn't  
6 the case, but we were able to tease out and to discuss this a  
7 little bit more productively.

8       **Q.** And you had noted in your report, this is the second  
9 line. "He stated that he understands the subcontext in the  
10 previous group meeting regarding this situation. Note that we  
11 expect him to apologize and 'kiss this nurse's ass' and this  
12 will not happen." So is that sort of a reflection of his belief  
13 that you're taking that nurse's side and ...

14       **A.** Yeah, and that what we want from him is for him to  
15 admit that this was his fault and to apologize and kind of take  
16 full responsibility for this.

17       **Q.** And you note under "Interventions", you say, "A breach  
18 in the therapeutic alliance is identified and attended to."

19       **A.** Mm-hmm.

20       **Q.** What do you mean there? What's the breach in the ...  
21 I guess it's self-explanatory ...

22       **A.** So ...



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**   ... in many ways but ...

2           **A.**   So anytime ... a breach in a therapeutic alliance  
3 would be, you know, when either party has done something which  
4 threatens the collaborative nature of their work together,  
5 right? So a client being angry at me because he thinks that I'm  
6 taking somebody's side over his would definitely be an obstacle  
7 of working together. So there's no way that, in those kind of  
8 situations, I just go through motions in a session. So I would  
9 directly address that and see what we can productively take from  
10 that. And again, this is, you know, great opportunities to  
11 address in real time, difficulties with expressions of anger.

12   **(15:00)**

13           **Q.**   So we're now a week before he's leaving and you note  
14 in the first line of "Interventions", "We emphatically confront  
15 the client regarding his now completely negative perception of  
16 the RTCOSI and of the therapeutic relationship in contrast with  
17 past experiences." The RTCOSI is what?

18           **A.**   Residential Treatment Centre for Operational Stress  
19 Injury, St. Anne's.

20           **Q.**   And you phrase it as, "now completely negative  
21 perception".

22           **A.**   So I'm describing that light switch shift from, You

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 guys are here to help me. Thank you so much. I really  
2 appreciate it, to, You're against me, you know, you don't want  
3 anything from me apart from kissing somebody's ass.

4 All those kind of, that really rapid switch from a positive  
5 perception to a now wholly negative perception. So again,  
6 illustrating this rapid shift in that really all or nothing  
7 thinking that we've discussed previously.

8 **Q.** Were you or anyone else on the treatment team, at this  
9 point, ever able to pull him back into sort of the understanding  
10 of, No, look, we're trying to help you. You should trust us?  
11 Were you ever able to get that?

12 **A.** Some limited openings. I know at the end of the  
13 session that he kind of makes his own opening to try to repair  
14 the relationship by complimenting my shoes, and that was kind of  
15 a little typical of his ways of interacting too. Kind of an  
16 attempt to say, Oh, you know, I have something good to say about  
17 you. So some of those little openings where he would kind of  
18 recognize some things and, you know, make a compliment and try  
19 to ... also try to repair that breach were present, but I think  
20 that that distrust was there and I perceived it, in part, being  
21 some difficulties with ending a relationship. He knew he was  
22 leaving soon and it's hard to leave a place where you feel that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 you've, you know, made some gains, you've had some support from  
2 peers. So this also might've just been an attempt to say, It's  
3 okay if I'm leaving because this was a bad place anyways.

4 **Q.** So almost sort of the relationship is coming to an end  
5 and maybe his way of sort of dealing with it?

6 **A.** Yeah. If you're struggling with kind of separation  
7 and abandonment, that can be a strategy.

8 **Q.** So his strategy to deal with the ending of a  
9 relationship and abandonment is to become frustrated, angry, and  
10 say, I don't trust you? Is that natural?

11 **A.** I'm speculating at this point, but I did get the  
12 feeling that, you know, being in this place where the  
13 relationship was ending was difficult for him and that was one  
14 way he was dealing with it.

15 **Q.** This way he was dealing with it, was this a symptom or  
16 cause from PTSD?

17 **A.** I understood it a little bit more as some of these  
18 kind of personality traits that I was highlighting. That  
19 difficulty with kind of abandonment, separation, rejection, and  
20 then that switch between overvaluing and devaluing those kind of  
21 typical core symptoms of borderline personality disorder. So I  
22 understood that in that context, but there is that distrust of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 people that can really be accentuated by trauma events. So  
2 they're not separated.

3 Q. So at this point, you indicate that Lionel Desmond  
4 knows that the relationship with the clinic is nearing an end  
5 point. Is that correct?

6 A. That's right. He's scheduled to leave at this point,  
7 I believe.

8 Q. I'm going to ask you about your observations of when  
9 he shows up to this meeting. You note under "Observations",  
10 "The client arrives with a new hairstyle, a Mohawk cut which he  
11 refers to as his warrior hairstyle. Mr. Desmond shows up to the  
12 session visibly angry but denies any concerns when the clinician  
13 inquires about his mood. Poor eye contact, frown, abrupt  
14 movements, tense posture."

15 So right out of the gate, does Lionel Desmond show up to  
16 this, one of these last meetings, angry and upset?

17 A. Mm-hmm. So that initial kind of description that I  
18 gave of him being very kind of physically, visibly upset about  
19 something, but then kind of denying that he was bothered about  
20 anything. Being able to address that a little bit more in that  
21 little bit of kind of calming down and a little bit more  
22 opening.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    What was he angry and upset for when he basically went  
2 into ... right into the meeting? Did you ever find out?

3           **A.**    I believe this was the session ... that was the  
4 session where he brought his perception that we were on the  
5 nurse's side, so I believe that was the source of the anger.

6           **Q.**    Okay. What, if anything ... people can wear different  
7 hairstyles, and I get it.

8           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

9           **Q.**    What did you make of the fact that he showed up with  
10 wearing a Mohawk hairstyle and then he refers to it and says  
11 it's his warrior hairstyle?

12          **A.**    I perceived it as an expression of anger that was ...  
13 I think it was a clumsy way of trying to show that he was angry.  
14 Throughout his stay and throughout his description of other  
15 interactions, he consistently describes difficulties bringing up  
16 his concerns to people in productive ways.

17           I mean if you read the session, it's not at all  
18 unreasonable to come to session with me and sit down and say,  
19 Listen, I really didn't appreciate this last meeting that we  
20 had. I really felt that you were taking the nurse's side. I  
21 feel like he had his share of responsibility in this interaction  
22 and I felt kind of disrespected in that meeting.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           That would've been a productive way to bring about his  
2 concerns but that was very difficult for him. And so I think  
3 that, in a way, he did want things to be addressed. There were  
4 so many visible outward signs of anger. He was making very  
5 little attempts to conceal them. So I think it was his way of  
6 saying, I have something on my mind. I'm bothered by something.  
7 I want to address it. I'm just not sure how. So, you know,  
8 making efforts in his own way.

9           **Q.** So the final session, page 297, that you have with him  
10 from August 10th, it's a psychotherapy session and you begin the  
11 session with what he's about to take away from his time at the  
12 residential clinic. And how does that session go overall?

13           **A.** I think fairly productive. I think I did note there  
14 was still some moments where I felt he was a bit more guarded.  
15 I did feel that we managed to move away from being completely a  
16 negative perception of his stay, which I felt was positive. I  
17 thought that he was able to identify some things during his stay  
18 that was helpful to him but, you know, I think that he was still  
19 very much struggling with this idea of, The only way that I can  
20 be safe and not be disappointed by people is to keep to myself  
21 and to assume the position that people are not worthy of trust.

22           **Q.** And did this concept of this deep-seated distrust in

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 others, was that prominent at this very last session?

2       **A.** I'm not sure if I would say "prominent". I think a  
3 good part of the session was dedicated to trying to consolidate  
4 gains that he'd made during the session and to really have him  
5 be able to verbalize what was useful to him, but a significant  
6 part of the session, I think, was also spent discussing that,  
7 which I think is a good way to highlight that this is still an  
8 area of concern and struggle that needs to continue to be worked  
9 on.

10       **Q.** Did he express to you how he felt about people  
11 speaking French while in his presence?

12       **A.** Mm-hmm. I think that, for him, it was a worry that  
13 when people were talking French, it was a way for them to talk  
14 about him without him understanding.

15       **Q.** Was he concerned with that?

16       **A.** I think there was some understanding him about his  
17 difficulties with trusting others and sometimes his tendency to  
18 assume that position that there is something nefarious going on  
19 against him. So he, himself, referred to it as being paranoid.  
20 And so really, that skew in assuming that people are talking  
21 about him or are ... you know, don't mean him well.

22       **(15:10)**

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**    So did he equate people speaking the French language  
2 with, They're talking about me?

3           **A.**    I'm not sure if that would've been in any ... in every  
4 situation, but certainly he said that that had occurred. I'm  
5 not sure if that was every time.

6           **Q.**    Okay. What was the comment about, he kind of told you  
7 about, The walls aren't soundproof around here or something like  
8 that?

9           **A.**    Yeah. So he was referring to the fact that, you know,  
10 he would've heard something said about him. I mean, as a  
11 general rule, we have team meetings, but they're very far from  
12 the unit, so I ... it's ... I'm not going to say impossible, but  
13 it's extremely unlikely he would've heard anything from the team  
14 meeting. And in any case, there's nothing that we say during  
15 team meetings that we wouldn't want clients to hear. It's all  
16 about coordinating care.

17           So I think that to him - again, this is speculative on my  
18 part - I wonder if he would've heard somebody say something in  
19 French and assumed that it would've been something against him.  
20 Or maybe he really did hear people talking behind his back.  
21 Again, speculative.

22           **Q.**    Did you seem to ... is there a sense that ... and Dr.



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 Ouellette talked about paranoid personality traits. Did they  
2 seem to be reflective in this session?

3 **A.** Again, it's so difficult when we talk about  
4 personality traits. That would assume that this is very  
5 longstanding and more than just worry about kind of the end of  
6 relationship. That might've been the case. Yeah, that might've  
7 been some other kind of personality traits that had to be  
8 considered.

9 **Q.** You noted at this last session that he tells you, "The  
10 client refers to his distrustful side as a lone wolf and he  
11 identifies thoughts pertaining to protecting himself and not  
12 trusting anyone."

13 **A.** My apologies. I think there's an "s" missing there.  
14 "Distrustful side". So he, again, was a big fan of using kind  
15 of imagery to describe his emotions and how he felt and his kind  
16 of philosophy about how he had to be in life. So his "lone  
17 wolf" was just this kind of latest imagery that he would use to  
18 say, you know, I'm better off by myself. I think that it's  
19 better if I protect myself by maintaining distance from other  
20 people.

21 **Q.** And I understand that when he was ... the plan when he  
22 was leaving and going to go to the airport, he wanted someone to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 accompany him to the airport?

2 **A.** Mm-hmm.

3 **Q.** And why was that important to him, did he say?

4 **A.** I think he felt a little worried that either the taxi  
5 driver would be French and he would be unable to communicate, or  
6 I think that in the previous situation, he had been with a taxi  
7 driver that spoke ... I'm not sure even if the taxi driver spoke  
8 Arabic or looked Middle Eastern, and that this was kind of  
9 activating for him.

10 **Q.** I believe your passage read, "He explains that when he  
11 is in a taxi and the driver speaks a foreign language, and even  
12 moreso when this individual is of Middle Eastern origin, he  
13 begins to feel uncomfortable not knowing where he is being taken  
14 and what is being said."

15 **A.** Mm-hmm.

16 **Q.** Do you recall that?

17 **A.** Yes, in a general sense, but again, where he's being  
18 taken, I'm not sure if he's ... I'm not sure if you're wondering  
19 if he's thinking he's being kidnapped. I think here, he's in a  
20 foreign city in a taxi cab with a taxi driver that doesn't  
21 necessarily speak the same language, and if the taxi driver is  
22 of Middle Eastern origin, that might also wake some residual

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 anxieties with regards to his deployment.

2       So I think there's a kind of constellation of factors which  
3 made him anxious.

4       **Q.** So collectively, when you look at this last session,  
5 at this last session he accuses staff of talking behind his  
6 back. He says the walls are not soundproof. When people are  
7 speaking French around him, they're talking about him. He wants  
8 someone to go with him to the airport because someone from a  
9 different ... Middle Eastern origin. He doesn't know where he's  
10 going to be taken or what is being said. And then he  
11 characterizes the tendency as being paranoid.

12       **A.** Mm-hmm.

13       **Q.** Is this paranoid-type conduct thought process  
14 behaviour, collectively?

15       **A.** It's certainly very distrustful. Does it kind of  
16 cross the line into outright paranoia? I don't know. I mean  
17 it's hard to tell in these situations. Maybe he did really hear  
18 either a participant or a staff made a comment about him which  
19 he thought was very difficult and then extrapolated that this  
20 was happening a lot. It's hard to say.

21       **Q.** And do you have ...

22       **A.** So I mean definitely distrustful.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1           **Q.**   And do you have any contact with Lionel Desmond after  
2 this date?

3           **A.**   I would have to say ... I would have to check if I saw  
4 him in ... I believe I saw him in group sessions afterwards.

5           **Q.**   Perhaps on the same date. Page 299?

6           **A.**   Yeah, I think on the same day, mm-hmm.

7           **Q.**   August 10th.

8           **A.**   So nothing too remarkable. I mean I did write down  
9 that he shared relevant examples of how he would've dealt with a  
10 presented situation, which is very good participation. He  
11 offered encouragement to other participants. So, you know,  
12 there were instances where that distrust was very much present,  
13 but there were also signs that he was trying to maintain some of  
14 those relationships. And just the fact that he asked for  
15 somebody from the unit to go with him in the taxi shows that the  
16 link of trust was not completely destroyed. But definitely a  
17 lot of distrust, yes.

18          **Q.**   So I guess where you left off - I'll end sort of with  
19 this - is, from your perspective, when Lionel Desmond left Ste.  
20 Anne's on August 15th, knowing his psychological portrait and  
21 the complexities of all the various diagnoses, is he someone  
22 that would've required little continuity of care follow-up, a

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 medium level, high level, or extremely high level, based on your  
2 experience of what you know about him?

3       **A.** I'm not sure what you mean. In terms of frequency?  
4 In terms of number of caretakers?

5       **Q.** I guess my question is, in terms of having supports,  
6 mental health supports, was he in need of none, a medium level,  
7 high level, or extremely high level? And what I mean by  
8 "supports", are from various entities: social work,  
9 occupational therapist, psychiatrist, psychology. Where did he  
10 fall on that continuum?

11       **A.** I can only assess how he was at Ste. Anne's. I think  
12 that determination would've been, had to have been, made when he  
13 returned back home because then his entire situation changes.  
14 If the relationship with his spouse is going well, if he's found  
15 a place in the community, if he's getting some support from his  
16 in-laws, if he's maintaining kind of physical activity  
17 activation in those pleasant activities, then the answer might  
18 be little to medium.

19       If all of these things have fallen through then it's ...  
20 people's mental health is not in stasis, right? And so  
21 everything in the environment is going to dictate what kind of  
22 support people need. So you do need to kind of assess, by these

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 different snapshots, what's necessary at that time. Some  
2 support, absolutely, but I think I would've liked to know how he  
3 was settled back home to know what kind of services he needed.

4 **Q.** When you identified at the early outset about goals  
5 and interventions you wanted to work on, how satisfactory ...  
6 Did those goals get achieved to some extent or was there still a  
7 lot of work to be done?

8 **A.** I think there still remained quite a bit of work to be  
9 done.

10 **Q.** Okay.

11 **A.** I wouldn't have recommended this be the end of  
12 treatment. That, I can say with certainty.

13 **Q.** Okay. I thank you, Dr. Gagnon. Thank you so much. I  
14 know I asked you maybe some difficult questions there and you've  
15 been testifying for a while so far today.

16 Your Honour, I've concluded my questions, so turn it back  
17 to the Court.

18 **THE COURT:** All right, thank you, Mr. Russell.

19 Dr. Gagnon, Counsel may have some additional questions for  
20 you, so I'll give you the opportunity ... we could either  
21 continue. If we do, we'll probably continue until the questions  
22 are put to you. We can also take a break if you'd like to have

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Direct Examination**

1 a short break.

2 **A.** I'd appreciate a short break, Your Honour.

3 **Q.** All right, fine. That's great then. We'll break for  
4 maybe 15 minutes. Will that be sufficient, Dr. Gagnon?

5 **A.** More than sufficient, thank you.

6 **Q.** All right, thank you then. So we'll adjourn for 15  
7 minutes, Counsel, thank you.

8 **COURT RECESSED (15:20 HRS)**

9 **COURT RESUMED (15:34 HRS.)**

10 **THE COURT:** Thank you. Mr. Anderson?

11 **MR. ANDERSON:** No questions, Your Honour.

12 **THE COURT:** Mr. Macdonald?

13 **MR. MACDONALD:** No questions, Your Honour.

14 **THE COURT:** Thank you. Ms. Miller? Dr. Gagnon, you can  
15 hear us all right, I take it?

16 **A.** Yes, I can hear you well.

17 **THE COURT:** All right. Thank you.

18

19 **CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS. MILLER**

20 **(15:34)**

21 **MS. MILLER:** Good afternoon, Dr. Gagnon. My name is Tara  
22 Miller and I'm the lawyer rep- ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **A.**    Good afternoon.

2           **Q.**    Good afternoon.  I'm representing the personal  
3 representative for Brenda Desmond, so that was Cpl. Desmond's  
4 mom, and also the personal representative for Aaliyah Desmond  
5 who was, of course, Cpl. Desmond's daughter.

6           I wanted to ask you some questions about the role of family  
7 of veterans and members who are being treated at Ste. Anne's  
8 and, in particular, the residential treatment program.  We heard  
9 from Dr. Ouellette yesterday that there was a day during the  
10 residential treatment program where family could come, so I'd  
11 like you to comment on that, and also if there are other avenues  
12 of involvement and engagement for family during that process.

13          **A.**    I'm afraid I really don't have many details.  Usually  
14 when family does come to visit, if they choose to do so for that  
15 day visit it really does serve the purpose of maintaining  
16 connection with family, you know, trying to foster that  
17 relationship, trying to see if there can be new, you know, forms  
18 of interaction with some progress that's hopefully been made in  
19 treatment, and also just getting some information about what  
20 your spouse might be going through.  I'm not usually overly  
21 involved in that.

22          I believe that you're speaking with Mrs. Hamilton tomorrow?



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.**    Correct.

2           **A.**    And from memory, I think that she's more involved in  
3 the relationships with the family members.

4           **Q.**    Okay. So that would not have been something that  
5 would have fallen under your umbrella of responsibility  
6 necessarily?

7           **A.**    I was aware of it, it was integrated into the program,  
8 but I was certainly not organizing or orchestrating anything.

9           **Q.**    Okay. From your resume, as I understand it, you  
10 started as the clinical care coordinator if I've got that  
11 correct, at ...

12          **A.**    I think it's clinical coordinator.

13          **Q.**    Clinical coordinator, thank you. You started at Ste.  
14 Anne's in April of 2016 and you ended in December of 2016?

15          **A.**    I think I started going earlier to get some  
16 information. I believe so.

17          **Q.**    Okay.

18          **A.**    But that's accurate otherwise.

19          **Q.**    How many patients/clients would you have seen, Dr.  
20 Gagnon, during that window of time in 2016? Are you able to  
21 say?

22          **A.**    I tried to do the math earlier and I believe it would

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 have been somewhere between ... somewhere around 15 probably.

2 Q. Fifteen? One-five.

3 A. Teen. Yeah, one-five.

4 Q. Okay. And would that have ...

5 A. 15 to 20, I think.

6 Q. 15 to 20, okay. And would that have included patients  
7 in the stabilization unit as well as the ones that would then  
8 progress to the residential treatment program?

9 A. So the way that the unit is structured is  
10 stabilization and residential are living together, they're not  
11 separate. It's a program that's kind of meant to be continual.  
12 So the patients that I would have seen in the stabilization part  
13 of the program would have been progressed, in large part, to the  
14 residential program.

15 Q. Okay. And when you were there were there any people  
16 who didn't progress?

17 Dr. Ouellette yesterday told us that one of the ... one of  
18 his goals as a psychiatrist is to, you know, stabilize and then  
19 assess appropriateness for integration into the residential  
20 treatment program. Do you recall if there were folks that did  
21 not progress because they weren't appropriate?

22 A. I don't believe so. I believe some people did not

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 conclude - did not finish the program because the fit just  
2 wasn't right, but I don't remember somebody leaving after  
3 stabilization. I know this might be hard to believe, but some  
4 details have gotten very vague after four years unfortunately.

5 Q. It's not hard to believe at all, Dr. Gagnon.

6 I wanted to ask you about your ... so from your evidence,  
7 the goal for your perspective I think you said this morning with  
8 my friend, Mr. Russell, was to return members to treatment teams  
9 with more skills and strategies to address their issues moving  
10 forward. Is that ... did I capture that ...

11 A. That's right.

12 Q. ... that correctly? Yes.

13 You talked about too there is sort of three gold standard  
14 treatments for PTSD and those would be EMDR?

15 A. That's right.

16 Q. Yeah. And then cognitive behavioural therapy of which  
17 prolonged exposure is a subset. Is that accurate?

18 A. That's right.

19 Q. And is the third one cognitive processing therapy or  
20 thought processing therapy?

21 A. Cognitive processing therapy. That's right.

22 Q. Okay. And through your time with Cpl. Desmond in the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 residential treatment program, were you able to engage in any of  
2 those three treatments?

3 **(15:40)**

4 **A.** So, the ... you know, when I say "gold standard" these  
5 are treatments that are manualized, so they're often kind of the  
6 best study. You know, CBT in general is considered one of  
7 those, a bit of a golden approach. So I think again that may  
8 have shifted since I've left, but the goal when people were at  
9 Ste. Anne's was not necessarily to do that processing phase.

10 **Q.** Yeah.

11 **A.** I'm sorry, I hope I'm not throwing too much technical  
12 detail. But often when we treat PTSD there's this overarching  
13 kind of treatment progress, which is that stabilization phase  
14 where we enhance people's skills, you know, we deal with any  
15 kind of pressing stressors, you know, sleep hygiene, self-care,  
16 behavioural activation, all these things.

17 And then the second phase would be that trauma processing  
18 phase, where we use those treatments like CPT, prolonged  
19 exposure and EMDR. And then the third phase would usually be  
20 reintegration where treatment is slowly discontinued, people can  
21 re-integrate to the community, you know, find new activities,  
22 new purpose, new employment, new meeting ...

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.**    Okay.

2           **A.**    ... post-traumatic growth, all of that.

3           So the focus really was more for that initial piece which  
4 was more the stabilization phase. So I did not engage in EMDR,  
5 prolonged exposure, or CPT with the member. I did engage in CBT  
6 which would be more working on those cognitions, activating  
7 through behaviour, some of those interventions.

8           **Q.**    So is it fair to say that the treatment that Cpl.  
9 Desmond received during the residential treatment phase would  
10 largely have been the cognitive behavioural therapy, the  
11 psychoeducation piece?

12          **A.**    Psychoeducation being a part of the treatment but with  
13 that cognitive restructuring which is part of cognitive process  
14 ... cognitive behavioural therapy, apologies.

15          **Q.**    Okay. Would you have had any knowledge, Dr. Gagnon,  
16 of the previous treatments that he had received for PTSD when he  
17 was in the CAF or when he was seen at an OSI clinic in New  
18 Brunswick before he arrived?

19          **A.**    I think that might have been ... that information  
20 might have been partly present in the summary the team sent to  
21 us, but I don't recall what was in that summary, it was a while  
22 ago.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.** You said that you believed the treatment focus at Ste.  
2 Anne's has changed since you have left. Can you share with us  
3 what you understand those changes have been from returning the  
4 member to treatment teams with more skills and strategies.  
5 That's what the focus you articulated was when you were there.  
6 What is your understanding of how it's changed?

7           **A.** So my belief is based on the fact that when I worked  
8 there there was starting to be discussions around do we have the  
9 time, do we have the space to offer more of that processing. I  
10 have remained a little bit in contact with my former colleagues,  
11 and so my understanding is there was a little bit more openness  
12 and encouragement to engage a little bit more processing.

13           I think it would have been ... actually, no, I won't  
14 speculate. Like prolonged exposure and cognitive processing  
15 therapy, they're fairly long treatments. They average about 12  
16 weeks to go through as a manualized treatment, so I'm not sure  
17 if that was put in place or not. But certainly a little bit  
18 more room for that processing phase was being discussed.

19           **Q.** Okay. So there was no processing that was going on,  
20 is it fair to say, during your time at Ste. Anne's because of  
21 the window of time needed to do that effectively, the 12 weeks?

22           **A.** There's always some processing that occurs any time

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 you're sharing experiences and getting support from peers and  
2 thinking about the beliefs around trauma events. But directly  
3 as a focus of taking sessions and going for the next ten  
4 sessions we're doing processing, you know, deliberately and  
5 consistently, no.

6 Q. Okay. So no prolonged exposure, no EMDR ...

7 A. No.

8 Q. ... during that time? Okay. Or cognitive processing.

9 Thank you.

10 A. Not those manualized treatments.

11 Q. Manualized.

12 A. Exposure is something else, but ... yeah.

13 Q. Okay. Thank you.

14 You were ... Dr. Ouellette was very clear with us yesterday  
15 that his involvement was just with respect to the stabilization  
16 program. He did not have any role other than I think to be on  
17 call and he said he was never called while Cpl. Desmond was in  
18 the residential treatment program.

19 But I understand that your role started at the  
20 stabilization timeframe and then moved forward through to and  
21 continued until Cpl. Desmond's discharge from the residential  
22 treatment program. Is that correct?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **A.**    That's right, yes.

2           **Q.**    Okay.  And what was your role during the stabilization  
3 program period?

4           **A.**    So stabilization, I usually have a little bit more  
5 leeway to provide more individual sessions, facilitating  
6 people's entrance into the program, assessing their needs, that  
7 psychodiagnostic assessment was performed pretty much as a  
8 matter of course.  Having an intervention plan that all the  
9 different caregivers on the team could really be collaboratively  
10 engaged in, so that would have been kind of more that  
11 stabilization phase.

12          **Q.**    Dr. Ouellette shared with us yesterday that one of -  
13 and you talked about it a little bit today in your evidence -  
14 that one of the challenges for him was that he had prescribed  
15 some medication changes and in particular he wanted ... he had  
16 prescribed a medication for a mood stabilizer, Topamax I think  
17 the name of it was, to Cpl. Desmond and that he was resistant to  
18 changes in some existing medication but he flat out was not  
19 going to take the Topamax.

20           He expressed, as I recall his evidence, that - "he" being  
21 Dr. Ouellette - that those medication changes were going to be  
22 very important in terms of helping to stabilize Cpl. Desmond's



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 mood to set him up for, you know, optimal success in the  
2 residential treatment program.

3       **A.**     Mmm.

4       **Q.**     Notwithstanding that, I understand and I think you  
5 were part of a discussion around still progressing Cpl. Desmond  
6 through that residential treatment phase, Dr. Ouellette  
7 indicated that his hope was that in the residential treatment  
8 phase, that with group therapy work Cpl. Desmond might change  
9 his mind about the medication that had been prescribed.

10       Were you aware that that was what Dr. Ouellette had been  
11 sort of hoping might happen in terms of medication moving  
12 forward for Cpl. Desmond?

13       **A.**     So the general belief that you expressed before, the  
14 idea that medication is often put in place so that people can  
15 benefit from interventions in an optimal way, that I was aware.  
16 Certainly, you know, I think Dr. Ouellette had indicated that  
17 that was an optimal outcome.

18       I'm not sure he shared to me that his hope was that group  
19 treatment would facilitate that. I can see why he might have  
20 thought that, right, sharing some of your concerns with peers  
21 and maybe if they had had positive experiences. But this ... I  
22 think that he was hoping this would happen in a kind of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 ecological manner, not having us try to kind of direct the group  
2 to talk in positive ways about medication or anything like that.

3 Q. So in either your individual sessions with Cpl.  
4 Desmond and/or group therapy that he would have been involved  
5 in, would there ever have been a revisiting of the  
6 appropriateness of certain medications to your recall, Dr.  
7 Gagnon?

8 A. I think if anything I would have validated some of his  
9 frustrations and kind of said that his ... you know, he was  
10 allowed to have his concerns. I think that we do try to make  
11 clear, you know, risks and benefits. And that belief that we  
12 have that this is the path forward that he would have best been  
13 able to benefit from treatment would have been made clear to  
14 him. But after that I do strongly believe that people should be  
15 allowed to make their own decisions and that they shouldn't  
16 necessarily feel undue pressure to change their mind. So I  
17 think that having expressed kind of what he wanted with us  
18 having presented some of the upsides and downsides of his  
19 choices, that was kind of up to him at that point.

20 Q. Okay. But that was in the stabilization program. I  
21 guess my question was: Would there have ever been an opportunity  
22 - and maybe the nature of the treatment in the residential

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 treatment program would never have allowed that - to revisit,  
2 you know, with the work that was being done in the residential  
3 treatment program to revisit medication use?

4 **A.** Unless he had indicated to us this is something I want  
5 to revisit; I'd like to have another go at this. But even then,  
6 you know, as time went on in the residential phase, one of the  
7 goals of working on medication right away when people arrive is  
8 that you have time to make adjustments.

9 So I'm ... again, you would have to confirm with Dr.  
10 Ouellette, but I hesitate to say that he would have been  
11 overjoyed about making medication changes two weeks before  
12 departure or one week before departure. So there is a certain  
13 time-sensitive element.

14 **Q.** Okay. Thank you. I want to move now, Dr. Gagnon, to  
15 various reports that were authored by those in your team.

16 **A.** Okay.

17 **Q.** There seem to be several reports of significance, if I  
18 can say that. There's Dr. Ouellette's initial detailed report  
19 of May 31st where he provides the diagnosis of PTSD ...

20 **A.** Okay.

21 **Q.** ... depression, these comorbid conditions, but it's  
22 also the first time we see mixed personality traits.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           There then is a detailed report which I understand you  
2 participated in dated August the 17th, that's the  
3 interdisciplinary team discharge report. Do you remember that?

4           **(15:50)**

5           **A.**    Okay.

6           **Q.**    That's found at page 268 of the exhibit ... the number  
7 which escapes me. 254.

8           **A.**    You said ... (inaudible).

9           **Q.**    Yes. So it says ... as you can see it says, "Date  
10 prepared August 17th, 2016."

11          **A.**    Okay.

12          **Q.**    And then if we go to the last page there's a few  
13 pieces of information. There's a ... well, there's a section  
14 that you've authored, is that fair to say?

15          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

16          **Q.**    Do you recall that? Yes. And ...

17          **A.**    Yes.

18          **Q.**    ... the report itself looks like it's ... it says  
19 "electronically signed on October the 4th, 2016".

20          **A.**    Okay.

21          **Q.**    Do you remember how that report comes to be pulled  
22 together, Dr. Gagnon?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **A.**    So the person that usually coordinates is Mrs.  
2 Hamilton, the social worker, so she would have kind of sent out  
3 a message to the different participants in the care, and said,  
4 You know we are discharging this member soon; send me your  
5 different points that you would like to be included in the  
6 summary.

7           **Q.**    Okay. So do you see the completed report or do you  
8 just forward your component for inclusion in the report and then  
9 never see it again?

10          **A.**    We ... I don't remember seeing the completed report,  
11 all the different pieces put together. Every week we kind of  
12 discuss our different clients in a collaborative way, so we  
13 would have ... I seem to remember that we would mention to each  
14 other what we thought would be included in that but then, of  
15 course, we would send a written version to Mrs. Hamilton ...

16          **Q.**    Okay. She ...

17          **A.**    ... for her to include.

18          **Q.**    She sort of holds the pen to compile the whole report?

19          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

20          **Q.**    Okay. We also understand that before that report was  
21 prepared there would have been a telephone conference with Cpl.  
22 Desmond's outside care team in preparation for his discharge and

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 continuity of care. Do you remember ...

2 **A.** That would be our standard procedure, yes.

3 **Q.** Yes, okay. Do you remember participating in that  
4 call?

5 **A.** I would have participated in that call but I don't  
6 remember it.

7 **Q.** Okay. No, fair enough. And to the extent that you  
8 can remember, generally the purpose of that call, what would you  
9 have ... what would the information been shared with the outside  
10 care team? I don't need specifics but ...

11 **A.** So ...

12 **Q.** ... generally for a client who's being discharged.

13 **A.** ... generally we'll say kind of what we think were  
14 some good treatment gains, what we think were some remaining  
15 challenges. You know, what we think our avenues of further  
16 investigation or areas that still require treatment. Any  
17 concerns we might have would probably be mentioned at that time.  
18 Generally, in a general way, that would be the information that  
19 would be shared.

20 **Q.** And the purpose of that call is to inform the outside  
21 team of what to expect when this client is returned into their  
22 care. Is that fair to say?

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **A.**    That's right.

2           **Q.**    To have a head's up on what these recommendations are  
3 going to be. Is that correct?

4           **A.**    Mm-hmm.

5           **Q.**    Yeah. And is that ...

6           **A.**    Yeah, and to allow them to ask any questions they  
7 might have.

8           **Q.**    Yeah. And to start to action those recommendations.  
9 Is that fair to say as well?

10          **A.**    Potentially, if some need to, yes.

11          **Q.**    Okay. Because we know that the final report wasn't  
12 signed - the final discharge report wasn't signed until October  
13 4th, but given what you've shared with us and what we understand  
14 is the purpose of that case call that happened on August the  
15 9th, that information may not have been shared in writing until  
16 the beginning of October.

17          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

18          **Q.**    But certainly, based on what you're saying - correct  
19 me if I'm not understanding it correctly - that information  
20 about recommendations, that would have been shared in August  
21 typically.

22          **A.**    In a general fashion I can say typically.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.**    Okay. Thank you. The other two reports that are of  
2   some significance I would say are your ... the two reports that  
3   my friend, Mr. Russell, reviewed with you this morning and  
4   they're both dated December 27th. There's your psychological  
5   evaluation report and then your closing note.

6           Your term at Ste. Anne's came to an end at the end of  
7   December is that correct? Because you moved ...

8           **A.**    That's right.

9           **Q.**    Yeah, okay. But you had indicated earlier that there  
10  were some ... the reason for the delay in authoring those  
11  reports is because you needed some time to reflect, I think, and  
12  to be confident in ...

13          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

14          **Q.**    ... what you were writing in those reports? Okay.

15          **A.**    To review my notes and review the information I had,  
16  yeah.

17          **Q.**    Did you receive any new information, Dr. Gagnon, from  
18  when Cpl. Desmond was discharged on August the 17th to when you  
19  would have completed that report?

20          **A.**    I don't believe so. I don't remember getting any new  
21  information.

22          **Q.**    Okay. And if you had have, it would have been



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 included in the Ste. Anne's file pertaining to Cpl. Desmond?

2 **A.** I don't see how I would have gotten any new  
3 information. It would have been fairly inappropriate for me to  
4 have access to information for somebody who's been discharged  
5 from my care.

6 **Q.** Okay. So that ... I will take you to another point.  
7 You had recommended and your team had recommended a  
8 neuropsychological assessment. That was identified in August.

9 **A.** That's right.

10 **Q.** And you said earlier this morning that you needed that  
11 to rule out ... to be more certain of your diagnosis.

12 **A.** Mm-hmm.

13 **Q.** So what ... would you ever have expected to get back  
14 the neuropsychological report?

15 **A.** The only circumstance I can think of is sometimes  
16 people come back for another kind of ... another go at a stay at  
17 Ste. Anne's, that might have been a circumstance. Although I  
18 left so that would have not happened at the end, but that might  
19 have been a circumstance that that would have happened.

20 But no, my expectation would have been to kind of ... I've  
21 pushed inquiry a little bit further with this kind of  
22 information now what are the conclusions.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.**    Okay.  So you would ... if you had stayed and if a  
2    neuropsych assessment had been done, you would never have  
3    expected to see the results which would ever have allowed you to  
4    finalize a more definitive diagnosis?

5           **A.**    And I wouldn't have retroactively gone back and  
6    changed a report, because I would have had to see the member  
7    again to make sure my information were up to date.

8           **Q.**    Okay.  So those four things we talked about,  Dr.  
9    Ouellette's diagnosis of May 31st, his report, the ...

10          **A.**    Mm-hmm.

11          **Q.**    ... interdisciplinary discharge report and then your  
12    two final reports of December 27th, where do you understand that  
13    each of those reports went after they were completed in terms of  
14    being provided to Cpl. Desmond's external team?

15          **A.**    So do you mean what's my understanding of what  
16    happened to them?

17          **Q.**    Yeah, where ...

18          **A.**    So ...

19          **Q.**    What's your understanding of what the process would  
20    have been in terms of where they should have gone, if anywhere?

21          **A.**    So my understanding is when a client concludes their  
22    stay at Ste. Anne's, that summary with the vital information,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 then gets sent to the referring team.

2 Q. And when you say the summary with the file  
3 information, is that the discharge report?

4 A. If that's the name. I believe that's what the name  
5 officially is, yes.

6 Q. Okay. So outside of that discharge report, is it your  
7 understanding that that's the only document that gets sent back  
8 to the outside team?

9 A. Unless there's a specific request, I believe so.

10 Q. Okay. So if the diagnosis of mixed personality traits  
11 was not referenced in that discharge report, is it fair to say  
12 that Cpl. Desmond's external team or any member's external team  
13 would never know about that diagnosis because they wouldn't  
14 receive either the May 31st report from Dr. Ouellette or your  
15 December 27th reports?

16 A. I'd have to look at Dr. Ouellette's assessment to see  
17 and then compare with ... actually, sorry, I'm not going to do  
18 that; I won't speak to, you know, what he meant. But, you know,  
19 when you say a personality trait, for instance, impulsivity  
20 would be something that might be a personality trait. So if in  
21 my report I say impulsivity is a concern for the member then I  
22 don't necessarily need to describe it as a personality trait for

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 that to be reflected.

2 So, for instance, in my summary I believe I raised my  
3 concern with emotional regulation and emotional volatility, and  
4 so that is the essential information from my report which I  
5 believe needed to make its way to the external team.

6 Q. Okay, but in terms ...

7 A. So it's a des- ... oh sorry, go ahead.

8 Q. No, you finish. Sorry, the lag.

9 A. So ... yeah, exactly. So it's the description of the  
10 difficulties I think need addressing without necessarily putting  
11 a tag on them, that make their way to the external treatment  
12 team.

13 Q. Okay. So in terms of the specific diagnosis that we  
14 know that Dr. Ouellette provided of mixed personality traits and  
15 your specific diagnosis in your December 27th report of  
16 borderline personality traits, if that's ...

17 A. That's not a diagnosis.

18 Q. Okay, that was not a diagnosis. That was just a flag?

19 A. No. Exactly. This is ... when I say "borderline  
20 personality traits" I am describing them by saying difficulties  
21 with emotional regulation and similar concerns.

22 So a borderline personality disorder is a diagnosis, which

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 I did not make because I was not confident that this was  
2 present. Therefore, I would not want that to be reflected in  
3 the summary report because even if I did say I suspect  
4 borderline personality disorder; I believe this may be present,  
5 I would realistically have concerns that then people take that,  
6 fly with it and then that's a tag that gets put on. I have seen  
7 that happen in the past. So I prefer to describe, you know,  
8 narratively, what my concerns are. And so the concerns, the  
9 area for work, the areas that need to be worked on and that  
10 require treatment gets carried to the external treatment team.  
11 So that is, in a sense, why I believe the summary is important.

12 **(16:00)**

13 **Q.** Okay, thank you. We have heard throughout the  
14 evidence over the last week and then this week, Dr. Gagnon,  
15 examples of treatment providers seeing Cpl. Desmond experience  
16 dissociation. Did you ever experience any dissociative events  
17 or experiences with Cpl. Desmond when you were in either a group  
18 session or in individual session?

19 **A.** So dissociation ... again, I apologize if I'm offering  
20 too many technical details, but dissociation, like pretty much  
21 any other difficulty, would be on a continuum. So the average  
22 person suffering from mental health condition might experience

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 dissociation. So emotional numbing when faced with difficult  
2 news, a difficult situation, that could be considered  
3 dissociation. So I think that a determination needs to be made.

4 So to answer your question, yeah. I think that, you know,  
5 when Mr. Desmond kind of described a little bit of that loss of  
6 control, that might've been dissociation. When he talked about  
7 healing, like, he was experiencing some sensory reminders of his  
8 deployments, that might've been dissociation. But you always  
9 want to consider, on that continuum, is this something that is  
10 recurrent and persistent enough to require individual clinical  
11 attention or should that be expected to subside in the course of  
12 treatment for trauma.

13 Q. Okay. Did you ever observe Cpl. Desmond having  
14 flashbacks while he was in session with you?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Okay. I want to ask you a very specific question.  
17 It's because we've heard through family members that Cpl.  
18 Desmond expressed concerns that the people who were in the  
19 program with him were seniors. They were a lot older. So I  
20 want to back that ... give you that and I want to go back.

21 A. Hmm.

22 Q. You said during your time there, you would've had

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 about 15 to 20 patients who went through the residential  
2 treatment program. How many people would've been with Cpl.  
3 Desmond during his time in the residential phase of the program?

4 **A.** I'd really have to have access to the files to answer  
5 that. I really don't want to give you erroneous information.

6 **Q.** Okay. But it certainly wouldn't have been any more  
7 than 15 to 20.

8 **A.** At the same time?

9 **Q.** Sure, yes.

10 **A.** Oh, I believe ... oh boy, I'd have to confirm. I  
11 think there are six or eight beds at Ste. Anne's.

12 **Q.** Okay, yeah.

13 **A.** So, no, there would never be 15 people at the same  
14 time.

15 **Q.** Okay. And the ages of those individuals that you  
16 would've seen, between 15 and 20, can you give us some context  
17 if any of them were seniors, as has been, you know, conveyed by  
18 some family members that they understood from Cpl. Desmond?

19 **A.** I'm really not trying to evade the question. I think  
20 the most accurate I can be is I saw both younger members and  
21 older members, so I think I've seen a wide range of ages. But I  
22 wouldn't feel comfortable giving an average age.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **Q.**   No, and fair enough.  And certainly, when you say  
2 "older" ages, what would the oldest age be that could have  
3 possibly been there?

4           **A.**   Oh boy.  Again, best estimate, 60s?

5           **Q.**   Okay, thank you.

6           My last series of questions, Dr. Gagnon, relate to the PTSD  
7 and the mixed personality trait.  So is it fair to say that  
8 there was never any doubt that Cpl. Desmond had combat-related  
9 PTSD when he showed up?

10          **A.**   Not on my part.

11          **Q.**   Okay, thank you.  And that that was as a result of a  
12 combat mission that had taken place a significant period of time  
13 before he ended up at Ste. Anne's.  This was ... we understand  
14 he was in Afghanistan in 2007.

15          **A.**   2007.

16          **Q.**   Yes.  So nine years later, he is experiencing combat-  
17 related PTSD.  And so we take from that that that means his PTSD  
18 was prolonged and chronic for that extended period of time?

19          **A.**   I'm not sure when symptoms began to emerge, but  
20 certainly he seemed to have been dealing with symptoms for a  
21 while, yes.

22          **Q.**   Okay.  And I believe you said that his anger outbursts



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1 would not be uncommon with patients with PTSD?

2 **A.** I would not consider them uncommon, no.

3 **Q.** Okay. I think ... and I just, again, I'm capturing my  
4 recording in some of your notes. You said his inappropriate  
5 expressions of anger and anger outbursts were a diagnostic  
6 criteria with a lot of people with PTSD.

7 **A.** So in the last category, which is kind of that  
8 hyperactivation category, irritability and outbursts of anger  
9 are a diagnostic criteria, yes.

10 **Q.** Okay. And in addition to those criteria and symptoms  
11 of PTSD, we also understand that there were these mixed  
12 personality traits. The mistrust, the ... but I think you said  
13 impulsivity could be as a result of PTSD as well?

14 **A.** Could be.

15 **Q.** Yeah.

16 **A.** There's a lot of overlap between some of these  
17 different difficulties.

18 **Q.** Symptoms, yeah. It's hard to tease them out as being  
19 allocated to either PTSD or personality traits. Is that fair to  
20 say?

21 **A.** Mm-hmm.

22 **Q.** Okay.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Miller**

1           **A.**    That is fair to say, yes.

2           **Q.**    In any event, there were a host of issues that  
3 primarily fell under the emotional regulation that were going to  
4 need further work for Cpl. Desmond when he was discharged from  
5 Ste. Anne's. Correct?

6           **A.**    That's accurate, yes.

7           **Q.**    Yeah. And is it fair to say that it's not really ever  
8 the expectation that somebody would come through the residential  
9 treatment program and be completely finished and not need any  
10 further treatment or follow-up?

11          **A.**    That would be ... if that were the case, that would be  
12 an outlier as opposed to the rule.

13          **Q.**    Right. You would expect folks to come through the  
14 program, to be discharged with recommendations to go back into  
15 their external care team for implementation and continuity of  
16 care. Correct?

17          **A.**    That was the usual process, yes.

18          **Q.**    Okay. And that's why implementation of those  
19 recommendations would be so critical for their future success  
20 back in community and back in their external circle of care.

21          **A.**    We wouldn't recommend things if we didn't think that  
22 they would be beneficial for the member, yes.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **Q.** Thank you, Dr. Gagnon. I appreciate your time today.

2           **A.** Thank you, Ms. Miller.

3           **THE COURT:** Thank you, Ms. Miller. Mr. Rodgers?

4

5

**CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. RODGERS**

6           **(16:07)**

7           **MR. RODGERS:** Thank you, Your Honour. Good afternoon, Dr.

8 Gagnon.

9           **A.** Good afternoon.

10           **Q.** I'm Adam Rodgers and I represent the personal  
11 representative for Cpl. Lionel Desmond, and so I have a few  
12 questions for you as well. Thank you for your endurance  
13 throughout the day here.

14           Doctor, I just want to start with just a general sense of  
15 the Ste. Anne's facility, thinking of it from the perspective of  
16 a soldier, a combat veteran, attending the facility. It would  
17 seem, Doctor, that there's different levels of needs when it  
18 comes to a combat veteran. Some would return home and just go  
19 home. Some would have a little bit of counselling and peer  
20 support maybe. Some would have more long-term counselling. And  
21 then there are others that, the more serious cases that don't  
22 get resolved in those manners that would be referred to or would

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 attend at a residential facility like Ste. Anne's. So is that  
2 fair that this is a facility for those that haven't been able to  
3 reach the resolution through other means?

4       **A.** So the reasons why people would refer clients to us  
5 could be varied. Sometimes it would be kind of more  
6 psychosocial barriers. So, for instance, having a few young  
7 kids at home. So there's so many responsibilities that there's  
8 no time to engage in psychotherapy and kind of all the time is  
9 being taken by family responsibility. There might be an  
10 arrangement where support is provided to the family and then  
11 somebody comes to Ste. Anne's. Sometimes people have trouble  
12 engaging in what's called "exposure". So, for instance, for  
13 some people, it becomes very anxiety-inducing to leave their  
14 home. And so without a therapist with them to support them in  
15 those exercises, that might be difficult. Whereas in Ste.  
16 Anne's, because that's part of the program, that might provide  
17 that extra, or that different type of support that's needed.

18       So I wouldn't say that how long people have been dealing  
19 with things is necessarily the defining criteria for if they get  
20 referred to Ste. Anne's or not. I think there's specific  
21 benefits to that residential aspect of treatment which external  
22 teams saw as being beneficial. Does that answer your question,

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 Mr. Rodgers?

2 **(16:10)**

3 **Q.** It does. It's interesting because, you know, for some  
4 situations then, the residential option may be the first and  
5 best option, whereas for others, it may be that they've tried  
6 other options, counselling in the community or just on their  
7 own, and then they've discovered that they, or somebody has  
8 discovered that they need the residential care.

9 **A.** I'm not sure if the first option would be Ste. Anne's  
10 to discover that some of these specific needs are in place that  
11 might be better addressed by residential treatment. Somebody  
12 would have to assess them and potentially try to give care in  
13 another setting to find that there would be that specific need.  
14 I don't know if I've ever heard of anybody, in the time that I  
15 was there, that that was kind of the first thing that was  
16 suggested.

17 **Q.** In fact, it may be more accurate to think of it as the  
18 last, best option for certain individuals. Certainly, one might  
19 think that in Cpl. Desmond's case, where he had tried other ...  
20 where other options had been tried with him, you know, in the  
21 community care and different psychiatrists, psychologists, over  
22 the course of several years, and that this may have been

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 characterized, or it might be accurately characterized, as his  
2 last, best option.

3 **A.** I'm not sure who would characterize that in that way.

4 **Q.** Well, if I could put it this way, in broad, very  
5 unscientific terms, if this didn't work, what was next?

6 **A.** I find myself ...

7 **THE COURT:** All right. Sorry, Mr. Rodgers, you might be  
8 able to ask the question in a little different way, but I'm  
9 going to suggest to you that you shouldn't be ... that kind of a  
10 question that's just wide open and asking the doctor to  
11 speculate on an answer, okay, because clearly, whatever the  
12 outcome was at Ste. Anne's, he was going to be referred back to  
13 whatever the treating team was.

14 **MR. RODGERS:** Yes.

15 **THE COURT:** And so really, you should be asking the  
16 treating team, the treatment team, you know, what if, or what  
17 would happen, as opposed to Dr. Gagnon whose team was just kind  
18 of a step along the way here.

19 **MR. RODGERS:** Certainly. It seems like a significant step  
20 along the way. I will rephrase that, though, Dr. Gagnon.

21 **THE COURT:** I'm not saying it's not important.

22 **MR. RODGERS:** Sure.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **THE COURT:**       But the question that you're asking is not  
2 ... isn't, in my view, particularly the way you asked it - is  
3 not a question you should be asking Dr. Gagnon. Thank you.

4           **MR. RODGERS:**    Thank you, Your Honour.

5           So, Dr. Gagnon, I want to ... so I'm thinking of in terms  
6 of intensity and having a team approach, a team on hand, to help  
7 a combat veteran. Would there be a further option that you  
8 could think of that would be more intensive with a bigger team  
9 or something more in-depth?

10          **A.**    Mr. Rodgers, I feel like you're equating kind of this  
11 residential treatment as the ultimate thing that can be tried,  
12 and if that doesn't work, then nothing will work. Maybe I'm  
13 speculating to what you're trying to say, but I feel like that's  
14 what I'm understanding. And what I will say and as a very  
15 general way, different people respond to different modalities  
16 and I can't think of a situation where I would ever even think  
17 to myself, well, if that didn't work, nothing will.

18          You know, people ... situations change. They evolve  
19 throughout their lives. The stressors in their lives change.  
20 They develop skills. They connect well with certain providers  
21 who have, you know, a certain approach that meshes well with  
22 their own personal style. So I think it behooves us as

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 clinicians to try different avenues of treatment and not  
2 necessarily ... and again, I may be reading into what you're  
3 trying to read me, but necessarily think there's nothing better  
4 than this big care team that will work for the member because,  
5 you know, what people will respond to varies widely.

6 Q. That was basically what I was trying to ask you,  
7 Doctor, so I appreciate ...

8 A. Okay. So I did understand that correctly.

9 Q. I appreciate you framing it in that way and I  
10 appreciate the answer as well because that is helpful.

11 So in other words, while this intensive residential program  
12 may be completely appropriate in some cases, for other  
13 individuals, it may be a step along the way or it may not be  
14 what they need specifically.

15 A. It might ultimately be unhelpful despite us piling on  
16 all this great care onto people. Sometimes for people, the  
17 group approach is not appropriate for them. It's too  
18 intimidating. Or it's not the right time for them to engage in  
19 this kind of treatment.

20 So really, every treatment is so individual. We have kind  
21 of these very broad overarching best practices, but at the end  
22 of the day, we're just trying to figure out what fits with



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 people. What might be helpful? And what's helpful today might  
2 not be helpful with what's helpful in two months from now. So  
3 it is really always kind of checking in and figuring out what's  
4 helpful now. More care, less care, different care.

5 Q. All right. It seems, Doctor, when Cpl. Desmond left  
6 Ste. Anne's ... First of all, maybe you can help us with this.  
7 We're saying that he left early. Is there a typical timeframe  
8 that we would normally expect for somebody staying at a  
9 residential treatment facility or staying at Ste. Anne's?

10 A. Mm-hmm. May I ask you why we're saying that he left  
11 early?

12 Q. Well, I think the expectation was that this was a six-  
13 month program.

14 A. Again, I might just need to review my files, but  
15 duration varied according to how long the stabilization phase  
16 was, so that varied according to some members. And then the  
17 residential phase was usually, I believe, around eight sessions.  
18 So I'm not sure ... maybe it's my own recall that's faulty, but  
19 did somebody from Ste. Anne's say that he left early because of  
20 a specific reason?

21 Q. Well, the report we have, Doctor, is that he wanted to  
22 leave in order to return to Nova Scotia before the school year

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 started to spend some time with his daughter.

2 **A.** Okay.

3 **Q.** And that, in fact, he left prior to the completion of  
4 the program. Certainly, when we review the conclusions from the  
5 providers, it seems that the treatment was incomplete, or at  
6 least there was certainly plenty of recommendations for further  
7 treatment. I'm not sure how you'd characterize that.

8 **A.** So I think that when you mentioned that school year  
9 kind of jogged my memory a little bit but I don't think that ...  
10 certainly not from my point of view and maybe it's best if I  
11 just speak from my own point of view.

12 **Q.** Sure, that's fine.

13 **A.** Certainly, from my point of view, having those  
14 recommendations in place would not have been an unusual outcome.  
15 I think that his treatment gains were limited and that was, you  
16 know, something that we were aware of and we wanted to make sure  
17 that, you know, they were capitalized on down the road. But  
18 having recommendations at the end of treatment is ... would be a  
19 normal part of the process.

20 **Q.** One of the recommendations you made ... and I won't go  
21 through all of your ... we've seen the discharge report which is  
22 at page 268, so we don't need to go through all those

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 recommendations but certainly one of them was a detailed  
2 neuropsychological evaluation because of the complexities of  
3 Cpl. Desmond's presentation. Would that be a fair assessment of  
4 that recommendation?

5 **A.** So that recommendation was made because of some  
6 cognitive difficulties that I observed which may or may not have  
7 been simply kind of the result of symptoms of PTSD, but having  
8 doubts, I wanted to make sure that that was properly assessed to  
9 see if there were any other underlying causes.

10 **Q.** Dr. Gagnon, you may not be aware of this, but Cpl.  
11 Desmond didn't have any contact with any mental health  
12 professionals until October 24th when he left Ste. Anne's, so  
13 over two months later when his wife, Shanna Desmond, brought him  
14 into the emergency room.

15 Given the recommendations that you made, would that two-  
16 month gap be a concern? Would it be a big concern? What  
17 consequences would you foresee as a result of that? Or I should  
18 say just what do you think of that time gap and the potential  
19 problems that would bring?

20 **(16:20)**

21 **A.** Well, I don't know about that. I don't feel that I  
22 can really speak intelligently as to that time gap. I don't

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 know what the member was up to during that time gap. I don't  
2 know what his needs would've been during that time gap. You  
3 know, the way things usually happened was that when those  
4 recommendations were made, they would return to an established  
5 treatment team. Again, correct me if I'm misrecalling if that's  
6 not what happened. As you mentioned, I don't have a lot of  
7 details about what happened after his stay at Ste. Anne's. But  
8 I believe the member moved, so in these times of transition, was  
9 it expected that he not have kind of those contacts? I don't  
10 know. I feel like I can't speak intelligently to something on  
11 which I have so little information.

12 Q. That's fine, Doctor. We'll hear from other witnesses  
13 as to why that gap occurred. But given the number of  
14 recommendations that were made upon his departure from Ste.  
15 Anne's, does it surprise you that those weren't picked up right  
16 away and that a continuity of care developed? Or would that  
17 have been your preferred outcome that that continuity of care  
18 developed certainly within the coming weeks?

19 A. Our ideal process which we usually see is that an  
20 external team refer to us, we refer back to them, and it's a  
21 fairly seamless process.

22 Q. All right. So who at Ste. Anne's ... or how does that

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 work then? Like who coordinates with the outside care team to  
2 ensure that that takes place or is that left to the outside care  
3 team to pick it up from where Ste. Anne's has left off?

4 **A.** Usually, it's done kind of in a collaborative manner,  
5 so different people communicate at different times. For  
6 instance, we all participated in that phone call to inform the  
7 external team of what our conclusions were. So that was part of  
8 that effort to make sure that, you know, our work was then taken  
9 up and continued down the road.

10 **Q.** Okay. So is there, to your knowledge ... and I  
11 recognize that you're not there at Ste. Anne's any longer, but  
12 is there somebody there who follows up on that to ensure that  
13 somebody has an appointment or somebody has, you know, a case  
14 worker who's doing certain things?

15 **A.** Well, usually we know they have a team and a case  
16 worker, so there is that understanding that they'll be kind of  
17 taken up afterwards. So I'm not sure. That's not my piece.  
18 Again, I really don't want to speculate and give you information  
19 that's false. I really don't have a lot of information on that.

20 **Q.** That's fine, Dr. Gagnon. I'll ask other witnesses. I  
21 asked you because your title is care coordinator and so I don't  
22 know the limits of that title and whether the care coordination

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 ends at a certain time ... well, ends at discharge, or whether  
2 there's any continuation or follow-up after somebody has been  
3 discharged.

4 **A.** So passing the information to the external care team  
5 would be part of making sure that that treatment then gets  
6 picked up but certainly I don't keep treating clients after I've  
7 discharged them from my care.

8 **Q.** And there's no systemic follow-up or review to see how  
9 that's gone out. I guess in terms of even informing the  
10 treatment within Ste. Anne's to say, Well, okay, these people  
11 have gone off to care in this way and our recommendations have  
12 been followed and it's gone well. Well, that means we made good  
13 recommendations, and in this case, it's gone in a different  
14 direction. Like to reinforce or reinform the decisions that  
15 have been made within the facility, is there any follow-up for  
16 that? Just educational purpose?

17 **A.** When we provide care, the benefit is ... the lens is,  
18 that it will provide a benefit for the member. I'm sure that  
19 this has come up with your discussion with different mental  
20 health and health providers, but there are stringent rules about  
21 what kind of information you then are allowed to have about  
22 members once they've transitioned out of your care. And so I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 think that there is that real preoccupation with making sure  
2 that I don't have eyes onto private health information which  
3 will not allow me to ... which I have no purpose in seeing.

4 **Q.** All right. That's fine, Doctor.

5 Okay, I'd like to switch topics and talk a little bit about  
6 the family unit and the family situation for Cpl. Desmond. It  
7 certainly may have seemed apparent to you at the time, of  
8 course, that there were difficulties, or that there might be  
9 difficulties, on him returning to the home. It seemed to be of  
10 some benefit to the team to hear from Ms. Desmond, from Cpl.  
11 Desmond's spouse, to gain some insight. Is there any thought,  
12 or do you have any thoughts, of incorporating the family further  
13 into treatment, into residential treatment? Whether it's even  
14 having them on-site for a few days, observing the facility in  
15 more depth? Do you see any benefits to doing something like  
16 that?

17 **A.** I mean I like to base my opinions on science, so I'd  
18 have to review more literature to see if there might be a  
19 benefit to that. You know, giving some psychoeducation to  
20 family members does tend to seem useful but, you know, if you  
21 ask me if, could this possibly be helpful, I think the answer to  
22 that is always going to be, It's possible.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **Q.**    Of course, yes.

2           **A.**    But I think that there's sometimes this idea that  
3 adding on things will be helpful and that's actually not always  
4 the case. So we want to be careful that if we do add things on,  
5 we've got solid reasons to believe that this would actually  
6 provide a real benefit. I couldn't cite any literature to you  
7 right now supporting that. I'd have to do my homework, I guess.

8           **Q.**    No, that's fine, Doctor. It just struck me that the  
9 conversations that were had with Ms. Desmond seemed to help  
10 provide some insights or some further insights. And then  
11 preparing the family for ... you know, knowing that the soldier  
12 is moving back home, having some way of preparing the family and  
13 maybe educating them as to what their spouse has just gone  
14 through in terms of treatment might have some benefit.

15          **A.**    I can definitely understand where you're coming from  
16 in asking me this question. Again, I would encourage you to  
17 have the lens of, when people confide things in me in therapy, I  
18 am always then very prudent about what happens to this  
19 information.

20          So as much as you're saying there could be benefits to  
21 this, sure, that's possible. There could also be negative  
22 outcomes to this where people would feel inhibited in what they



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 could tell us, knowing that they would be almost in a summary  
2 report provided to their family. So if you're asking me, Could  
3 there be benefits to this, my answer is always going to be yes.  
4 Is there something that should systematically be in place? I'm  
5 not sure.

6       **Q.** No, it's interesting, you know. Thank you, Doctor.  
7 Just in terms of that relationship, do you recall if, in any of  
8 your discussions with Cpl. Desmond, you know, he has some  
9 complaints about his spouse and has some suspicions about her.  
10 Did it ever come up that, you know, in many ways, she was the  
11 perfect spouse for him. A nurse, somebody who was going to be  
12 ... have a good earning potential, someone who stuck with him  
13 for years, somebody that could look after him and was taking  
14 care of him. Was that a ... did anybody try to sort of turn the  
15 table on him and try to persuade him otherwise that, in fact, he  
16 was quite fortunate to have a spouse as he did?

17       **A.** So when I have interventions, I try to encourage  
18 people to have balanced views of other people. I think it  
19 would've been inappropriate of me to suggest that she was the  
20 perfect spouse for him. I didn't know her. Maybe on paper they  
21 sounded good, but maybe they had fundamental values differences  
22 or personality differences that wouldn't have made them a good

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 match. So I don't encourage people to make certain life  
2 choices. I think that would be overstepping my boundaries as a  
3 clinician. I try to encourage people to see risks and benefits,  
4 to take a balanced view, to look at what might be a realistic  
5 perception, and those kind of considerations, but I would not  
6 find myself suggesting that somebody is a perfect spouse for  
7 somebody else, especially not having met them.

8 **(16:30)**

9 Q. Well, a perfect spouse might be ...

10 A. I understand what you were saying, right ...

11 Q. ... might be a term that ...

12 A. ... that there was ...

13 Q. ... doesn't really exist in reality. But anyway, at  
14 least you understood the question.

15 Doctor, in terms of the exit strategy such as it was, you  
16 know, are there discussions at Ste. Anne's or do you recall  
17 discussions not even particularly in Cpl. Desmond's case but of  
18 well, if we're sending somebody back home or if we're letting  
19 ... you know, if somebody is leaving, you know maybe they're not  
20 ready to leave or maybe we need to tell somebody well, this  
21 person should be held against their will involuntarily and under  
22 involuntary care. Is that something that came up in your

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 experience at all or is there ways to deal with those kinds of  
2 situations that you're aware of?

3 **A.** You mean involuntary care because somebody ...

4 **Q.** Well, if they were considered too dangerous to be left  
5 out on their own. I'm not suggesting that would have been the  
6 case in Cpl. Desmond's case, but when you're transferring people  
7 over to a provincial system, are there protocols in place or  
8 discussions that take place in that respect of well, should we  
9 let this person go or what options do we have?

10 **A.** So if in the course of treatment at any point anybody  
11 determines ... anybody gives us a strong reason to believe that  
12 there is imminent risk to themselves or others then we're acting  
13 at that moment.

14 So I don't think it's ever occurred that right at the end  
15 of treatment ... I mean, I guess technically right at the end of  
16 treatment there could be this major psychosocial stressor and  
17 the person becomes highly suicidal and then right ... the  
18 discussion could be had about an involuntary hold. But  
19 otherwise our role is to make the recommendation to try to make  
20 sure that they are supported in their return to their community  
21 wherever that is.

22 But, sorry, I think I'm misunderstanding the question. I

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 feel like you're suggesting that there's a place people could be  
2 put if we're worried about them.

3 Q. Well, not in Ste. Anne's. I guess I'm just thinking  
4 of, you know, if somebody is having an episode they may just  
5 decide to leave Ste. Anne's, you know.

6 So I guess I'm thinking about what criteria might you be  
7 using and it may be a difficult thing to answer in a broad  
8 context, but is it ...

9 A. Imminent harm to self or the other is the only reason  
10 that we're going to limit somebody's right to their own choices.  
11 Unless somebody gives me a really ... if somebody got up in the  
12 middle of group therapy and said, You know what, this place  
13 isn't for me, I don't think I'm getting benefits from it I would  
14 of course try to have a discussion with that person to see what  
15 kind of state they're in.

16 But unless I'm getting really reasons to believe that  
17 somebody, including themselves, is in danger, I respect people's  
18 free will to do ... to make their own treatment decisions,  
19 that's a fundamental right that people have. And so I would not  
20 try to ... I mean, I again would try to give, you know, risks  
21 and benefits and potential consequences, but I would not try to  
22 tell them what they should do with their lives.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **Q.** In this case I know you've given evidence on the  
2 discussions that were held with Cpl. Desmond's care team, his  
3 outside care team, but if ... is it ever the case or in your  
4 experience, that, you know, you had a bad feeling about the  
5 outside care team or you didn't feel confident that that care  
6 team was in place and ready to act? And, you know, if that  
7 circumstance has arisen what have you done? Has it been try to  
8 persuade or you just still let the person go if they want to?

9           **A.** So maybe if I could give you a hypothetical, would  
10 that be helpful maybe?

11          **Q.** Sure.

12          **A.** Okay. So, I don't know, we have somebody in care.  
13 They're returning home, they've just gotten married to somebody  
14 they barely know and there's a lot of conflict in the  
15 relationship and me, I'm thinking to myself, Oh boy, you know,  
16 this relationship doesn't look very healthy. If ... you know,  
17 if that person returns into their relationship maybe things  
18 won't go so well and hopefully they'll be well supported when  
19 that happens.

20           You know, people's lives may take difficult turns. There  
21 is no action that I'm going to take based on some speculation  
22 that things might not go well for somebody. I'm not even sure

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 what my options would be.

2 Again, really my biggest asset is to be able to say these  
3 are the things that I think this person would really be  
4 benefiting from to support their return, but this kind of  
5 speculation about things that might happen in the future and,  
6 therefore, we should do something now, that's a bit of a  
7 slippery slope.

8 Q. Sure. No, I understand that, Doctor. Thank you.  
9 Just in terms and just a few more questions, Doctor.

10 You identified that Cpl. Desmond was having some trust  
11 issues with his care team and you've explained, you know, how  
12 that may have manifested itself or how it may have arisen. But  
13 do you ever make a connection between that and his cultural  
14 background, racial background? You know, here he is, an African  
15 Nova Scotian soldier in Quebec with, you know, treatment  
16 providers that he doesn't know and are of a different cultural  
17 background.

18 Was that ever discussed or any thoughts on how to address  
19 that, you know, perhaps through connecting him with another  
20 veteran that may have been able to talk to him about the  
21 treatment and work with him that way? Was that topic raised?

22 A. So I think that there's potentially multiple parts to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 that question. I think the first part of that question was when  
2 you said, you know, do you think that his skin colour might have  
3 had something to do with the distrust he was experiencing with  
4 his care team now. Was that right? Did I understand that?

5 Q. Yeah, that's part of the question, yeah. And I don't  
6 mean to imply it but it's certainly a factor I think we need to  
7 explore.

8 A. I don't think there's anything inappropriate about  
9 exploring that factor either.

10 Q. Yeah.

11 A. So I think that, you know, having him had ... excuse  
12 me, I'm having trouble with my words, it's a bit late in the  
13 day. Him having mentioned to me that in childhood that was one  
14 of the reasons that he felt, you know, put aside or apart from  
15 others. I think it's not unreasonable to imagine that, you  
16 know, skin colour would be something that would be on his mind.  
17 I think that as clinician it's important for us to always think  
18 about reasons why people might feel like they are on the  
19 outside, they are being not included into a group.

20 And I think while there is some benefit I think to having  
21 people join communities where they can feel like they can talk  
22 to people who have had similar experiences, whether it be

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 discrimination for skin colour or any other reason, I think  
2 there's also some benefit in me as a clinician trying my best to  
3 understand where people are coming from and, again, the length  
4 of treatment is limited when it's a bound treatment. But  
5 certainly if I have a client that I feel has some specific  
6 concerns whether it be about gender or skin colour, disability,  
7 any of those kind of concerns, it's worth addressing  
8 transparently and having a real open discussion about those  
9 kinds of rejections. I think that's a conversation we're having  
10 more and more and I think that's a great thing.

11 **Q.** Doctor, Cpl. Desmond had identified to ... The meeting  
12 where you and Ms. Hamilton were going to call ... were trying to  
13 call Ms. Desmond, I understand you left the meeting, but  
14 afterwards, I don't know if you saw the note it's on page 263 if  
15 you need to go to it, but Cpl. Desmond had identified that he  
16 had had negative reactions to some malaria pills that he took  
17 while in Afghanistan. And I wonder if he identified that to you  
18 in terms of reluctance to take medication that was provided to  
19 him by the military.

20 And, you know, I know you're not military, but from his  
21 perspective he may not have made that distinction.

22 **A.** Perhaps. He never mentioned that to me, no.



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **Q.**    Okay. Thank you. And would there be an option if ...  
2 and I take what you said earlier about the idolization then ...

3           **A.**    Devaluation.

4           **(16:40)**

5           **Q.**    ... devaluation and so maybe once he got to a point  
6 where he was mistrusting the staff, rightly or wrongly, you  
7 know, we don't want to judge that part, but would there be  
8 another facility you might consider transferring him to a  
9 different place, another residential facility?

10          **A.**    So I think that what you're suggesting is once trust  
11 is broken it might be a better option to send somebody off  
12 somewhere else?

13          **Q.**    Well, given his particular diagnosis. I mean, maybe  
14 not across the board because that might be unworkable. But in  
15 his particular case was that a consideration of sending him to a  
16 different location?

17          **A.**    Again, you know, I tentatively mentioned that there  
18 might be some borderline personality disorders, but indeed if we  
19 are dealing with borderline personality traits I would suggest  
20 the exact opposite, because this pattern of that light switch I  
21 can trust you, I can't trust you and there is no middle ground,  
22 we want to break that cycle to say you can repair when there's

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1 distrust. You can repair when there's disappointment. People  
2 are fallible. People make mistakes. People hurt your feelings,  
3 intentionally, unintentionally, you do too. And we can have  
4 this imperfect relationship where we have conflict and we work  
5 to resolve conflict and we go forward from there.

6 So I would say distrust is ... I mean, if a client were to  
7 say to me there's nothing you can do, I won't ever trust you and  
8 I don't want to be in treatment with me I respect that of  
9 course. But if there's any opportunity to repair any kind of  
10 therapeutic breach, I'm all for that and I would work very  
11 strongly. I think that's a strong, very worthy therapeutic  
12 experience that helps people progress from these positions of  
13 all or nothing.

14 **Q.** So in other words, yeah, you would break the pattern  
15 rather than exacerbating it by or by feeding into it by sending  
16 him somewhere else or by recommending somewhere else?

17 **A.** Yeah.

18 **Q.** Interesting. Well, Dr. Gagnon, thank you very much.

19 Just I want to say, I mean, I've gained some good insight  
20 from your testimony today so I appreciate it. You must have  
21 wished you had more time with Cpl. Desmond given what you've  
22 identified from his conditions and your observations.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Mr. Rodgers**

1           **A.**    I would have hoped that we would have had more times  
2 for more gains, but ... And certainly knowing how things turned  
3 out I think that we can't all help but wonder what else might  
4 have happened. But I'm happy to think that I was able to  
5 provide some information that was useful to you. Thank you.

6           **Q.**    Well, I do thank you and those are all my questions.  
7 Thank you, Doctor.

8           **A.**    Thank you, Mr. Rodgers.

9           **THE COURT:**     Potentially two more. Mr. MacKenzie?

10          **MR. MACKENZIE:** No questions, Your Honour.

11          **THE COURT:**     Thank you. Ms. MacGregor?

12          **MS. MACGREGOR:** No questions, Your Honour.

13          **THE COURT:**     All right. So, Dr. Gagnon, all the counsel  
14 have asked all the questions ... oh, I'm sorry. I was going to  
15 ... Ms. Ward but I see that it's not Ms. Ward so ...

16          **MS. GRANT:**        I'm sorry. I'm sorry, Dr. Gagnon ...

17          **THE COURT:**     Ms. Grant, I'm sorry.

18          **MS. GRANT:**        ... you thought you were done.

19          **THE COURT:**     I'm sorry. I apologize Dr. Gagnon, you're  
20 not quite finished.

21

22

DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant

CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS. GRANT

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

(16:43)

MS. GRANT: Thank you. Dr. Gagnon, can you hear me okay?

**A.** I can hear you well, yes.

**Q.** My name is Melissa Grant and I represent the Government of Canada, so we're representing the various federal entities, including VAC and the Canadian Armed Forces which you're familiar with, and I guess I'll start with that question. You were at Ste. Anne's for about a year or so, correct?

**A.** That's right.

**Q.** And then when you left you went to work for the Canadian Armed Forces. And so I was just wondering as a first question why did you take that job and what do you like about your job?

**A.** So I took a job because it's been my dream job since I started my doctorate. So I was overjoyed when I was offered a position. What do I like about my job? I don't think that you want to take the time to spend with me for me to describe everything I like about my job.

I like a lot of the things that I liked at Ste. Anne's. I like the team approach. I love the clientele. I think it's

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 very rewarding work. Yeah, I really love my job. Yeah.

2 Q. And turning to the kind of ... the healthcare for  
3 veterans and active members of the CAF, we understand that  
4 people who are RCMP members or veterans have access to OSI  
5 clinics in provinces and then a facility like Ste. Anne's. Is  
6 that your understanding as well?

7 A. That's my understanding as well, yes.

8 Q. And then like those ... like Ste. Anne, like the OSI  
9 clinic and like in a setting where you work, there's a  
10 multidisciplinary approach?

11 A. Mm-hmm.

12 Q. Okay. And in, I think, sort of speaking generally  
13 about mental health access and services available to people, in  
14 civilian non-veteran and non-CAF populations, so, you know,  
15 everybody else, I guess, access to mental health services can  
16 be, I guess, hindered by cost in the sense of if a service is  
17 not covered by the province then, you know, if you don't have  
18 insurance then it's your own out-of-pocket expense.

19 A. That's right.

20 Q. And so on that sort of basis, would you agree that  
21 veterans and CAF members generally have more access to  
22 specialized mental healthcare because they don't have to pay out

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 of pocket?

2           **A.** I have a little bit less experience with CAF because,  
3 as you mentioned, I only spent one year at Ste. Anne's and I was  
4 very kind of limited, and I saw one aspect of the care offered  
5 to active military members and veterans. But in my work with  
6 CAF I would definitely say that, you know, for instance one of  
7 the things that I like to mention is when I worked on the  
8 civilian side in different environments, having access to a  
9 psychiatrist is often very difficult or getting in touch with  
10 the family doctor versus ... again, one of the things I do love  
11 about my work is if I feel that I need to have a consultation  
12 with ... or the opinion of a psychiatrist then I can very easily  
13 ask for that referral.

14           If I need to have a discussion with the doctor, they make  
15 themselves so easily available to have those discussions, so I  
16 feel like that really facilitates this team collaborative care  
17 approach which I think is a good asset.

18           **Q.** Thank you. And turning to the issue of suicidal  
19 and/or homicidal ideation, I guess you would ... or would you  
20 agree that it's not uncommon for individuals who have a mental  
21 health diagnosis to sometimes have suicidal ideation?

22           **A.** I would say that that's not at all uncommon, no.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1           **Q.**   And sort of looking at us as a, you know, lay  
2 audience, if you will, if people see sort of suicidal ideation  
3 in a report or even potentially homicidal ideation, that kind of  
4 sparks a kind of reaction in people of like what ... you know,  
5 almost like a sort of like do you press a panic button. And so  
6 I guess, you know, if you're dealing with this on a daily basis,  
7 do you have any, I guess, comment on the ... like that part of  
8 living with a mental health diagnosis? That if someone  
9 expresses that to you.

10           **A.**   I think that that panic button analogy that you're  
11 making is something that I do use in the sense that when I  
12 assess people part of my job now is regularly assessing people  
13 to see what's happening with them, what diagnosis they might  
14 have. And that's something that I say in a pretty standard  
15 manner: I'm not going to panic if you tell me that you have  
16 suicidal thoughts, these happen to a lot of people. Let's talk  
17 about them. Let's see what's happening.

18           And I think that this kind of matter-of-fact approach to  
19 suicidal or homicidal thoughts really allows people to be more  
20 open about them. It normalizes them as something that people  
21 struggle with and that we can try to have an impact on.

22           And again, you know, I tell people we're going to have two

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 very different conversations. If you tell me that these are  
2 things that in the past or presently go through your mind, that  
3 worry you, that you struggle with, that scare you sometimes or  
4 that sometimes you kind of hold close to you as kind of if  
5 nothing else works at least I have this amount of control,  
6 that's fine, you know, we'll have people help you manage these  
7 and that's okay.

8 And then we're going to have a very different conversation  
9 if you tell me, you know, I'm not sure if I'm going to be able  
10 to keep myself safe until tomorrow morning, right. Those are  
11 the circumstances where I have the obligation to break  
12 confidentiality.

13 **Q.** Right. Thank you. And we learned a lot today about  
14 some of the terms and you explained those terms really well. I  
15 just want to return to some of those. One of them was dependent  
16 personality traits and looking at the file with respect to  
17 Lionel Desmond it seems, and whether you would agree with this  
18 suggestion, that he was maybe a bit immature in his view towards  
19 relationships or almost superficial. Would you agree with that?

20 **(16:50)**

21 **A.** I'm not sure I would use the words kind of immature,  
22 superficial, but I think that it was maybe underdeveloped.



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 There was this kind of idea of what his family life would be.  
2 And it was difficult to get details if he had thought about, you  
3 know, what are you going to do for this to go well, what might  
4 go wrong and then how could you respond to that, and to really  
5 flesh out this understanding of some of the challenge, right.  
6 Again, moving away from this perception that things are all or  
7 nothing. Either we're doing well, you're committed to me, you  
8 love me and then we're okay, or there's a break in this  
9 relationship and it was wrong or bad all along.

10 Q. All right. I just move home and everything will be  
11 fine, that kind of thinking?

12 A. I think that was certainly his hope.

13 Q. One of the notes talked about Lionel Desmond sort of  
14 laughing and being jovial at meetings, group meetings, and  
15 that's something we've heard from his family members. And  
16 people who knew him, say before he went to Afghanistan, would  
17 describe him as happy-go-lucky. Would describe him as like  
18 Tigger and he would even say now I'm an Eeyore, as that ... you  
19 know, that metaphorical picturesque language that you said he  
20 employed a lot.

21 I'm just wondering if you could comment on that particular  
22 affect of being jovial, kind of maybe the class clown as

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 potentially whether or not that affect actually is reflective of  
2 your inner feelings?

3 I guess I'm thinking of someone like Robin Williams who was  
4 a comedian but, you know, underneath all that there was some  
5 struggle. So can you give us a sense of that?

6 **A.** I can't necessarily speak to him, you know, before I  
7 saw him but, you know, when he was at St. Anne's with us, I  
8 tended to see that a little bit in the framework of his  
9 avoidance, you know.

10 When he would be in session and he would be all animated  
11 and talking about very superficial or very cheerful things, you  
12 know, I often felt that it was his way of saying let's talk  
13 about the good stuff, let's talk about the things that are going  
14 well, which I completely understand he wanted to do, but a  
15 little bit maybe as a way to avoid some of the difficulties, you  
16 know, and wanting to connect.

17 I think that when he made jokes and, you know, when he was  
18 laughing and making comments to people in the group, he was  
19 looking for that connection, but I think that sometimes it was a  
20 bit of a way to cope.

21 **Q.** Thank you. Switching to the topic of the  
22 neuropsychological evaluation that was a recommendation of

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 yours. Just, I guess, a question about the logistics of these  
2 things and wondering if that had not been conducted by, say, the  
3 end of December 2016 would that have been unusual in your line  
4 of work?

5 **A.** Not necessarily. Unfortunately, depending on where  
6 you are, and even in the NCR, having access to a  
7 neuropsychologist can be a bit of a lengthy process; they do  
8 often tend to have long wait lists. Assessments are long to  
9 complete. So I believe at that point he was in rural Nova  
10 Scotia?

11 **Q.** Yes.

12 **A.** Yeah. So, you know, we've had ... sometimes it takes  
13 several months to find an appointment with the appropriate  
14 professional. So while I agree that that's not optimal ... I  
15 mean, in an ideal world I would have plenty of  
16 neuropsychologists at my fingertips when I need them, that would  
17 not necessarily be unusual unfortunately.

18 **Q.** Okay. And we've talked a little bit today about this  
19 treatment for Lionel Desmond is looking more long term.

20 **A.** Mm-hmm.

21 **Q.** And so would you expect that he would be maybe working  
22 with someone whether it's in the community or OSI, whatever the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 circumstance, to have long-term and intense psychotherapy?

2       **A.** I'm not sure what you qualify as intense  
3 psychotherapy.

4       **Q.** Well, a lot of the work that you couldn't get into at  
5 Ste. Anne, the trauma-focussed kind of therapy.

6       **A.** I would agree with the long-term part. I think I  
7 would agree that this would be an ongoing process ideally with  
8 somebody that could see him on a long term. And, as I was  
9 discussing with Mr. Rodgers, to have that back and forth when  
10 there are, you know, breaks in the relationship that we can  
11 repair and work on having kind of that nuanced view of other  
12 people.

13       **Q.** And this next question may be not one that I guess  
14 makes sense but I'll ask it anyway. You can fix it for me.

15       So the neuropsychological evaluation I would, I guess, ask  
16 that that recommendation is not indicative of a view you had  
17 that Lionel Desmond needed inpatient treatment following his  
18 discharge from Ste. Anne?

19       **A.** So are you suggesting that if I made the  
20 recommendation is the expectation that he would be in an in-  
21 treatment care?

22       **Q.** Correct.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1           **A.**    That's what you're asking?

2           **Q.**    Yes.

3           **A.**    No, that would that not.  If I had believed that what  
4 he absolutely needed was inpatient treatment care then I would  
5 have made that recommendation.

6           **Q.**    Thank you.  And on the ... we talked a little bit  
7 about the usual course where you explained you usually get a  
8 referral from a treating team and then in the normal course the  
9 person would go back to that treating team.  And so we know ...

10          **A.**    That's correct.

11          **Q.**    Thank you.  And so we know in this case that this was  
12 a bit of an unusual situation and you'd agree with that?

13          **A.**    So I ... again, I ... this was a while ago and I don't  
14 want to get things wrong.  I believe what happened is he moved  
15 while he was at Ste. Anne's, is that correct, or right after?

16          **Q.**    It is.  I'll have to paraphrase the testimony from the  
17 New Brunswick OSI team, but they saw the sort of a state of  
18 flux.  So often he would be moving kind of back and forth  
19 between New Brunswick and Nova Scotia and it wasn't always clear  
20 to them sort of if he was staying or going back or that sort of  
21 thing.

22                During your time at Ste. Anne, had that ever happened with

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 another patient where they did not return to their ...

2 **A.** Not that I remember.

3 **Q.** Okay.

4 **A.** No. That would have been atypical.

5 **Q.** That would have been atypical.

6 **A.** (Nods "yes".)

7 **Q.** And if ... it's our understanding that there's a group  
8 of people, the team, that meets to determine whether someone is  
9 appropriate for an admission into Ste. Anne, is that right?

10 **A.** That's right.

11 **Q.** And if that had been something that had been brought  
12 to the team's attention that, in fact, Lionel Desmond would not  
13 be returning to the New Brunswick OSI team, is that something  
14 you would have taken into account?

15 **A.** I don't remember if that was mentioned. I don't think  
16 it was. Certainly, we would like to make sure that this person  
17 returns to a care team that's been established, right, because  
18 that is a lot of change for somebody to deal with in a short  
19 time. One external care team, then residential treatment and  
20 completely different care team, I don't see a lot of continuity  
21 there.

22 So I think that I would like to think sitting here today

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 with hindsight, that had we known that maybe we would have maybe  
2 waited for a little bit more period of stability so that there  
3 wouldn't be so many changes in a short time but, again,  
4 hindsight, that's just me sitting here today.

5       **Q.** Right. Thinking about maybe what I guess I would call  
6 sort of the misconceptions about mental health and what ... do  
7 you have any comment on the idea that ... I guess I would call  
8 it maybe stereotype is more accurate that people with a mental  
9 health diagnosis such as PTSD are more prone to violence against  
10 others?

11       **A.** I mean, I think that's a stereotype that's in popular  
12 culture a lot. I think that one thing that also tends to be a  
13 ... let's say a ... I think battleground is too strong a word,  
14 but something that I advocate strongly to anybody who will lend  
15 me an ear anywhere, is that there's this very negative  
16 perception of anger, like it's a bad emotion and we shouldn't  
17 feel it, and I think that that's not the case.

18       You know, evolution has helped us to maintain anger because  
19 it's got a purpose and a lot of our role is often to help people  
20 use their anger in a productive way to ... You know, as I  
21 explained during my testimony, I don't think it was at all  
22 inappropriate for Mr. Desmond to be frustrated by some of the

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 things that happened to him, that's part of life and community.  
2 And you really get gains when you manage to sit down with people  
3 and explain why you're feeling these type of feelings; what can  
4 we do as a compromise.

5 And so I think that, you know, when people have ... when  
6 people display anger I think that it does tend to make us feel a  
7 little bit more uncomfortable. I think that that's often  
8 misunderstood as something that's very destructive and it can be  
9 obviously.

10 The current proceedings we know that anger can lead to very  
11 destructive things or can be involved in the process of very  
12 destructive things. But I think that that's ... I would say  
13 that that's probably part of that kind of general misconception  
14 that having anger and the anger involved in PTSD kind of leads  
15 to people being violent towards other people when, in fact, I've  
16 treated plenty of people with PTSD by now and that's not the  
17 rule.

18 **Q.** And on that topic, it has been suggested that people  
19 with mental health diagnosis should not have access to firearms  
20 and I'm wondering if you could comment on that.

21 **A.** Wouldn't that constitute discrimination?

22 **Q.** I would say yes to that question but I'm just asking



**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 for your sort of your view as someone who deals with this.

2 **A.** I don't make those kind of determinations, right. I'm  
3 not the one who's going to be assigning the right to have a  
4 permit. I think that there are very specific reasons why people  
5 would be denied a permit for a weapon, but to say that anybody  
6 who's got a diagnosis of mental health.

7 **(17:00)**

8 And I mean, is it current? Is it past? Anybody who's ever  
9 had mental health issues can't ever have a weapon ever again?  
10 That's going to be almost everybody in our current situation.  
11 Post-pandemic that's probably going to be everybody. So that  
12 would start to be problematic.

13 So, again, I'm not making those decisions but if I look at  
14 it from a point of view is should we decide in an absolute way  
15 what a person can or can't do based on mental health I would  
16 very strongly be opposed to that.

17 **Q.** Okay. And in the setting where you currently work as  
18 treating CAF members, would you kind of carry that analysis over  
19 to CAF members who have a mental health diagnosis, but might  
20 have a hunting weapon at home?

21 **A.** Yeah. And I treat plenty of active military members  
22 who have weapons at home and go on ... both on the civilian side

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Cross-Examination by Ms. Grant**

1 shooting ranges and on the military side shooting ranges, and  
2 unless I have very specific concerns, that's not something that  
3 worries me.

4 **Q.** And in your current job at the CAF, just because you  
5 do work at the CAF I have to ask the question of whether, in  
6 your experience, CAF members are able to access their health  
7 records if they need to?

8 **A.** Yeah. So things have changed a little bit in pandemic  
9 time, but usually there's ... in the (inaudible) site there's a  
10 little window which is med records. You come in, you say what  
11 you would like to have, the (inaudible) signs off on the  
12 documentation and it's in your hand. So usually it's a fairly  
13 simple process.

14 And actually, I was going to say things have changed during  
15 pandemic but I think it's been simplified because now you just  
16 send an email to med records and you have the records.

17 **Q.** Thank you. Thank you, Dr. Gagnon, those are all of my  
18 questions. Thank you for your time and your patience.

19 **A.** Thank you very much.

20 **THE COURT:** Well, before I move towards concluding  
21 again, Mr. Russell, do you have any further questions?

22 **MR. RUSSELL:** We thought about it, Your Honour, but no.

DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court

EXAMINATION BY THE COURT

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

**THE COURT:** Well, this is your ... perhaps your one and only opportunity to ask Dr. Gagnon a couple of questions.

So I just have a couple of questions, Doctor, and I'll be brief. I know that Ms. Grant had asked you a question in relation to firearms licenses, and I know that at the end of the day the decision to grant a firearms license are not generally falls ... it's the responsibility of the chief firearms officer in any given province to do that.

When the chief firearms officer has, and there's an application that has to be completed and there's a requirement to disclose whether or not a person has had any mental health treatments within a set period of time and generally it's five years I believe. And at the time the individual discloses that to the chief firearms officer, you'd understand that they then have an obligation to conduct a review, and to obtain as much information as they may require to satisfy themselves that the individual is an appropriate person to possess firearms given the public and safety concerns that are imposed on the ...

**A.** Sure.

**Q.** ... chief firearms officer by virtue of regulations

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court**

1 and by the legislation.

2 So my question is, at that point in time all of the health  
3 records, the mental health records, that you have in relation to  
4 a particular person who may be applying for a license, would you  
5 see any real objection to having that information made available  
6 to the chief firearms officer so that it would assist them in  
7 making the determination that they have to make in regards to  
8 suitability? They have different parameters than you might  
9 have.

10 And would you also be open to have a discussion with a  
11 chief firearms officer with regard to what might be in those  
12 records as part of that licensing process? Or any comment you  
13 might have in that regard.

14 **A.** I would strenuously object to somebody having access to  
15 all the records. You know, I treat people who have trauma, who  
16 describe to me horrible things that have happened to them that  
17 sometimes they have never disclosed to anybody but me. And I  
18 think that the idea that somebody would have eyes on to this  
19 information, which, you know, I don't know, sexual abuse,  
20 childhood sexual abuse, completely non-pertinent to whether they  
21 should have a firearm I think that would make me ethically very  
22 uncomfortable.

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court**

1           **Q.**    Thank you.

2           **A.**    I think that ... and perhaps you can guide me, Your  
3 Honour, if that's what you were ... you're getting at. I think  
4 the legitimate concern that if somebody has a mental health  
5 disorder that includes very significant suicidal ideation or  
6 homicidal ideation and then putting an extra barrier so that  
7 somebody doesn't impulsively hurt themselves or others, I think  
8 that that's appropriate to try to keep people safe.

9           I'm not sure. I think with my client's consent I would be  
10 happy to confirm or deny if that person has those kind of risk  
11 factors. I think that that would be providing just the right  
12 kind of information to make an informed decision without  
13 violating the client's right to privacy so ...

14          **Q.**    That's why I asked the question, Dr. Gagnon, because  
15 of your background and your experience and knowing the types of  
16 information that you have and how that could impact on any given  
17 individual. I don't promote one or the other but I just ... I  
18 need to ask the question to see what your opinion is.

19          **A.**    Absolutely.

20          **Q.**    So I appreciate that, thank you. And I have one last  
21 question for you.

22          The terms of reference for this particular Inquiry were set

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court**

1 by the Minister of Justice back in February of 2018, and one of  
2 the terms of reference ... I'm just going to read what it says  
3 here to you. And it says: "Whether Lionel Desmond and his  
4 family had access to appropriate Domestic Violence Intervention  
5 services."

6 I know that there was some discussion about some events and  
7 whether those events ... so I'm going to ask it my own way I  
8 guess, whether any of those events would signal that there was a  
9 potential for domestic violence. That was generally how the  
10 questioning went and I asked you a particular question.

11 So at this time my question would be this: During the  
12 period of time that you were dealing directly with Cpl. Desmond  
13 and had access to the information that was available at the  
14 clinic, did you see anything that at that time - I appreciate  
15 there's two perspectives, there's the perspective from then and  
16 the perspective from now, but just dealing first with the ...

17 **A.** Sure.

18 **Q.** ... perspective at that time, whether you saw anything  
19 that would suggest to you that there was a need for a domestic  
20 violence intervention services?

21 **A.** I think that, you know, Your Honour, you've hit the  
22 nail on the head. It would feel completely ridiculous of me to

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court**

1 say no today knowing how things evolved and ended but I also  
2 have to be fair and I extensively reviewed my notes in  
3 preparation for today and the only thing that he described to me  
4 in terms of his conflicts with his family was yelling and  
5 shouting and kind of this general kind of outward displays of  
6 anger. Would I feel comfortable labelling that as domestic  
7 abuse? Would that mean that any time that you shout at your  
8 spouse you're engaging in domestic abuse?

9 I mean, is that optimal? Of course not. Is that a healthy  
10 expression in a relationship? Of course not.

11 Knowing what I know now do I think that could there have  
12 been some benefit in pro-actively seeing if there was some  
13 resolution to do with this domestic conflict? Yes, of course.  
14 But with only the information available to me back then, I'm not  
15 sure if I would see it in a different light without this new  
16 information.

17 Q. All right.

18 A. I'm sorry, you promised to be brief and I'm being very  
19 all over the place. I hope that answers the question.

20 Q. For me it does. I understand.

21 A. Okay.

22 **THE COURT:** All right. Dr. Gagnon, and just ... so we

**DR. ISABELLE GAGNON, Examination by the Court**

1 are finished here and I want to thank you for your time. I know  
2 that you spent some considerable time preparing for today.  
3 You've clearly, you know, gone back over your notes and put some  
4 time and some effort into looking at Cpl. Desmond's  
5 circumstances as they relate to the events that occurred and  
6 during the period of time that he was with you in Ste. Anne's.

7 We certainly appreciate your time. It's very valuable to  
8 us. It's very important for us to have as much kind of first-  
9 hand information and circumstances that are available to us. We  
10 have documents, but it's always more valuable to actually have  
11 an opportunity to speak to the people that were engaged with him  
12 at Ste. Anne's. And so thank you very much for your time and we  
13 appreciate it. Stay well and ...

14 **A.** Thank you. And thank you very much for allowing me to  
15 participate in this process which I really think is an important  
16 one.

17 **THE COURT:** All right. Thank you, Dr. Gagnon.

18 **WITNESS WITHDREW (17:11 HRS.)**

19 **THE COURT:** All right, so we'll close for the afternoon  
20 then, Counsel. Thank you.

21

22 **COURT CLOSED (17:12 HRS.)**



**CERTIFICATE OF COURT TRANSCRIBER**

I, Margaret Livingstone, Court Transcriber, hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of the evidence given in this matter, **re Desmond Fatality Inquiry**, taken by way of electronic digital recording.



Margaret Livingstone

(Registration No. 2006-16)

Verbatim Inc.

**DARTMOUTH, NOVA SCOTIA**

**March 22, 2021**